ADAM AND EVE IN THE ARMENIAN TRADITION FIFTH THROUGH SEVENTEENTH CENTURIES







Early Judaism and Its Literature

Rodney A. Werline, Series Editor

Editorial Board

Mark J. Boda George J. Brooke Esther Glickler Chazon Steven D. Fraade Martha Himmelfarb James S. McLaren Jacques van Ruiten

Number 38

ADAM AND EVE IN THE ARMENIAN TRADITION

FIFTH THROUGH SEVENTEENTH CENTURIES

ADAM AND EVE IN THE ARMENIAN TRADITION

FIFTH THROUGH SEVENTEENTH CENTURIES

Michael E. Stone

Society of Biblical Literature Atlanta

ADAM AND EVE IN THE ARMENIAN TRADITION FIFTH THROUGH SEVENTEENTH CENTURIES

Copyright © 2013 by the Society of Biblical Literature

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, Society of Biblical Literature, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Stone, Michael E., 1938-

Adam and Eve in the Armenian traditions : fifth through 17th centuries / Michael E. Stone.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-58983-898-7 (paper binding) — ISBN 978-1-58983-899-4 (electronic format) — ISBN 978-1-58983-900-7 (hardcover binding)

- 1. Adam (Biblical figure) 2. Eve (Biblical figure) 3. Bible. Genesis, I-III
- 4. Apocryphal books. 5. Armenian literature—History and criticism.
- I. Title.

BS1830.A262S773 2013 229'.911—dc23

2013022985

Printed on acid-free, recycled paper conforming to ANSI /NISO Z39.48–1992 (R1997) and ISO 9706:1994 standards for paper permanence.



This work is dedicated to my teachers:

Frank Moore Cross Jr. (13 July 1921–16 October 2012)

Avedis Krikor Sanjian (24 February 1921–22 July 1995)



CONTENTS

ist of Figures	
Preface and Acknowledgments	
Abbreviations	
ntroduction	
ART I. THE ADAM AND EVE TRADITIONS IN ARMENIAN	1
Outline	3
1. Adam and Eve Traditions in Fifth-Century Armenian Literature	. 11
2. Adam and Eve Traditions in Sixth- to Eleventh-Century Armenian Literature	. 39
3. Adam and Eve Traditions in Twelfth- and Thirteenth-Century Armenian Literature	. 83
4. Adam and Eve Traditions in Fourteenth- and Fifteenth-Century Armenian Literature	127
5. Adam and Eve Traditions in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Armenian Literature	
Appendix: Satan and the Serpent	177
ART II. TEXTS AND TRANSLATIONS	211
Fifth Century	213
Sixth Century	289
Seventh Century	297
Eighth Century	309
Ninth Century	343
Tenth Century	

viii CONTENTS

Eleventh Century
Twelfth Century
Thirteenth Century
Fourteenth Century
Fifteenth Century
Sixteenth Century
Seventeenth Century
Eighteenth Century
Alphabetical List of Authors Quoted
Bibliography
Index of Selected Subjects and Proper Names
Index of Ancient Sources



List of Figures

Ι.	Crowned Adam with Eve, Jerusalem Armenian Patriarchate	
	J1667 of the year 1529. Photo by M. Stone.	53
2.	Four-footed satan or demon, Erevan, Matenadaran Institute	
	of Ancient Manuscripts, M2890 of the year 1719.	
	Photo by G. Muradyan.	171
3.	Serpentine Hell swallows the Wicked, Erevan, Matenadaran	
	Institute of Ancient Manuscripts, M5523 of the year 1414.	
	Used by permission.	181
4.	Višap dragon stone at Sardarabad, Armenia, Photo by H. Petrosvan.	189



Preface and Acknowledgments

At the basis of this book stands a corpus of all the published pre–eighteenth-century narrative texts in Armenian relating to Adam, Eve, and the Eden story. These texts were excerpted and translated as part of a project on "Adam and Eve in the Armenian Tradition," funded by the Israel Research Foundation, grant no. 770/99.

The project and its progress will be described in the introduction below. Here I wish to acknowledge all those who contributed to it over the years, while stressing my own responsibility for the contents of this book. In the task of preparation of part 2 of this book, I was greatly assisted by Aram Topchyan and, later, by Gohar Muradyan. Without their help and expertise, I could not have finished this project. In making the initial probe of the fifth-century material, I had the assistance of Theo van Lint and the support of Fr. Mesrob Aramian, of the Ganjasar Theological Centre in Yerevan. Roberta Ervine suggested many felicitous translations. Bernard Outtier read the whole volume, and his great learning and acumen improved it at many points. To all these, I am most grateful.

At various stages of this work, which has been under way since the late 1990s, Narineh Yacoubian and Vered Hillel assisted in technical matters. The final editing of the manuscript of part 1 has benefitted from the careful attention of Yael Moise. My thanks are expressed to all three devoted helpers.

Rod Werline of SBLEJL and the publication experts of the Society of Biblical Literature have carried out their work expertly.

The poem by Kostandin Erznkac'i is reproduced by permission of Th. M. van Lint from his unpublished thesis of 1996, "Konstandin of Erznka: An Armenian Religious Poet of the XIIIth-XIVth Century" (Leiden University). He kindly revised it for this publication. The translation of the fifteenth-century amulet by Yoav Loeff from his master's thesis of 2002 ("Four Texts from the Oldest Known Armenian Amulet Scroll: Matenadaran 116 (1428)" [Hebrew University of Jerusalem]) is published by permission. The permission of the following publishers is acknowledged for excerpts reproduced here. Exact page spans are specified *in situ*. Peeters Publishers of Leuven, Belgium, granted permission for the excerpts from Robert W. Thomson 2005, *Hamam: Commentary on the Book of Proverbs* (Hebrew University Armenian Studies 5); and G. A. Egan 1968, *Saint Ephrem: An Exposition of the Gospel* (CSCO 291–92, Scriptores Armeniaci 5–6); Scholars Press of Atlanta, Georgia, for excerpts

from James R. Russell 1987, Yovhannēs T'lkuranc'i and the Medieval Armenian Lyric Tradition (University of Pennsylvania Armenian Texts and Studies 5); St. Nersess Seminary of New Rochelle, New York, for excerpts from Robert W. Thomson 2001, Teaching of St. Gregory: Revised Edition (Avant: Treasures of the Armenian Christian Tradition 1);



ABBREVIATIONS

ANB Ačaryan, H. Հայոց Անձանունների Բառարան Dictionary of

Armenian Proper Names. Beirut: Sevan Press, 1972.

CSCO Corpus scriptorum christianorum orientalium

dub. of dubious authenticity or date

GT' Girk' T'lt'oc'

L.A.E. Life of Adam and Eve

MES in translations marks alternate translations proposed by the

author.

MH Մատենագիրք Հայոց Ancient Armenian Literature (Antelias,

Lebanon: Catholicosate of Cilicia, 2003–)

NBHL G. Awetik'ean, X. Siwrmēlean, and M. Awk'erean Unp punqhpp

հայկազեան լեզուի New Dictionary of the Armenian Language. 2

vols. Venice: St. Lazzaro, 1836-37.

Pen. Adam Penitence of Adam

PG Patrologia Graeca [= Patrologiae cursus completus: Series graeca].

Edited by J.-P. Migne. 162 vols. Paris, 1857–86.

PL Patrologia Latina [= Patrologiae cursus completus: Series latina].

Edited by J.-P. Migne. 217 vols. Paris, 1844-64.

s.v. sub vocem

v.l., v.ll. varia lectio, variae lectiones, i.e., variant readings

In footnotes, A.T. means Aram Topchyan. G.M. means Gohar Muradyan.

All ancient writings, including rabbinic texts, are abbreviated in accordance with the SBL Handbook of Style.

Armenian manuscripts are cited according to the system of the Association Internationale des Etudes Arméniennes, as published on their Web site: http://aiea.fltr.ucl.ac.be/AIEAengl/Tools_files/Sigles.pdf

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF AUTHORS CITED

Abusayid, C12

Agat'angelos C5

Anania Mokac'i Kat'ołikos C10

Anania Narekac'i C10

Anania Sanahnec'i C11

Anania Širakac'i C7

Anania vardapet C 5

Anonymous Author 8 C17

Anonymous Chronicler of Livorno C17

Anonymous of Sebastia C15

Arak'el Davirzec'i C17

Arak'el Siwnec'i C15

Artawazd Mazazuni C10

At'anas Taronac'i C6

Awetik' Mahtesi C16-17

Azaria Jułavec'i C16

Barseł Maškeronc'i C14

Dawit' Bałišec'i C17

Dawit' Ganjakec'i C12

Dawit' Hark'ac'i C7

Dawit' Salajorec'i C17

Dawit' the Invincible C7

Ełišē, C5

Ep'rem Łap'anc'i C17

Ephrem, Exposition of the Gospel, C5

Esayi Nč'ec'i C14

Eznik, C5

Frik C13

Gēorg Lorec'i C11

Girk' T'ltoc', Letter attributed to Movses Xorenac'i, C6

Girk' Tłt'oc', C5

Grigor Aknerc'i C13

Grigor Daranałc'i C17

Grigor Magistros C10

Grigor Narekac'i C10

Grigor Pahlavuni C12

Grigor Tat'ewac'i C14 (also titled Grigor, Pupil of Yōhannēs Orotnec'i C14)

Grigor Tłay C12

Grigor Vkayasēr C11-12

Grigor Jerenc' C14

Grigoris Alt'amarc'i C16

Grigoris Aršaruni C7

Hamam Arewelc'i C9

Ignatius vardapet C12

K'erovbē vardapet C 9

Karapet Bałišec'i C16

Kirakos Erznkac'i C14

Kirakos Ganiakec'i C13

Komitas Kat'ołikos C6

Kostandin Erznkac'i C14

Lazar P'arpec'i, C5

Łazar Sebastac'i C16

Lewond C8

Liturgy

Mambrē, C5

Matt'ēos vardapet C15

Minas T'oxat'ec'i C16

Mkrtič' Nałaš C15

Movsēs K'ert'ołahayr C6

Movsēs Kałankatuac'i C10

Movsēs Xorenac'i C91

Mxit'ar Anec'i C12

Mxit'ar Ayrivanec'i C14

Mxit'ar Goš C 12

Nahapet K'uč'ak Vanec'i C16

Nazaret' A C17

Nersēs Anjnapatc'i A C17

Nersēs Lambronac'i C12

Nersēs Šnorhali C12

P'awstos Buzand, C5

Pawłos Taronac'i C12

P'ilon Tirakac'i C7

Pseudo-Basil C6

Pseudo-Šapuh or The Anonymous Story-Teller C9

Sahak Jorap'orec'i C7

Sahak Mrut C9

^{1.} See note in the fifth-century analysis on the dating of this author.

Samuēl Anec'i C12

Samuēl Kamrjajorec'i C 10

Sargis Šnorhali C12

Sarkawag Berdakac'i C16

Simēon Ałjnec'i C10

Simēon Aparanc'i C16

Simēon Kafac'i C17

Step'anos Kełec'i C17

Step'anos Ōrbelean C13

Step'anos Siwnec'i C8

Step'anos Tarōnec'i (Asolik), C10

Tačat vardapet, C10

T'adēos T'oxat'ec'i C16

T'ēodoros K'rt'enawor C7

T'ēop'ilos, C 9

Timot'ēos vardapet, C10

Tiranun vardapet, C10

T'ovma Arcruni C9

Uxtanēs C10

Vahram Rabuni C13

Vanakan *vardapet* C13

Vardan Arawelc'i C13

Vardan Aygekc'i C13

Vrt'anēs K'ert'oł C7

Xač'atur Jułayec'i C18

Xač'atur Keč'arec'i C14

Xač'atur Xaspēk Kafac'i C17

Xosrovik T'argmanič' C8

Xosrow Anjewac'i C10

Yačaxapatum Čark' Dogmatic Homilies, C5

Yakob Cpatec'i C10

Yakob Kesarac'i C17

Yakob Łrimec'i C15

Yakob T'oxat'ec'i C17

Yohan K'ahana C13

Yovasap' Erznkac'i C17

Yovasap' Sebastac'i C16

Yovhan Arčišec'i C14

Yovhan Mamikonean C7

Yovhan Ōjnec'i C8

Yovhan Orotnec'i C14

Yovhanēs Garnec'i C13

Yovhannēs A C16



Yovhannēs Drasxanakertc'i C10 Yovhannēs Erznkac'i Corcorec'i C14 Yovhannēs Erznkac'i Pluz C13 Yovhannēs Garnec'i C13 Yovhannēs Imastasēr (Sarkawag) C12 Yovhannēs Julayec'i C17 Yovhannēs K'orepiskopos C8 Yovhannēs Mandakuni, C5 Yovhannēs T'lkuranc'i C14 Zak'aria Kat'olikos C9 Zak'aria Gnuneac' C16



Introduction

In 1992, at the invitation of Professor Marinus de Jonge, I lectured at the Milan meeting of the Society for New Testament Studies (SNTS) on the *status quaestionis* of the study of the literature of Adam and Eve. I had worked on aspects of the Adam material previously, including the discovery and publication of the Armenian primary Adam book, the *Penitence of Adam*.¹ Indeed, the first article I published after completing my doctoral thesis was on an Armenian Adam book, *Death of Adam*.² The survey required by the SNTS presentation led me systematically to study the Adam literature and, soon after, to write a book presenting the known works.³ Subsequently, I decided to work on Armenian Adam writings in a more systematic way, publishing a volume of texts, two volumes of concordances, and a number of articles.⁴ Several Armenian Adam texts that I have since discovered still remain unpublished, and one volume of the planned concordances lies half done in a drawer. I plan to publish these if possible.

The apocryphal literature attests to just one of the ways in which the Adam and Eve stories were rewritten within and influenced Armenian culture. To complete the picture, I decided not to look only at Adam apocrypha, of which there is an abundance in Armenian,⁵ but also at how the stories of Genesis 1–3 were reflected in Armenian literature. I was not interested in purely theological issues, nor in the simple use of such typology as the Old and New Adam in itself, although on occasion the typological passages bear narrative elements within them. This undertaking had two main goals. First, to see how the Armenians handled the biblical narrative and to try to isolate and specific retellings or interpretations that reflected particular theological or, indeed, historical circumstances. The other was to try to find out when the Armenian apocryphal Adam literature started to be reflected in dated authors and thus to get some idea of the dating of the Armenian Adam literature, which cannot have originated much before its attestation in the known authors. The present book is the outcome of this project.

^{1.} Stone 1981a.

^{2.} Stone 1973a.

^{3.} This led to the publication, shortly thereafter, of Stone 1992.

^{4.} These are all listed in the bibliography below.

^{5.} Stone 1992; 1996a.

In further detail, we may say that the Adamic narrative was very influential because the stories of Adam and Eve played a constitutive and structural role in the Christian worldview. The economy of salvation—the *historia sacra*—commenced with Adam and Eve and concluded with the redemptive acts of Christ's life and death. Christ, the new Adam, undid and reversed the situation that the first Adam's actions had created. Adam and Eve's deeds were the first act of a cosmic drama with a happy ending. The protological events directly caused the dire situation of the world, but they were also pregnant with the promise of ultimate redemption.

The way the stories were told, therefore, often reflected the nature of the quandary in which the teller or the teller's generation perceived themselves to be living. The enrichment, nuancing, interpretation, and indeed the changing of the biblical story may teach us how its later narrators perceived the human condition. Naturally, not every expansion or change of the biblical narrative was a response to a specific aporia. A playful or inquisitive spirit could be responsible for one detail; a nontendentious embellishment of the stark biblical narrative could engender another. Nonetheless, the retelling of the story frequently reveals the narrator's and the intended reader's contexts and concerns.

At certain times, it seems, apocryphal elements flooded the Armenian Adam tradition. When did this happen? Into which genres of literature did such elements penetrate? Why? When traditions or features of Armenian texts parallel or are drawn from known patristic sources, we must assess the significance of such dependency. Whole patristic commentaries and homilies were translated into Armenian, such as works of Ephrem the Syrian, John Chrysostom, and Eusebius of Emesa. Others were excerpted in *catenae*. When a particular element occurs in such translated works, it cannot be assigned special significance. However, when such an element is taken up from a non-Armenian source and incorporated into a work composed in Armenian, its significance is enhanced. Such questions have guided us in the presentation of the evidence.

The book has two parts. Part 1 is composed of five chapters, divided chronologically. They cover the period from the inception of Armenian writing in the early fifth century to the end of the seventeenth century. Following a section of "General Considerations," the chapters deal with four main subjects: (1) The

^{6.} This may be seen clearly, for example, in the work *Adam, Eve and the Incarnation* published by Stone (1996, 8–79; 1999, 21–36). A variant on the drama of Satan's deceit of Adam is the form of the story of the contract between Adam and Satan traced out in Stone 2002; and *The Cheirograph of Adam*, in Stone 2000c, 149–66.

^{7.} Instances of such dependency have been repeatedly highlighted by Robert W. Thomson, among others, in his comments on a large number of Armenian texts.

^{8.} Bibliography of such translations may be found in Zarbhanalean (1889) and Thomson (1995) and Petrosyan and Ter Step'anyan (2002). Few collections of Armenian *catenae* have been published, but note, most recently, Vardan Aygekc'i 1988.

Creation of Human Beings; (2) The Garden of Eden; (3) Satan; and (4) Sin and Its Results. Each of these main subjects is divided into sections and subsections, and these are numbered and titled identically throughout the five chapters of the book. Because the sections and subsections are identical throughout, they represent a maximal range of material. A section or subsection is introduced when its subject is first encountered in the texts studied but subsequently is left without content if its subject does not occur in the centuries being discussed in a particular chapter. In these sections and subsections the views forwarded on the subject to which they are devoted are presented, analyzed, and discussed, based on the excerpts to be found in part 2. Generally, in part 1, when texts are quoted, the quotations are only of the English translation, unless the Armenian itself is germane to the point being made. I have also added some remarks on the exegesis lying behind the statements made and, in the first chapter, some comparative Greek and Syriac material. My primary purpose throughout is to present the Armenian tradition, elucidating those views of the narrative that lay behind subsequent Armenian interpretations—theological, exegetical, literary, and sometimes artistic.

Thus, the five chapters present a synchronic treatment of what Armenian literature says about the main subjects arising from the narrative in Genesis 1–3. At the end of part 1, in an appendix, a diachronic treatment of one single subject, Satan and the Serpent, is given. This is a probe, an example of the type of analysis possible when drawing on the synchronic presentation in the five chapters. In part 1, I indicate the cited authors' century by the notation C6, C7, C8, and so on, on the first occurrence of each name in a paragraph. The indexes and bibliography at the end of the book relate only to part 1.

Part 2 is a corpus of excerpts from all the literature in Armenian that has been published, apart from the books of the Apocrypha. The authors excerpted are arranged alphabetically within each century from the fifth to the seventeenth. Each work cited in this second part of the book is provided with a bibliography, both of the text used, such translations as exist, and other significant editions. A List of Authors Excerpted, arranged alphabetically indicating centuries, provides a key to part 2 of the present work. Most of the translations are original, but for certain works existing translations have been used. I have indicated when this is the case. The capitalization and punctuation of the Armenian texts follow the sources quoted.

All Armenian authors are cited by name and toponym or other title if appropriate. "C13," and the like, indicates the century of the author's floruit. A brief biographical note on each author is to be found at the end of the book. Further

^{9.} One eighteenth-century author is added at the end, whose writings are very close to the preceding tradition.

bibliographical indications may readily be found in Thomson 1995 and, about later authors, in Bardakjian 2000. Much information is also given in Bogharian 1971.

Within the section devoted to an author, each separate excerpt is given a sequential number. This excerpt is then referred to as, for example, "Grigor Narekac'i 1, and this practice is followed throughout the book.

