

CURRENT ISSUES IN PRIESTLY
AND RELATED LITERATURE

SBL Press

SBL

Society of Biblical Literature



Resources for Biblical Study

Marvin A. Sweeney, Old Testament/Hebrew Bible Editor

SBL Press

Number 82

CURRENT ISSUES IN PRIESTLY
AND RELATED LITERATURE

THE LEGACY OF JACOB MILGROM AND BEYOND

Edited by

Roy E. Gane and Ada Taggar-Cohen

SBL Press

SBL Press
Atlanta

Copyright © 2015 by SBL Press

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, SBL Press, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Current issues in priestly and related literature : the legacy of Jacob Milgrom and beyond / edited by Roy E. Gane and Ada Taggar-Cohen.

p. cm. — (Resources for biblical study ; Number 82)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-62837-121-5 (pbk. : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-1-62837-122-2 (ebook) —

ISBN 978-1-62837-123-9 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Bible. Leviticus—Criticism, interpretation, etc. 2. Priests. 3. Priests, Jewish. 4. Milgrom, Jacob, 1923–2010. I. Gane, Roy, 1955– editor.

BS1255.6.P7C87 2015

222'.1306—dc23

2015024122

Printed on acid-free paper.



CONTENTS

Abbreviations	ix
Introduction	
Roy E. Gane and Ada Taggar-Cohen	xiii
Bibliography of the Published Writings of Jacob Milgrom 1994–2014	xvii
Part 1: Interpretation of Priestly and Holiness Texts	
Tabernacle or Tent of Meeting? The Dual Nature of the Sacred Tent in the Priestly Texts Michael B. Hundley.....	3
What Is a Zoeme? The Priestly Inventory of Sacrificial Animals Naphtali S. Meshel.....	19
Women and the Purification Offering: What Jacob Milgrom Contributed to the Intersection of Women’s Studies and Biblical Studies Elizabeth W. Goldstein	47
Leviticus 22:24: A Prohibition of Gelding for the Land of Israel? Elaine Adler Goodfriend.....	67
“The Meeting Places of God in the Land”: Another Look at the Towns of the Levites Daniel I. Block	93

Part 2: Composition of Priestly and Holiness Texts

Profane Versus Sacrificial Slaughter: The Priestly Recasting of the Yahwist Flood Story David P. Wright	125
The Holiness School in Genesis? Megan Warner	155
The Composition of Exodus 31:12–17 and 35:1–3 and the Question of Method in Identifying Priestly Strata in the Torah Jeffrey Stackert	175
Didactic Logic and the Authorship of Leviticus Roy E. Gane.....	197

Part 3: Literary Structure of Priestly and Holiness Texts

Structure Is Theology: The Composition of Leviticus Moshe Kline	225
Fundamental Structure as Methodological Control for Evaluating Introverted Literary Structures in Leviticus Deborah L. Ellens.....	265
Leviticus 19 as Mini-Torah David Tabb Stewart.....	299
The End of Korah and Others: Closural Conventions in Priestly Narratives of Numbers Susan Zeelander	325

Part 4: Relationships between Priestly, Holiness, and Deuteronomic Texts

Leviticus 17, Where P, H, and D Meet: Priorities and Presuppositions of Jacob Milgrom and Eckart Otto Esias E. Meyer.....	349
---	-----

A Need for Hope? A Comparison Between the Dynamics in Leviticus 26 and Deuteronomy 28–30 Georg Fischer SJ	369
Part 5: Extrabiblical Texts Relating to Priestly Texts	
“For Instruction Shall Come Forth from Zion”: Biblical and Mesopotamian Temples as Palaces of Justice Victor Avigdor Hurowitz ש"ר	389
Between <i>Herem</i> , Ownership, and Ritual: Biblical and Hittite Perspectives Ada Taggar-Cohen	419
Purity and Persia Thomas Kazen	435
Intermarriage in the Temple Scroll: Strategies of Neutralization Hannah K. Harrington	463
Contributors.....	483
Index of Primary Texts	485
Index of Modern Authors.....	517

SBL Press

ABBREVIATIONS

AB	Anchor Bible
AbB	<i>Altbabylonische Briefe in Umschrift und Übersetzung.</i> Edited by Fritz R. Kraus. Leiden: Brill, 1964–.
ABD	<i>Anchor Bible Dictionary.</i> Edited by D. N. Freeman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
ABRL	Anchor Bible Reference Library
Afo	<i>Archiv für Orientforschung</i>
AIL	Ancient Israel and Its Literature
AnBib	Analecta biblica
AOAT	Alter Orient und Altes Testament
AS	Assyriological Studies
ATANT	Abhandlungen zur Theologie des Alten and Neuen Testaments
BBB	Bonner biblische Beiträge
BBET	Beiträge zur biblischen Exegese und Theologie
BDB	Brown, F., S. R. Driver, and C. A. Briggs. <i>A Hebrew and English Lexicon of the Old Testament.</i> Oxford: Clarendon, 1907.
BBR	<i>Bulletin for Biblical Research</i>
BETL	Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologiarum lovaniensium
BHS	<i>Biblia Hebraica Stuttgartensia.</i> Edited by K. Elliger and W. Rudolph. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1983.
BI	<i>Biblical Illustrator</i>
BibInt	Biblical Interpretation Series
BN	<i>Biblische Notizen</i>
BRev	<i>Bible Review</i>
BZABR	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für altorientalische und biblische Rechtsgeschichte
BZAW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft

CAD	<i>The Assyrian Dictionary of the Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago</i> . 21 vols. Chicago: Oriental Institute, 1956–2011.
CC	Continental Commentaries
CT	<i>Cuneiform Texts from Babylonian Tablets in the British Museum</i>
CTH	<i>Catalogue des Textes Hittites</i> . Emmanuel Laroche. Etudes et Commentaires 75. Paris: Klincksieck, 1971.
DCH	<i>Dictionary of Classical Hebrew</i> . Edited by David J. A. Clines. 9 vols. Sheffield: Sheffield Phoenix, 1993–2014.
DNWSI	<i>Dictionary of the North-West Semitic Inscriptions</i> . Jacob Hoftijzer and Karen Jongeling. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 1995.
EA	El-Amarna Tablets. According to the edition of J. A. Knudtzon. <i>Die el-Amarna-Tafeln</i> . Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1908–1915. Repr., Aalen: Zeller, 1964. Continued in A. F. Rainey, <i>El-Amarna Tablets I</i> , 359–379. 2nd revised ed. Kevelaer: Butzon & Bercker, 1978.
EJL	Early Judaism and Its Literature
<i>EncJud</i>	<i>Encyclopaedia Judaica</i> . 16 vols. Jerusalem: Keter, 1972.
ER	<i>The Encyclopedia of Religion</i> . Edited by M. Eliade. 16 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1987.
<i>EstBib</i>	<i>Estudios bíblicos</i>
FAT	Forschungen zum Alten Testament
FRLANT	Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments
HAR	<i>Hebrew Annual Review</i>
HAT	Handbuch zum Alten Testament
HO	Handbuch der Orientalistik
HS	<i>Hebrew Studies</i>
HSS	Harvard Semitic Studies
HThKAT	Herders Theologischer Kommentar zum Alten Testament
ICC	International Critical Commentary
IEJ	<i>Israel Exploration Journal</i>
<i>Int</i>	<i>Interpretation</i>
JAOS	<i>Journal of the American Oriental Society</i>
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JBQ	<i>Jewish Bible Quarterly</i>
JCS	<i>Journal of Cuneiform Studies</i>
JESHO	<i>Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient</i>

JNES	<i>Journal of Near Eastern Studies</i>
JSem	<i>Journal of Semitics</i>
JSJ	<i>Journal for the Study of Judaism</i>
JSOT	<i>Journal for the Study of the Old Testament</i>
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series
JQR	<i>Jewish Quarterly Review</i>
KBo	<i>Keilschrifttexte aus Boghazköi</i> . Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1916–1923; Berlin: Gebr. Mann, 1954–.
KUB	<i>Keilschrifturkunden aus Boghazköi</i> . Berlin: Akademie, 1921–.
LAI	Library of Ancient Israel
LHB/OTS	Library of Hebrew Bible/Old Testament Studies
LSS	Leipziger semitische Studien
LSTS	Library of Second Temple Studies
NAC	New American Commentary
NCB	New Century Bible
NechtB	Neue Echter Bibel
NICOT	New International Commentary on the Old Testament
NIVAC	NIV Application Commentary
NSKAT	Neuer Stuttgarter Kommentar, Altes Testament
OB	Old Babylonian
OBO	Orbis biblicus et orientalis
OEANE	<i>The Oxford Encyclopedia of Archaeology in the Near East</i> . Edited by E. M. Meyers. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
OLA	Orientalia lovaniensia analecta
OTL	Old Testament Library
PAAJR	<i>Proceedings of the American Academy of Jewish Research</i>
PEQ	<i>Palestine Exploration Quarterly</i>
PRSt	<i>Perspectives in Religious Studies</i>
PRU	<i>Le palais royal d'Ugarit</i>
PTMS	Pittsburgh Theological Monograph Series
RB	<i>Revue biblique</i>
RevQ	<i>Revue de Qumran</i>
RIMA	The Royal Inscriptions of Mesopotamia, Assyrian Periods
SAA	State Archives of Assyria
SBLDS	Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series
SBLMS	Society of Biblical Literature Monograph Series

SBLStBl	Society of Biblical Literature Studies in Biblical Literature
ScrHier	Scripta Hierosolymitana
SemeiaSt	Semeia Studies
StBoT	Studien zu den Boğazköy-Texten
STDJ	Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah
StudBib	Studia Biblica
TAPS	<i>Transactions of the American Philosophical Society</i>
TCL	<i>Textes cunéiformes, Musées du Louvre</i> . Paris: Guethner 1910.
TCS	Texts from Cuneiform Studies
TDOT	<i>Theological Dictionary of the Old Testament</i> . Edited by G. J. Botterweck and H. Ringgren, Translated by J. T. Willis, G. W. Bromiley, and D. E. Green. 15 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1974–2006.
TRu	<i>Theologische Rundschau</i>
TZ	<i>Theologische Zeitschrift</i>
UT	<i>Ugaritic Textbook</i> . C. H. Gordon. AnOr 38. Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1965.
VE	<i>Vox evangelica</i>
VT	<i>Vetus Testamentum</i>
VTSup	Supplements to Vetus Testamentum
WAW	Writings from the Ancient World
WAWSup	Writings from the Ancient World Supplement
WBC	Word Biblical Commentary
WMANT	Wissenschaftliche Monographien zum Alten und Neuen Testament
YOS	Yale Oriental Series, Texts
ZA	<i>Zeitschrift für Assyriologie</i>
ZAW	<i>Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft</i>

INTRODUCTION

Roy E. Gane and Ada Taggar-Cohen

The last quarter century has brought an explosion of interest and new developments in the Priestly literature of the Bible, that is, so-called P with H (= Holiness) legislation, along with biblical and Qumran texts that are closely related to it, and therefore involved in interpretation of it, in terms of genre and content. Issues under intense discussion have included the meanings and functions of Israelite sacrifices (especially expiatory sacrifices) and Priestly laws; the nature of ritual impurity and its underlying rationale; ancient Near Eastern backgrounds to Israelite cult and law; the compositional development and social context(s) of P and H; chronological relationships between and dating of P, H, and Ezekiel; and the impact and interpretation of Priestly literature in Qumran texts.

The single greatest catalyst and contributor to this exploration has been Jacob Milgrom (1923–2010), whose seminal articles, provocative hypotheses, and comprehensively probing books, including his monumental three-volume commentary on Leviticus in the Anchor Bible series, have vastly expanded and significantly altered scholarship regarding Priestly and related literature. Before Milgrom, few were interested in Priestly texts such as Leviticus, which seemed obscure, tedious, disjointed, irrelevant, and under the shadow of Wellhausen's denigration of them as reflecting an inferior legalistic form of religion. Milgrom, on the other hand, found such texts to convey profound and consistent theological and ethical values through intriguingly coherent records of authentic ancient Israelite rituals and laws. He discovered that the expiatory sacrifices and purity rules prescribed in Leviticus formed sophisticated and meaningful systems. These systems were designed to teach Israelites concepts such as distinctions between holy, profane, pure, and impure categories; effects of moral faults and physical ritual impurities on the holy domain centered at the sanctuary; the need to purge such evils from

God's residence so that his Presence would not depart; and the crucial, sacred value of life.

By examining the Priestly cultic prescriptions and descriptions within their ancient Near Eastern context, Milgrom concluded (against the majority view that followed Wellhausen) that they originated before the Babylonian exile. He found corroboration for this view in his redaction-critical work on the relationship between P and H, which led him to believe (in basic agreement with Israel Knohl) that H material appears in a number of passages outside the Holiness Code (Lev 17–26) and that H was the redactor of P, which indicates that P was earlier.

Milgrom's investigations of Priestly literature were informed by relevant ancient Near Eastern background materials, anthropology, interaction with interpretations from ancient versions, especially the Septuagint and targumim, and the Dead Sea Scrolls through rabbinic tradition and medieval Jewish exegesis to modern biblical criticism, and especially by "close reading" of the biblical texts, with detailed analyses of their distinctive terminologies. He utilized his vast knowledge of biblical and other ancient cultic systems to make important contributions to research on the Dead Sea Scrolls, such as the Temple Scroll, and to explication of the idealistic temple vision at the end of Ezekiel, to which he devoted his final years.

Now that Jacob Milgrom has passed away (5 June 2010), scholars are consciously or subconsciously dealing with the question: After Milgrom, now what? How can we further test and build on his work? What new directions show promise?

The present volume is designed to advance discussion by beginning to address these questions through research essays exemplifying an international range of approaches and theories that build on the advances of the last quarter century and look to the future. Current developments and debates concerning Priestly and related literature of the Bible are complex and range over a large number of publications. So the book will also assist a scholar or student not specializing in this area to grasp what is going on.

Because Rabbi Jacob Milgrom of blessed memory has played such a major role, the essays in this volume naturally reference and honor his legacy. In this sense, this collection serves as a memorial volume. However, unlike a Festschrift that represents the broad range of an honoree's interests, such as *Pomegranates and Golden Bells: Studies in Biblical, Jewish, and Near Eastern Ritual, Law, and Literature in Honor of*

Jacob Milgrom (1995),¹ the present book is intended to serve as a more narrowly focused and cohesive resource for Priestly and related literature.² Therefore, although Milgrom had other interests, such as classical prophecy, they are not represented in the essays here. However, we include a comprehensive bibliography of Milgrom's published (including posthumous) works that appeared from 1994 to 2014 to supplement the bibliography in *Pomegranates and Golden Bells*, which covers his career from 1955 to 1994.

The present book clusters essays on current issues in Priestly and related literature into five subtopic areas:

1. Interpretation of Priestly and Holiness Texts
2. Composition of Priestly and Holiness Texts
3. Literary Structure of Priestly and Holiness Texts
4. Relationships between Priestly, Holiness, and Deuteronomic Texts
5. Extrabiblical Texts Relating to Priestly Texts

Within subtopics 1–4, essays are arranged in the canonical order of the biblical texts that they primarily address. In subtopic 5, essays are roughly in the chronological order of their main texts.

Most of the essays have developed from Society of Biblical Literature papers presented in four Pentateuch sessions honoring Milgrom at the July 2011 International Meeting in London and a joint session held by the Biblical Law and Ritual in the Biblical World sections that was dedicated to his memory at the November 2011 Annual Meeting in San Francisco. Some additional contributions have come from scholars who were unable to participate in the SBL sessions.

The authors of these essays are diverse, coming from several continents and representing a variety of backgrounds, perspectives, and meth-

1. David P. Wright, David Noel Freedman, and Avi Hurvitz, eds., *Pomegranates and Golden Bells: Studies in Biblical, Jewish, and Near Eastern Ritual, Law, and Literature in Honor of Jacob Milgrom* (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1995), with preface in honor of Jacob Milgrom by David Noel Freedman.

2. Another thematically coherent volume in the Society of Biblical Literature Resources for Biblical Study series that honors a prominent scholar is Joel M. LeMon and Kent Harold Richards, eds., *Method Matters: Essays on the Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Honor of David L. Petersen*, RBS 56 (Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2009).

odologies. They vary from established scholars, including some students of Milgrom, to vibrant new voices who will impact the field for years to come. Scholars speak for themselves, sometimes coming at similar topics from different angles,³ and the editors have made no attempt to harmonize any differences between them. Such counterpoint is essential for the purpose of this resource and honors Milgrom's love for productive debate, including critique of his own work. It almost goes without saying that the editors do not necessarily share all of the views expressed here.

Tragically, one distinguished contributor is no longer with us. Victor Avigdor Hurowitz died on 20 January 2013 during the editorial stage of this project. His posthumous essay, "‘For Instruction Shall Come Forth from Zion’: Biblical and Mesopotamian Temples as Palaces of Justice," now also serves as a memorial of his own outstanding comparative studies.

Hearty thanks are due to the contributors and also to a robust editorial team of former students of Jacob Milgrom: Edwin Firmage, Elaine Goodfriend, Christine Hayes, Michael Hildenbrand, Moshe Kline, David Tabb Stewart, David P. Wright, and Ziony Zevit. Their generous and competent work has significantly enhanced the quality of this volume and lightened the load of its chief editors: Roy E. Gane (also a Milgrom student) and Ada Taggar-Cohen. Thanks also go to Gane's graduate research assistants at Andrews University—Kolia Afamasaga and Trisha Broy—for assistance with compiling the bibliography of Jacob Milgrom's published writings from 1994 to 2014, proofreading, and compiling the list of abbreviations. We are deeply grateful to Susan Ackerman and Marvin A. Sweeney, the past and present editors of the Resources for Biblical Study series, and to Bob Buller, Director of SBL Press, for their encouragement, guidance, and support in bringing this work to publication, including preparation of indices by Bob Buller.

3. For example, both Daniel I. Block and Victor Avigdor Hurowitz discuss the role of Levites and priests as judges, but Hurowitz focuses on comparisons with ancient Near Eastern sources.