

A NEW APPROACH TO TEXTUAL CRITICISM

SBL Press

RESOURCES FOR BIBLICAL STUDY

Series Editor

Tom Thatcher, New Testament

Volume Editor

Michael W. Holmes

Number 80

SBL Press

A NEW APPROACH TO TEXTUAL CRITICISM

An Introduction to the Coherence-Based Genealogical Method

Tommy Wasserman and Peter J. Gurry

SBL PRESS
Atlanta

**DEUTSCHE
BIBEL
GESELLSCHAFT**
Stuttgart

Copyright © 2017 by Society of Biblical Literature, Atlanta, and Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, Stuttgart

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, SBL Press, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Wasserman, Tommy, author; Gurry, Peter J., author.

Title: A new approach to textual criticism : an introduction to the coherence-based genealogical method by Tommy Wasserman and Peter J. Gurry.

Description: Atlanta, USA : SBL Press ; Stuttgart, Germany : Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2017. | Series: Resources for Biblical study ; number 80 | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017039597 (print) | LCCN 2017041465 (ebook) | ISBN 9780884142669 (ebook) | ISBN 9781628371994 (paperback) | ISBN 9780884142676 (hardcover)

Subjects: Bible—Criticism, Textual. | Bible. New Testament—Hermeneutics.

Classification: LCC BS476 (ebook) | LCC BS476 .W366 2017 (print) | DDC 225.4/86—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017039597>

ISBNs for Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft

Hardcover: 978-3-438-05174-5

Paperback: 978-3-438-05172-1

Printed on acid-free paper.



To
Gerd Mink

For his major contribution
to textual criticism

SBL Press

SBL Press

Contents

Acknowledgments.....	ix
List of Figures and Tables.....	xi
Abbreviations.....	xiii
1. Introduction.....	1
1.1. The Changing Landscape	2
1.2. The CBGM in Brief	3
1.3. How the CBGM Is Changing Textual Criticism	5
1.4. Why This Book	13
1.5. Preview	15
1.6. Key Terms	16
2. Overview of the Method.....	17
2.1. History of the Method	17
2.2. The Main Problems the CBGM Addresses	21
2.3. Two Types of Coherence	26
2.4. Three Types of Stemmata	29
2.5. Conclusion	35
2.6. Key Terms	35
3. Pregenealogical Coherence.....	37
3.1. The Basic Concept	37
3.2. How to Use Pregenealogical Coherence	42
3.3. Examples	43
3.4. Limitations	56
3.5. Conclusion	57
3.6. Key Terms	58
4. Genealogical Coherence.....	59
4.1. The Basic Concept	59
4.2. How to Use Genealogical Coherence	61
4.3. Examples	70

4.4. Limitations	91
4.5. Conclusion	93
4.6. Key Terms	93
5. The Global Stemma.....	95
5.1. The Basic Concept	95
5.2. How the Global Stemma Is Constructed	98
5.3. Example: The Origin of the Byzantine Text	102
5.4. Limitations	108
5.5. Conclusion	110
5.6. Key Terms	110
6. Limitations and Future Improvements.....	111
6.1. Limitations	111
6.2. Suggested Improvements	115
6.3. Conclusion	120
6.4. Key Terms	121
Further Reading.....	123
Glossary	133
Appendix: The Layout of the ECM.....	141

SBL Press

Acknowledgments

Writing this book has been more pleasure than pain, and we have many people to thank for that. Florian Voss of the German Bible Society first suggested the idea and invited Tommy and then Peter to write it. He also read the full manuscript and gave a number of helpful suggestions. Bob Buller at SBL Press is to be thanked for being open to a joint publication and for handling the logistics of seeing the book to print.

All authors feel a sense of trepidation before launching a book into the sea of public opinion, but a number of very helpful readers have alleviated our fear by offering to read it before press time. Mike Holmes not only gave us initial feedback about the book's scope, audience, and aims but then read the entire manuscript in careful detail, helping us improve it throughout. Peter Head, David Parker, and Larry Hurtado all read the manuscript and provided further comments and suggestions.

Our greatest debt, however, lies with two readers who are heavily invested in the book's content: Klaus Wachtel and Gerd Mink of the Institute for New Testament Textual Research in Münster, Germany. Their firsthand knowledge of the CBGM (Gerd having invented it!) saved us from more mistakes and misstatements than we care to count. We hope this book will serve as a token of our appreciation to their many years of tireless work in the field of New Testament textual criticism. In particular, we have dedicated the book to Gerd for his major contribution to the discipline.

SBL Press

Figures and Tables

Figures

2.1. Relationship of four witnesses based on shared errors	23
2.2. Misrepresentation of the relationship between A, B, C, and D	24
2.3. The local stemma for Jas 2:23/36	30
2.4. The local stemma for 1 Pet 5:10/38–44	31
2.5. A substemma for witness 35 showing its potential ancestors	31
2.6. Best substemmata for witness 35: only stemmatic ancestors	32
2.7. Topmost portion of the global stemma for the Catholic Letters	34
3.1. The Parallel Pericopes: Manuscript Clusters tool	45
3.2. Closest relatives for Manuscript 01, Sinaiticus	45
3.3. Format for viewing the relatives of witnesses for reading <i>b</i>	53
3.4. List of witnesses for reading <i>b</i>	53
4.1. The interface for the Coherence in Attestations tool	62
4.2. A textual flow diagram for 1 Pet 1:23/18–22 <i>a</i>	63
4.3. Textual flow diagram for 1 Pet 1:23/18–22 <i>b</i>	63
4.4. Textual flow diagram for 1 Pet 1:23/18–22 <i>d</i>	64
4.5. Textual flow diagram for whole variation unit: 1 Pet 1:23/18–22	65
4.6. Coherence at Variant Passages tool for the Catholic Letters	67
4.7. Textual flow diagram for 1 Pet 1:23/18–22: reading <i>b</i> as initial	70
4.8. Textual flow diagram for 1 Pet 4:16/24–2: <i>b</i> deriving from <i>a</i>	73
4.9. Textual flow diagram for 1 Pet 4:16/24–28: reading <i>b</i> as initial	74
4.10. Textual flow diagram for 2 Pet 3:10/48–50: reading <i>a</i> as initial	76
4.11. Textual flow diagram for 2 Pet 3:10/48–50: reading <i>b</i> as initial	77
4.12. Textual flow diagram for 2 Pet 3:10/48–50: reading <i>f</i> as initial	78
4.13. Textual flow diagram for 1 John 5:6/16: reading <i>a</i> as initial	81
4.14. The simplified variation unit address input for Acts	82
4.15. The relatives table for 05 in Acts	83

4.16. Default Coherence at Variant Passages diagram for Acts 1:26/8	84
4.17. Coherence at Variant Passages tool showing the chord display	85
4.18. Coherence at Variant Passages diagram for Acts 20:28/40	89
4.19. Coherence at Variant Passages diagram: Acts 20:28/40, $A = a$	90
4.20. Coherence at Variant Passages diagram: Acts 20:28/40, $A = b$	90
4.21. Coherence at Variant Passages diagram: Acts 20:28/40, $A = e$	91
5.1. The top of the global stemma for the Catholic Letters	97
5.2. One of many possible substemmata for witness 35	99
5.3. Mink's preferred optimal substemma for 35	102
5.4. Global stemma for the Harklean group in the Catholic Letters	105
A.1. A sample from the ECM IV ² showing Jas 2:1	142
A.2. A page from the ECM III showing Acts 1:5–6	145
A.3. The first page of the ECM parallel pericopes volume	146

Tables

2.1. The genealogical coherence between 01 and 03	28
3.1. Pregenealogical coherence: witnesses with reading a at Mark 1:1	47
3.2. Pregenealogical coherence: witnesses with reading b at Mark 1:1	48
3.3. Witnesses: relatives that do not share reading at Matt 16:27/44–50	54
4.1. Genealogical coherence of 01 and 03 in the Catholic Letters	60
4.2. The Show Table results for 1 Pet 1:23/28–22 <i>d</i>	64
5.1. Six substemmata for witness 35	101
5.2. A comparison of 35 and 1611	106

SBL Press

Abbreviations

AB	Anchor Bible
AnBib	Analecta Biblica
ANTF	Arbeiten zur neutestamentlichen Textforschung
BBB	Bonner Biblische Beiträge
BECNT	Baker Exegetical Commentary on the New Testament
BHGNT	Baylor Handbook on the Greek New Testament
<i>BT</i>	<i>Bible Translator</i>
CBGM	Coherence-Based Genealogical Method
CBQ	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
ConBNT	Coniectanea Biblica: New Testament Series
ECM	<i>Editio Critica Maior</i>
ECM IV/1.1	Barbara Aland et al., eds., <i>Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 1: Text: Installment 1: James</i> . Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1997.
ECM IV/1.2	Barbara Aland et al., eds., <i>Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 1: Text: Installment 2: The Letters of Peter</i> . Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2000.
ECM IV/1.3	Barbara Aland et al., eds., <i>Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 1: Text: Installment 3: The First Letter of John</i> . Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2003.
ECM IV/1.4	Barbara Aland et al., eds., <i>Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 1: Text: Installment 4: The Second and Third Letter of John, the Letter of Jude</i> . Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2005.

- ECM IV/2.1 Barbara Aland et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 2: Supplementary Material: Installment 1: James*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1997.
- ECM IV/2.2 Barbara Aland et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 2: Supplementary Material: Installment 2: The Letters of Peter*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2000.
- ECM IV/2.3 Barbara Aland et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 2: Supplementary Material: Installment 3: The First Letter of John*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2003.
- ECM IV/2.4 Barbara Aland et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 2: Supplementary Material: Installment 4: The Second and Third Letter of John, the Letter of Jude*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2005.
- ECM IV²/1 Barbara Aland et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 1: Text*. 2nd ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2013.
- ECM IV²/2 Barbara Aland et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior IV: Catholic Letters: Part 2: Supplementary Material*. 2nd ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2013.
- ECM III/1.1 Holger Strutwolf et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior III: The Acts of the Apostles: Part 1.1: Text, Chapters 1–14*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2017.
- ECM III/1.2 Holger Strutwolf et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior III: The Acts of the Apostles: Part 1.2: Text, Chapters 15–28*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2017.
- ECM III/2 Holger Strutwolf et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior III: The Acts of the Apostles: Part 2: Supplementary Material*. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2017).
- ECM III/3 Holger Strutwolf et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior III: The Acts of the Apostles:*

	<i>Part 3: Studies</i> . Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2017.
ECMPP	Holger Strutwolf and Klaus Wachtel, eds., <i>Novum Testamentum Graecum: Editio Critica Maior: Parallel Pericopes: Special Volume Regarding the Synoptic Gospels</i> . Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2011.
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
IGNTP	International Greek New Testament Project
INTF	Institut für Neutestamentliche Textforschung
JETS	<i>Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society</i>
JTS	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
LQ	<i>Lutheran Quarterly</i>
NA ²⁷	Aland, Barbara, et al., eds. <i>Novum Testamentum Graece</i> . 27th ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1993.
NA ²⁸	Aland, Barbara, et al., eds. <i>Novum Testamentum Graece</i> . 28th ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2012.
NAC	New American Commentary
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament
NovT	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NTS	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
NTTS	New Testament Tools and Studies
NTTSD	New Testament Tools, Studies and Documents
NT.VMR	New Testament Virtual Manuscript Room
RBS	Resources in Biblical Studies
RP	Robinson, Maurice A., and William G. Pierpont, eds. <i>The New Testament in the Original Greek: Byzantine Textform</i> . Southborough, MA: Chilton, 2005.
SBLGNT	Michael W. Holmes, ed. <i>The Greek New Testament: SBL Edition</i> . Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature; Bellingham, WA: Logos Bible Software, 2010.
SD	Studies and Documents
TCS	Text-Critical Studies
TuT	Aland, Kurt, et al., eds. <i>Text und Textwert der griechischen Handschriften des Neuen Testaments</i> . ANTE. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1987–.
TC	<i>Textual Criticism: A Journal of Biblical Textual Criticism</i> (http://purl.org/TC)
THGNT	Jongkind, Dirk, and Peter J. Williams, eds. <i>The Greek</i>

- New Testament, Produced at Tyndale House, Cambridge.* Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2017.
- UBS⁴ Aland, Barbara, et al., eds., *The Greek New Testament*. 4th ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft; United Bible Societies, 1983.
- UBS⁵ Aland, Barbara, et al., eds., *The Greek New Testament*. 5th ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft; United Bible Societies, 2014.
- v.l.* *varia lectio* = variant reading
- WUNT Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament

SBL Press