

TORAH

SBL Press

EARLY JUDAISM AND ITS LITERATURE

Rodney A. Werline, General Editor

Editorial Board:

Randall D. Chesnutt
Kelley N. Coblenz Bautch
Maxine L. Grossman
Carol Newsom

Number 56

SBL Press



TORAH

Functions, Meanings, and Diverse Manifestations in Early Judaism and Christianity

Edited by

William M. Schniedewind, Jason M. Zurawski,
and Gabriele Boccaccini

SBL Press



SBL PRESS

Atlanta

Copyright © 2022 by SBL Press

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, SBL Press, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Control Number: 2022931090

SBL Press

Contents

Abbreviations	ix
Introduction: Discussing Torah in the Tuscan Hills Jason M. Zurawski.....	1
Part 1: Notions of Torah in the Hebrew Bible, Samaritan Pentateuch, and Septuagint	
Diversity and Development of <i>tôrâ</i> in the Hebrew Bible William M. Schniedewind	17
<i>Torah</i> as Speech Performance in the Hebrew Bible Jacqueline Vayntrub.....	37
<i>Tôrâ</i> as Mode of Conveyance: The Problem with “Teaching” and “Law” David Lambert.....	61
Possible Ideological Tendencies in the MT, the LXX, and the SP Magnar Kartveit.....	81
From <i>tôrâ</i> to <i>νόμος</i> : How the Use of <i>νόμος</i> in the LXX Pentateuch Enlightens the Process That Leads the Word <i>tôrâ</i> to the Concept of Torah Patrick Pouchelle.....	95
Levites as Prophets and Scribes and Their Role in the Transmission of the Torah Oliver Dyma.....	115
From the Torah of Polluted and Inedible Meats to Diet as a Marker of Jewish Identity James W. Watts.....	131

Part 2: Notions of Torah in Second Temple Judaism

Where Is the Torah in Ben Sira? Benjamin G. Wright III	145
The Normativity of Torah in Ezra-Nehemiah and Ben Sira Jonathan Vroom	167
Variegated Notions of Torah: The Law (<i>νόμος</i>) in the Prologue to Ben Sira Juan Carlos Ossandón Widow.....	187
Torah for Insight: Inquiry via Enigma Robert G. Hall.....	199
Torah and the Search for Wisdom in Hellenistic Judea Elisa Uusimäki	217
Torah and Apocalypticism in the Second Temple Period Gabriele Boccaccini	229
Torah and Halakah in the Hellenistic Period Lutz Doering.....	249
Torah for the Moment: Understanding Torah in a Performative Context Francis Borchart	293
The “Stoic” Solomon: From Torah to <i>Nomos</i> via Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age from the Perspective of the Wisdom of Solomon Joachim Schaper	315
<i>Nomos</i> Human and Divine in the Wisdom of Solomon Michael C. Legaspi	333
From Torah to Torahization: A Biocultural Evolutionary Perspective Anders Klostergaard Petersen	343
Part 3: Notions of Torah in the New Testament	
Paul and <i>Nóμος</i> , and Broader Perspectives: Romans 13:8–10 as Case Study Jeremy Punt.....	369

Paul's Definition of "Circumcision of the Heart": A Transcultural Reading of Romans 2:28–29 Federico Dal Bo	397
Jewish Torah for a Gentile World: A Comparison of Pseudo-Phocylides and Paul Editing Torah and Adapting Ethics in Romans 12:9–21; 13:8–10 Jason A. Myers	411
Jewish Legal Interpretation and the New Testament Calum Carmichael	445
Part 4: Notions of Torah in Late Antiquity	
The Status of the Torah in Late Antiquity Michael L. Satlow	459
Paul, Augustine, and the "I" of Romans 7 Paula Fredriksen	473
<i>Tôrâ? Torah? Flora! Law and Book in Ptolemaeus Gnosticus's Letter to Flora</i> Anne Kreps	503
Contributors	517
Ancient Sources Index	519
Modern Authors Index	542

SBL Press

SBL Press

Abbreviations

Primary Sources

ʿAbot R. Nat.	ʿAbot de Rabbi Nathan
<i>Abr.</i>	Philo, <i>De Abrahamo</i>
<i>Adv. Jud.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>Adversus Judaeos</i>
<i>Aet.</i>	Philo, <i>De aeternitate mundi</i>
<i>Ag.</i>	Aeschylus, <i>Agamemnon</i>
<i>Ag. Ap.</i>	Josephus, <i>Against Apion</i>
ALD	Aramaic Levi Document
<i>Ant.</i>	Josephus, <i>Jewish Antiquities</i>
Apocr. Jas.	Apocryphon of James
<i>Apol.</i>	Plato, <i>Apologia</i>
<i>Av.</i>	Aristophanes, <i>Aves</i>
b.	Babylonian Talmud
B.Bat.	Baba Batra
<i>Bibl.</i>	Photius, <i>Bibliotheca</i>
<i>C. du. ep. Pelag.</i>	Augustine, <i>Contra duas epistolas Pelagianorum ad Bonifatium</i>
<i>Civ.</i>	Augustine, <i>De civitate Dei</i>
<i>Comm. Jo.</i>	Origen <i>Commentarium in evangelium Joannis</i>
<i>Comm. Matt.</i>	Origen <i>Commentarium in evangelium Matthaei</i>
<i>Conf.</i>	Augustine, <i>Confessiones libri XIII</i>
D	Damascus law code
<i>Decal.</i>	Philo, <i>De decalogo</i>
<i>Demon.</i>	Isocrates, <i>Ad Demonicum</i> (Or. 1)
<i>Div. quaest. LXXXIII</i>	Augustine, <i>De diversis quaestionibus LXXXIII</i>
<i>Div. quaest. Simpl.</i>	Augustine, <i>De diversis quaestionibus ad Simplicianum</i>
<i>E Delph.</i>	Plutarch, <i>De E apud Delphos</i>
<i>Ep.</i>	Seneca, <i>Epistulae morales</i> ; Augustine, <i>Epistulae</i>

<i>Faust.</i>	Augustine, <i>Contra Faustum Manichaeum</i>
<i>Flor.</i>	Ptolemy, <i>Epistula ad Floram</i>
<i>Fort.</i>	Augustine, <i>Contra Fortunatum</i>
<i>Fug.</i>	Philo, <i>De fuga et inventione</i>
H	Holiness Code
<i>Haer.</i>	Hippolytus, <i>Refutatio omnium haeresium</i> ; Irenaeus, <i>Adversus haereses (Elenchos)</i>
Hag.	Hagigah
<i>Hist.</i>	<i>Histories</i>
<i>Hist. eccl.</i>	Eusebius, <i>Historia Ecclesiastica</i>
<i>Hypth.</i>	Philo, <i>Hypothetica</i>
<i>Inst.</i>	Quintilian <i>Institutio oratoria</i>
<i>Inv.</i>	Cicero, <i>De inventione rhetorica</i>
J.W.	Josephus, <i>Jewish War</i>
LAE	Life of Adam and Eve
Let. Aris.	Letter of Aristeas
<i>Marc.</i>	Tertullian, <i>Adversus Marcionem</i>
Mas	Masada manuscript
<i>Mos.</i>	Philo, <i>De vita Mosis</i>
<i>Mut.</i>	Philo, <i>De mutatione nominum</i>
<i>Nat. d.</i>	Cicero, <i>De natura deorum</i>
P	Priestly
<i>Pan.</i>	Epiphanius <i>Panarion (Adversus haereses)</i>
<i>Post.</i>	Philo, <i>De posteritate Caini</i>
<i>Praed.</i>	Augustine, <i>De praedestinatione sanctorum</i>
<i>Praem.</i>	Philo, <i>De praemiis et poenis</i>
<i>Praep. evang.</i>	Eusebius, <i>Praeparatio evangelica</i>
<i>Propp.</i>	Augustine, <i>Expositio quarundam propositionum ex epistola apostoli ad Romanos</i>
Ps.-Phoc.	Pseudo-Phocylides
<i>Pyth. orac.</i>	Plutarch, <i>De Pythiae oraculis</i>
Rab.	Rabbah (+ biblical book)
<i>Retract.</i>	Augustine <i>Retractationes libri II</i>
<i>Rhet.</i>	Aristotle, <i>Rhetorica</i>
Rhet. Her.	Rhetorica ad Herennium
Šabb.	Shabbat
Sanh.	Sanhedrin
<i>Sens.</i>	Aristotle, <i>De sensu et sensibilibus</i>
<i>Somn.</i>	Philo, <i>De somniis</i>

<i>Spec.</i>	Philo, <i>De specialibus legibus</i>
<i>Strom.</i>	Clement of Alexandria, <i>Stromateis</i>
Tg. Ps.-J.	Targum Pseudo-Jonathan
T.Jud	Testament of Judah
T.Levi	Testament of Levi
T.Zeb.	Testament of Zebulun
<i>Virt.</i>	Philo, <i>De virtutibus</i>
y.	Jerusalem Talmud

Secondary Sources

AB	Anchor (Yale) Bible
ABD	Freedman, David Noel, ed. <i>Anchor Bible Dictionary</i> . 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
ABRL	Anchor (Yale) Bible Reference Library
AbrNSup	Abr-Narain Supplement
AcBib	Academia Biblica
ACSt	American Classical Studies
<i>AcT</i>	<i>Acta Theologica</i>
<i>AcTSup</i>	<i>Acta Theologica Supplementum</i>
AGJU	Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums
AIL	Ancient Israel and Its Literature
AJEC	Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity
AnBib	Analecta Biblica
ANEM	Ancient Near Eastern Monographs
ANTC	Abingdon New Testament Commentaries
AScR	<i>Annali di Scienze Religiose</i>
ASNP	<i>Annali della Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa</i>
ANTZ	Arbeiten zur neutestamentlichen Theologie und Zeitgeschichte
BARIS	British Archaeological Reports International Series
BBB	Bonner biblische Beiträge
BBR	<i>Bulletin for Biblical Research</i>
BCAW	Blackwell Companion to the Ancient World
BDB	Brown, Francis, S. R. Driver, and Charles A. Briggs. <i>A Hebrew and English Lexicon of the Old Testament</i> . Oxford: Clarendon, 1907.

BEATAJ	Beiträge zur Erforschung des Alten Testaments und des antiken Judentums
BECNT	Baker Exegetical Comentary on the New Testament
BETL	Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium
BGU	<i>Aegyptische Urkunden aus den Königlichen [later Staatlichen] Museen zu Berlin, Griechische Urkunden.</i> Berlin: Weidmann, 1895–.
BHQ	<i>Biblia Hebraica Quinta.</i> Edited by Adrian Schenker et al. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2004–.
<i>BibInt</i>	<i>Biblical Interpretation</i>
BibInt	Biblical Interpretation Series
BIFAO	<i>Bulletin de l'Institut français d'archéologie orientale</i>
BJS	Brown Judaic Studies
<i>BMusIn</i>	<i>The Collection of Ancient Greek Inscriptions in the British Museum.</i> Edited by Edward Lee Hicks, Charles Thomas Newton, Gustav Hirschfeld, and F. H. Marshall. 5 vols. Oxford: British Museum, 1874–1916.
BN	<i>Biblische Notizen</i>
BNTC	Black's New Testament Commentaries
BThSt	Biblich-theologische Studien
BWANT	Beiträge zur Wissenschaft vom Alten und Neuen Testament
BZABR	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für altorientalische und biblische Rechtsgeschichte
BZAW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
BZNW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche
CAH	Cambridge Ancient History
CBC	Cambridge Bible Commentary
CBET	Contributions to Biblical Exegesis and Theology
CBQMS	Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monograph Series
CEJL	Commentaries on Early Jewish Literature
CHANE	Culture and History of the Ancient Near East
CJAn	Christianity and Judaism in Antiquity
CIQ	<i>Classical Quarterly</i>
ConBNT	Coniectanea Biblica New Testament

CPJ	<i>Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum</i> . Edited by Victor A. Tcherikover. 3 vols. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1957–1964.
CRAIBL	<i>Comptes rendus des séances de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres</i>
CREJ	Collection de la Revue des études juives
CRINT	Compendia Rerum Iudaicarum ad Novum Testamentum
DCLS	Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Studies
DJD	Discoveries in the Judaean Desert
DSD	<i>Dead Sea Discoveries</i>
DULAT	Olmo Lete, Gregorio del, and Joaquín Sanmartín. <i>A Dictionary of the Ugaritic Language in the Alphabetic Tradition</i> . Translated and edited by Wilfred G. E. Watson. 3rd ed. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2015.
EBR	Klauck, Hans-Josef, et al., eds. <i>Encyclopedia of the Bible and Its Reception</i> . Berlin: de Gruyter, 2009–.
EDNT	Balz, Horst, and Gerhard Schneider, eds. <i>Exegetical Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . 3 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990–1993.
EDSS	Schiffman, Lawrence H., and James C. Vanderkam, eds. <i>Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls</i> . 2 vols. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
EHAT	Exegetisches Handbuch zum Alten Testament
EJL	Early Judaism and Its Literature
FAT	Forschungen zum Alten Testament
FNT	<i>Filología neotestamentaria</i>
frag(s).	fragment(s)
FRLANT	Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments
FSBP	Fontes et Subsidia ad Bibliam Pertinentes
GAT	Grundrisse zum Alten Testament
Gk	Greek
GKC	Gesenius, Wilhelm. <i>Gesenius' Hebrew Grammar</i> . Edited by Emil Kautzsch. Translated by Arthur E. Cowley. 2nd ed. Oxford: Clarendon, 1910.
HALOT	Koehler, Ludwig, Walter Baumgartner, and Johann J. Stamm. <i>The Hebrew and Aramaic Lexicon of the Old Testament</i> . Translated and edited under the super-

	vision of Mervyn E. J. Richardson. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2001.
HAT	Handbuch zum Alten Testament
HBAI	<i>Hebrew Bible and Ancient Israel</i>
HBM	Hebrew Bible Monographs
HCOT	Historical Commentary on the Old Testament
HCS	Hellenistic Culture and Society
HdO	Handbuch der Orientalistik
HDR	Harvard Dissertations in Religion
Heb	Hebrew
<i>Hen</i>	<i>Henoch</i>
HSCl	Harvard Studies in Comparative Literature
HThKAT	Herders theologischer Kommentar zum Alten Testament
<i>HTR</i>	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
HUCA	<i>Hebrew Union College Annual</i>
<i>HvTSt</i>	<i>HTS Theologies Studies/Theological Studies</i>
IBC	Interpretation, a Bible Commentary for Teaching and Preaching
IECOT	International Exegetical Commentary on the Old Testament
<i>IEJ</i>	<i>Israel Exploration Journal</i>
IG	<i>Inscriptiones Graecae</i> . Editio Minor. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1924–.
<i>IJO</i>	Noy, David, Alexander Panayotov, and Hanswulf Bloedhorn, eds. <i>Inscriptiones Judaicae Orientis</i> . 3 vols. TSAJ 99, 101, 102. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2004.
<i>Imm</i>	<i>Immanuel</i>
ISBL	Indiana Studies in Biblical Literature
<i>JAJ</i>	<i>Journal of Ancient Judaism</i>
JAJSup	Journal of Ancient Judaism Supplements
<i>JBL</i>	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JCPs	Jewish and Christian Perspectives Series
<i>JECS</i>	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>
<i>JHebS</i>	<i>Journal of Hebrew Scriptures</i>
<i>JIGRE</i>	Horbury, William, and David Noy. <i>Jewish Inscriptions of Graeco-Roman Egypt</i> . Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

- JIWE* Noy, David. *Jewish Inscriptions of Western Europe*. 2 vols. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993–1995.
- JJS* *Journal of Jewish Studies*
- Joüon Paul. *A Grammar of Biblical Hebrew*. Translated and revised by T. Muraoka. 2 vols. Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1991.
- JR* *Journal of Religion*
- JRASup* Journal of Roman Archaeology Supplement Series
- JSJ* *Journal for the Study of Judaism*
- JSJSup* Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism
- JSNTSup* Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
- JSOT* *Journal for the Study of the Old Testament*
- JSOTSup* Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series
- JSRC* Jerusalem Studies in Religion and Culture
- J SPL* *Journal for the Study of Paul and His Letters*
- JSPSup* Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Supplement Series
- JSSR* *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*
- JTS* *Journal of Theological Studies* New Series
- KBANT *Kommentare und Beiträge zum Alten und Neuen Testament*
- KStTh *Kohlhammer Studienbücher Theologie*
- KuI* *Kirche und Israel*
- Lane Edward W. *An Arabic-English Lexicon*. 8 vols. London: Williams & Norgate, 1863. Repr., Beirut: Libr. du Liban, 1980.
- LEC* Library of Early Christianity
- LHBOTS* Library of Hebrew Bible/Old Testament Studies
- LNTS* Library of New Testament Studies
- LSAM* Sokolowski, Franciszek. *Lois sacrées de l'Asie Mineure*. Ecole française d'Athènes. Travaux et mémoires 9. Paris: E. de Boccard, 1955.
- LSCG* Sokolowski, Franciszek. *Lois sacrées des cités grecques: Supplément*. Ecole française d'Athènes. Travaux et mémoires 11. Paris: E. de Boccard, 1962.

LSJ	Liddell, Henry George, Robert Scott, and Henry Stuart Jones. <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> . 9th ed. with revised supplement. Oxford: Clarendon, 1996.
LSTS	Library of Second Temple Studies
LTK	Buchberger, Michael, et al., eds. <i>Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche</i> . Freiburg im Breisgau: Herder, 1930–.
MS(S)	manuscript(s)
NCB	New Century Bible Commentary
NETS	Pietersma, Albert, and Benjamin G. Wright, eds. <i>A New English Translation of the Septuagint and the Other Translations Traditionally Included under That Title</i> . New York: Oxford University Press, 2007.
<i>Neot</i>	<i>Neotestamentica</i>
NHMS	Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies
<i>NIB</i>	<i>The New Interpreter's Bible</i> . Edited by Leander Keck. 12 vols. Nashville: Abingdon, 1994–2004.
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament
NICOT	New International Commentary on the Old Testament
<i>NovT</i>	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NovTSup	Supplements to Novum Testamentum
NSKAT	Neuer Stuttgarter Kommentar Altes Testament
NTL	New Testament Library
NTOA	Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus
NTS	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
OECT	Oxford Early Christian Texts
OTG	Old Testament Guides
OTL	Old Testament Library
OTS	Old Testament Studies
<i>PAAJR</i>	<i>Proceedings of the American Academy for Jewish Research</i>
PapyCol	Papyrologia Colonensia
P.Eleph.	<i>Aegyptische Urkunden aus den Königlichen Museen in Berlin: Griechische Urkunden, Sonderheft; Elephantine-Papyri</i> . Edited by O. Rubensohn. Berlin, 1907.
PFES	Publications of the Finnish Exegetical Society

PG	Patrologia Graeca. Edited by J.-P. Migen. 161 vols. Paris, 1857–1886.
PNTC	Pillar New Testament Commentary
P.Oxy.	<i>The Oxyrhynchus Papyri</i> . London: Egypt Exploration Society, 1898–.
P.Polit.Iud.	Cowey, James M. S., and Klaus Maresch. <i>Urkunden des Politeuma der Juden von Herakleopolis (144/3–133/2 v. Chr.) (P. Polit. Iud.): Papyri aus den Sammlungen von Heidelberg, Köln, München und Wien</i> . PapyCol 29. Wiesbaden: Westdeutscher, 2001.
PTSDSS	Princeton Theological Seminary Dead Sea Scrolls Project
PVTG	Pseudepigrapha Veteris Testamenti Graece
RB	<i>Revue Biblique</i>
RC	<i>Religion Compass</i>
RechAugPat	<i>Recherches Augustiniennes et Patristiques</i>
REJ	<i>Revue des études juives</i>
RelS	<i>Religious Studies</i>
RevQ	<i>Revue de Qumrân</i>
RGRW	Religions in the Graeco-Roman World
RHPR	<i>Revue d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses</i>
RTSR	Reflection and Theory in the Study of Religion
RVV	Religionsgeschichtliche Versuche und Vorarbeiten
SAPERE	Scripta Antiquitatis Posterioris ad Ethicam Religionemque pertinentia
SBAB	Stuttgarter biblische Aufsatzbände
SBLTT	Society of Biblical Literature Texts and Translations
SBT	Studies in Biblical Theology
SC	Sources chrétiennes
SCJud	Studies in Christianity and Judaism
SCS	Septuagint and Cognate Studies
SDSSRL	Studies in the Dead Sea Scrolls and Related Literature
SECA	Studies on Early Christian Apocrypha
Sem	<i>Semitica</i>
SemeiaSt	Semeia Studies
SFSHJ	South Florida Studies in the History of Judaism
sg.	singular
SGCA	Studi sul giudaismo e cristianesimo antico

SHBC	Smyth & Helwys Bible Commentary
SHR	Studies in the History of Religions (Supplements to Numen)
SJC	Studies in Judaism and Christianity
SJLA	Studies in Judaism and Late Antiquity
<i>SJOT</i>	<i>Scandinavian Journal of the Old Testament</i>
SKG.G	Schriften der Königsberger Gelehrten Gesellschaft, Geisteswissenschaftliche Klasse
SNTW	Studies of the New Testament and Its World
SP	Sacra Pagina
SPA.W.PH	Sitzungsberichte der Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin Philosophisch-Historische Klasse
SPhAMA	Studies in Philo of Alexandria and Mediterranean Antiquity
<i>SPhiloA</i>	<i>Studia Philonica Annual</i>
SPhiloM	Studia Philonica Monograph Series
SR	<i>Studies in Religion</i>
StCM	Studies in Christian Mission
STDJ	Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah
StPB	Studia Post-biblica
SubBi	Subsidia Biblica
<i>SVF</i>	Armin, Hans Friedrich August von. <i>Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta</i> . 4 vols. Leipzig: Teubner, 1903–1924.
SVTG	Septuaginta: Vetus Testamentum Graecum Auctoritate Academiae Scientiarum Gottingensis editum
SVTP	Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha
SymS	Symposium Series
<i>TAD</i>	Porten, Bezalel, and Ada Yardeni. <i>Textbook of Aramaic Documents for Ancient Egypt</i> . 4 vols. Jerusalem: Hebrew University, 1986–1999.
TB	Theologische Bücherei
TCSt	Text-critical Studies
<i>TDNT</i>	Kittel, Gerhard, and Gerhard Friedrich, eds. <i>Theological Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . Translated by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. 10 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964–1976.

<i>TDOT</i>	Botterweck, G. Johannes, Helmer Ringgren, Heinz-Josef Fabry, and Holger Gzella, eds. <i>Theological Dictionary of the Old Testament</i> . Translated by John T. Willis et al. 16 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1974–2018.
THKNT	Theologischer Handkommentar zum Neuen Testament
ThW	Theologische Wissenschaft
<i>TLOT</i>	Jenni, Ernst, and Claus Westermann, eds. <i>Theological Lexicon of the Old Testament</i> . Translated by Mark E. Biddle. 3 vols. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1997.
TSAJ	Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism
TUGAL	Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur
<i>TynBul</i>	<i>Tyndale Bulletin</i>
<i>TZ</i>	<i>Theologische Zeitschrift</i>
UALG	Untersuchungen zur antiken Literatur und Geschichte
UCPNES	University of California Publications Near Eastern Studies
UCPSP	University of California Publications in Semitic Philology
VC	<i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
VTSup	Supplements to Vetus Testamentum
WBC	Word Biblical Commentary
WGRW	Writings from the Greco-Roman World
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZA	<i>Zeitschrift für Assyriologie</i>
ZABR	<i>Zeitschrift für altorientalische und biblische Rechtsgeschichte</i>
ZAC	<i>Zeitschrift für antikes Christentum</i>
ZAW	<i>Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft</i>
ZNW	<i>Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde des Urchristentums</i>

SBL Press

Introduction: Discussing Torah in the Tuscan Hills

Jason M. Zurawski

The impetus for this volume came about during a conference I organized in 2015 with Luca Arcari and Gabriele Boccaccini at the University of Naples Federico II on “Second Temple Jewish *Paideia* in Its Ancient Near Eastern and Hellenistic Contexts.”¹ Over the course of a week discussing all things related to Jewish education during the Second Temple period, questions related to torah naturally came up quite a bit. This fact alone should not warrant any surprise. However, the different ways and contexts in which torah kept entering into the discussions and the different notions attached to the term became more and more interesting, and it soon became clear that not everyone was on the same page. This is not to say that some people were “wrong” and some “right” about how they understood the term or concept of torah (or *nomos*), just that different people had very different ideas and assumptions attached to the term, depending on one’s own particular focus, area of expertise, or angle of approach. At the concluding session of the meeting, where we all discussed openly together the insights gained from the previous days and potential future directions that could be fruitfully explored, this topic, torah, was an idea that most of the participants agreed needed further exploration and study from different vantage points than it has typically been studied in the past. One of the participants of the meeting was particularly interested in pursuing this further, William Schniedewind, which not surprising given much of his recent scholarship. Therefore, after many long and evolving discussions, we decided together to organize another conference devoted to the topic of torah. Ultimately, this meeting would be held as, “From *tôrâ* to Torah:

1. See now the volume Jason M. Zurawski and Gabriele Boccaccini, eds., *Second Temple Jewish Paideia in Context*, BZBW 228 (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2017).

Variegated Notions of Torah from the First Temple Period to Late Antiquity,” the ninth biennial Enoch Seminar.

One might reasonably ask why the subject torah in early Jewish culture and thought should be a desideratum given the breadth of scholarship on the topic in the history of research. What was clear, however, both to the participants in that Naples meeting and in reading much of that scholarship, was that all too often scholars were talking past one another due to differing perspectives or preconceptions or the individual aims of a particular study. What was needed, then, was not simply another new study on the topic or a collection of papers compiled in a void, but rather a conversation, a place where different views and voices could be heard and held in sustained dialogue with one another. The Enoch Seminar would provide the ideal venue for such a conversation.

The seminar took place June 18–23, 2017, with over forty invited participants. This group of experts was intentionally international—including scholars from Australia, Brazil, Canada, Denmark, England, Finland, France, Germany, Hong Kong, India, Israel, Italy, the Netherlands, Norway, Scotland, South Africa, Spain, and the United States—and interdisciplinary—including specialists in Hebrew Bible, New Testament, Dead Sea Scrolls, Second Temple Judaism, Septuagint, Samaritan studies, Hellenistic philosophy, late antique Judaism, and late antique Christianity. The site chosen for this meeting was the Monastero di Camaldoli, a favorite location for the Enoch Seminar. The Benedictine monastery, founded in the eleventh century by St. Romuald, is isolated in the dense forest of the massive Parco Nazionale Foreste Casentinesi, Monte Falterona, Campigna, in the hills bordering Tuscany and Emilia-Romagna, about seventy kilometers east of Florence. Travel to the monastery is not easy. Therefore, we had all of the participants meet at the Arezzo train station on Sunday afternoon and arranged for a bus to take us the rest of the way up to our home for the next several days. The slight inconvenience, however, was a small price to pay. The isolation of the monastery and the beautiful, natural surroundings would provide the ideal setting for five days of intense scholarly dialogue. This is undoubtedly one of the reasons why the Florentine Platonic Academy and its members, including Marsilio Ficino, Poliziano, and Pico della Mirandola, regularly met at the Monastero di Camaldoli in the fifteenth century.

The entire format of the Enoch Seminar is designed to promote intense dialogue on the topic and collegiality. The setting, of course, plays a crucial role. At Camaldoli, we all stayed at the same site and ate all of our meals

together. In this way, discussions that begin during actual sessions naturally carry over into a more relaxed setting over lunch or dinner or over drinks or coffee after dinner. These informal spaces often become the sites of some of the greatest insight.

Next, all of the papers circulated well in advance of the meeting. This way, all of the participants had ample opportunity to read closely and fully digest the range of papers that would be discussed. This also allows for the vast majority of time during the sessions to be devoted to discussion rather than to reading long papers. Short, ten-minute introductions by the paper authors were followed by brief responses and then roughly an hour of open discussion devoted to each of the major papers. The discussions were not simple question and answer sessions, but rather true conversations taking place among all of the participants about the paper and the insight it shed on the topic as a whole. In this way, many common threads continued to be taken up and reexamined in light of new perspectives, methods, or texts. The papers, thus, served as the fuel for a four-day-long conversation.

This is the backdrop to the present volume. After the seminar, all of the authors were asked to rework and revise their contributions in light of the responses and the overall discussion that took place prior to submitting them for the volume. All of the essays included here came out of the meeting in Camaldoli, save for those of Paula Fredriksen, Elisa Uusimäki, and Jonathan Vroom, all of whom had intended to participate in the Seminar but had to cancel. We are very thankful that they still decided to contribute to this volume.

The twenty-five enclosed essays are grouped into four parts, roughly chronologically based. Part 1 contains papers on “Notions of Torah in the Hebrew Bible, Samaritan Pentateuch, and Septuagint,” and here we can already see the wide range of approaches, methods, and conclusions, a crucial and purposeful aspect of the volume. William Schniedewind’s paper, “Diversity and Development of *tôrâ* in the Hebrew Bible,” serves as a fitting introduction to the first section of papers. Here he looks at both the diversity and development of torah within the Hebrew Bible as well as other early Jewish literature, trying to better understand the trajectory that gets torah from oral teaching to written text to, ultimately, a specific text, or, in Schniedewind’s terms, the textualization, scripturalization, and canonization of torah. Upon examining the pertinent evidence, he finds that these processes had already begun in the texts of the Hebrew Bible, though, importantly, they are ongoing, contested processes, underlined with tensions at every stage.

In “*Torah* as Speech Performance in the Hebrew Bible,” Jacqueline Vayntrub builds on the work of Bernd Schipper, Thomas Willi, and others, and argues that the term *torah* is better understood not as an oral or written object but rather as the process of instruction, in particular as a particular mode of speech performance. Vayntrub posits that the term *torah* and its verbal cognate *yrh* employ a metaphor of movement (“to cast”) to denote both horizontal (transgenerational) and vertical (divine to human) performance and transmission of speech. The term, thus, designates primarily the process of transmission through the performance and, secondarily, the content of the performance. Moving away from the sorts of teleological assumptions that have too often framed scholarship on the topic, Vayntrub suggests that we reframe the shift of *torah* from instruction to law not as an evolutionary conceptual shift, but rather a terminological shift that results from the Pentateuch’s later reception.

David Lambert, in his contribution “*Tôrâ* as Mode of Conveyance: The Problem with ‘Teaching’ and ‘Law,’” highlights some of the problems inherent in contemporary discussions on the nature of *torah*, which tend to focus either on *torah* as object, that is, as a text or body of revelation waiting to be discovered, or on *torah* as subject, that is, as later interpretations of an underlying object. Instead, Lambert suggests adopting Bruno Latour’s notions of “quasi-object” and “quasi-subject” in our attempt to understand the evolving nature of *torah* in the Hebrew Bible and the Second Temple period. *Torah* as quasi-object becomes an imagined object that adheres to the objective qualities of the Pentateuch. *Torah* as quasi-subject does not simply reflect on a stable underlying object but actually participates in the construction of an object. In this light, instead of seeing an evolutionary development from *torah* to Scripture, we find a continual production of new quasi-objects and quasi-subjects, each historically and culturally embedded, a process or mode of conveyance between beings, one placing a charge upon another.

Magnar Kartveit’s “Possible Ideological Tendencies in the MT, the LXX, and the SP” explores the polemics and apologetics in the different textual traditions of the Pentateuch, that is, in the Masoretic Text, the Septuagint, and the Samaritan Pentateuch. He shows the central importance the *torah* played in the different communities for issues of identity and self-defense, but also that the *torah* was seen as adaptable. It was considered legitimate to modify the text in order to reflect better the particular context of the community or in order to justify violence on those outside of the community.

In his “From *tôrâ* to *νόμος*: How the Use of *νόμος* in the Septuagint of the Pentateuch Enlightens the Process That Leads the Word *tôrâ* to the Concept of Torah,” Patrick Pouchelle explores the motivations for the translation of torah with *nomos* and what that translation might be able to tell us about the understanding of torah in the Egyptian diaspora. Pouchelle explores four related questions: (1) Is it possible to draw a sketch of the semantic field of *nomos* in Classical Greek, including papyrological and epigraphic material?; (2) Does the concept of torah (law?) as denoted by the word *tôrâ* in the Torah (Pentateuch) really fit the semantic field of *nomos*?; (3) Does the choice of the Greek translators to render *tôrâ* by *nomos* have something to do with the Aramaic word *dât*?; and (4) Does the difference between the LXX and MT shed additional light on the concept of the torah in the third century BCE? In the end, Pouchelle finds that the use of *nomos* in the LXX enlightens a specific period of the process that leads from *tôrâ* to Torah, a period when this process was still very much ongoing.

Oliver Dyma, in “Levites as Prophets and Scribes and Their Role in the Transmission of the Torah,” analyzes the role of Levites as scribes and the socio-historical setting of the production, collection, and curation of authoritative texts. For Dyma, the scribal activity of the Levites, the intellectual elite of the Persian and Hellenistic periods, may be seen as the unifying force that ultimately led to the canon. However, Dyma also challenges the indiscriminate ascription of a vast majority of texts to the Levites, which obscures the many and diverse currents and interests and other relevant educated groups with their own political and/or religious interests.

Part 1 ends with the contribution of James Watts, “From the *Torah* of Polluted and Inedible Meats to Diet as a Marker of Jewish Identity.” Watts explores why dietary laws became such prominent markers of Jewish identity. Watts argues that Lev 11 lays a foundation for linking diet and Jewish identity by explicitly grounding both in the interpretation of torah. Leviticus 11 does so by exhorting lay people not only to torah observance, but also to engage themselves in torah interpretation about the rationales for the rules of pure, polluted, and nauseating meats. The rhetoric of lay inclusion in reasoning about food impurities encouraged acceptance of the authority of the priestly hierarchy in other matters. It also turned diet into a symbol of lay fidelity to torah and of Israel’s status as the people of torah, in their own minds and increasingly in the perspective of outsiders as well. According to Watts, reasoning and interpretation of *torah* became an integral part of keeping torah.

Part 2, devoted to “Notions of Torah in Second Temple Judaism,” opens with Benjamin Wright’s “Where Is the Torah in Ben Sira?” Here Wright builds on the work of Claudia Camp, John Collins, and his own previous research in attempting to understand the exact nature of torah for Ben Sira, how it functions, how it figures in pedagogy, and how he employs it within his own rhetorical and contextual framework. In particular, Wright takes on a central paradox in the text, that Ben Sira seems to refer to torah as a written body of material to be read, studied, and followed, while, at the same time, never explicitly citing material from the Pentateuch and even contravening materials found therein. While for Ben Sira torah has come to him as a book, originating with God, transmitted by Moses, and inherited as part of the Israelite legacy, he positions himself as an authorizer of the torah. In this capacity, Ben Sira subsumes torah beneath the inherited wisdom tradition. Wisdom resides in torah as well as in the sapiential tradition and in creation, but the gatekeeper, framer, and purveyor of wisdom is the sage himself. He controls what gets taught and what gets transmitted to his students. While Ben Sira might not be concerned with all the details of the law, the torah still requires an authoritative mediator and interpreter, one who understands within his own torah/teaching. For Ben Sira, only the inspired sage who possesses the torah can fulfill that role.

In “The Normativity of Torah in Ezra-Nehemiah and Ben Sira,” Jonathan Vroom draws on legal theory to provide a more nuanced theoretical framework for understanding the nature of textual authority in Second Temple Judaism. Vroom’s concern here is not with how a text acquires authority but, rather, with distinguishing between two distinct types of authority—practical (i.e., commands) and epistemic (i.e., persuasion and education) and with identifying the normative impacts that each type of authority produces with its addressees.

In “Variegated Notions of Torah: The Law (*νόμος*) in the Prologue to Ben Sira,” Juan Carlos Ossandón Widow compares the notion of *nomos* in the prologue to Ben Sira to 4 Ezra’s view of torah. Ossandón distinguishes between two ways in which the prologue refers to *nomos*: (1) as a textual entity; and (2) as a normative teaching for life. As to how these two are related, he argues that according to the prologue, *nomos* as a textual entity implies that a text can be considered as a source providing a way of living and that reading itself is considered a means of living. In this way, the sapiential dimension of *nomos* takes precedence over the textual dimension, the latter providing the means to attain the goal but not the goal itself. While several of these aspects are shared in the apocalypse 4 Ezra,

the wisdom of torah in 4 Ezra is strongly connected to knowledge of the end times, a view absent from the prologue. In addition, unlike the prologue's textual dimension, torah in 4 Ezra transcends its written expression, existing prior to an actual text and, once rewritten, going well beyond the bounds of the Pentateuch to include ninety-four books, twenty-four for everyone, seventy for the wise alone.

Robert Hall's "Torah for Insight: Inquiry via Enigma" suggests that scribes investigated torah to gain insight and rewrote torah to provoke it. Just as Greeks probed enigma for insight and composed riddles to provoke discovery, so would Jews explore perplexities in torah and rewrite torah in order to elicit insight. Examples from Leviticus, Daniel, Proverbs, Habakkuk, Baruch, Ben Sira, the sayings of Jesus, and the letters of Paul show that the Jews, like the Greeks, studied riddles for insight, wrote riddles to provoke it, and investigated torah by inquiry via enigma. They are not modifying torah to replace it. They are joining torah to fulfill its purpose. Torah is given to conform human beings to realities they cannot see. They must conform not to what their minds can contain but to the ineffable realities to which torah points. Scribes write new torah not to replace the old but to offer new vantage points, new obstacles to trip one another up concerning the realities they seek, new windows into the torah flowing from God's thinking.

In "Torah and the Search for Wisdom in Hellenistic Judea," Elisa Uusimäki analyzes the ways in which sages and their pupils are associated with torah in texts from Hellenistic and early Roman Judea, in particular looking at Qoheleth, Ben Sira, the *maskil* materials from the Dead Sea Scrolls, and 4Q185 and 4Q525. Uusimäki demonstrates that multiple forms of torah piety regularly color the distinctive portrayals of Jewish intellectuals during this period, suggesting that this central symbol of Second Temple Judaism had made its way into the educational curriculum.

Gabriele Boccaccini demonstrates in "Torah and Apocalypticism in the Second Temple Period" that we cannot talk about one, unitary attitude toward the Mosaic torah in Jewish apocalyptic literature, as apocalypticism was by no means a unitary system of thought, and we find several different views of the torah within different strands of apocalyptic thought. In the early Enochic literature, we do not find, as some have argued, an anti-Mosaic movement. Instead, the spread of evil as described in those texts annuls the benefits of the Mosaic law and the possibility of righteousness until the eschaton. Jubilees, instead, represents how far the Mosaic law

could be incorporated into apocalyptic traditions, with the law given to Israel by God in order to protect them from the spread of evil. This would then lead to the development of an alternative halakah, as the Mosaic law, while valid, only represented in part that inscribed on the tablets of heaven. Daniel, yet another alternative, was able to combine covenantal and apocalyptic elements without such tension. Out of these traditions and their unique views on the law of Moses comes the early Jesus movement (from the Enochic side), where the problem of evil takes precedence over the effectiveness of the law, and texts like 4 Ezra and 2 Baruch, from the Danielic tradition, where adherence to the law, despite great suffering in this life, ensures salvation in the world to come.

Lutz Doering's "Torah and Halakah in the Hellenistic Period" suggests that, since Torah as Pentateuch was incapable on its own of structuring a regulated way of life due to its limited scope of laws, the legal tradition inspired by the Torah but independent from it must be considered in the overall discussion of the development of notions of torah during the Hellenistic and early Roman periods. Looking at evidence from both Palestine and the diaspora, both literary and material, Doering argues against the popular view that Judaism only became halakic after the period of the Maccabean revolt. While he acknowledges that the discourse certainly became more intense and rigorous beginning from the end of the second century BCE, he shows that there is significant evidence for halakic discourse in the early second century BCE if not earlier.

Francis Borchart's "Torah for the Moment: Understanding Torah in a Performative Context," questions the assumption that torah/nomos must be equated with the Pentateuch in the Hellenistic and early Roman period by looking in detail at the performative nature of torah in the Letter of Aristeas, with the scribes translating torah, in Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities*, where Mattathias the Hasmonean ancestor invents a new sabbath law, and in Philo, *On the Life of Moses*, who has Moses performing divine torah. The examples all demonstrate in their own unique ways how torah was thoroughly shaped by an authoritative performer of the tradition. In each case, torah is performed, some aspect of torah is manifestly changed by the performance, and the new performance is authenticated as torah; and, while in each torah might bear some relevance to text, it is by no means limited to a textual form. Instead torah exists as a performance, in text or in speech, authorized by an authoritative speaker and an accepting audience.

Joachim Schaper, in "The 'Stoic' Solomon: From Torah to *Nomos* via Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age, from the Perspective of the Wisdom of Sol-

omon,” looks at the oft-debated topic as to the exact nature of *nomos* in the Wisdom of Solomon. According to Schaper, the book of Wisdom did not amalgamate *nomos* with *sophia* as some in the past have claimed. Wisdom is not identical with *nomos*, but instead creates the conditions that enable one to adhere to *nomos*. Part of this move comes from the heavy influence of the Stoics on the author of Wisdom’s understanding of *sophia*; the two could not be equated because, as with the Stoics, wisdom is conceived of as a living being, made up of material *pneuma*, which, then, could not be identified with the noncorporeal *nomos*. The author does not offer a Stoicized view of universal law, as David Winston and others have claimed. The Stoicization of wisdom, however, offered a new view of wisdom that would prove quite useful in early Christian wisdom Christologies.

In “*Nomos* Human and Divine in the Wisdom of Solomon,” Michael Legaspi also explores the nature of “law” in the Wisdom of Solomon, though to quite different conclusions than Schaper. Breaking from past scholarship that has tended to view the understanding of *nomos* in either the particularistic sense of the Jewish national law code or the universalistic sense of the rational law of the cosmos, Legaspi argues that the distinction the text makes is not that between Jewish and non-Jewish law, but rather, in Plato’s terms, that between human *nomoi* and the divine *nomos*. In this light, the Wisdom of Solomon does not commend Judaism for its possession of the law of Moses but rather for the virtue and knowledge that originate from something higher, the divine gift of wisdom.

Part 2 closes with “From Torah to Torahization: A Biocultural Evolutionary Perspective,” where Anders Klostergaard Petersen argues for the necessity of understanding cultural developments, such as the transitions in the understanding of *torah*, in light of evolutionary thinking. Such a perspective helps to shed light on the transformations of *torah* from the period of Israelite religion to that of Judaic religion/Second Temple Judaism. Situating the different forms of Israelite/Judaic religion according to developments in urban and cosmic types of religion—or, in Bellah’s terminology, archaic and Axial age forms of religion—Petersen sees an increasing promotion of *torah* characterized by a shift from *torah* to *torahization* in some Second Temple stands of thought, that is, the enhanced ideological role *torah* was assigned to constitute in Judean daily life.

The third part of the volume is devoted to “Notions of Torah in the New Testament,” and the section begins with “Paul and Νόμος, and Broader Perspectives: Romans 13:8–10 as Case Study,” where Jeremy Punt approaches the role of the Jewish law within the Pauline Letters from a

cultural studies approach, which, he argues, helps to account more for the ritual and identity-formative function of *nomos* beyond traditional artificial theological binaries. In a period where individuals did not experience sociocultural, economic-political, or religious dimensions of their lives as if separate spheres, Punt argues that a cultural studies approach is better suited to appreciate the rhetorical use of *nomos* in the Pauline Letters, including its strong social or community-sustaining and identity-formative functions as seen in Rom 13:8–10, where torah commandments and emphasis on neighborly love are prioritized and made indicative for the identity of Jesus followers and foundational for the community of believers and its internal relationships.

Federico Dal Bo, in “Paul’s Definition of ‘Circumcision of the Heart’: A Transcultural Reading of Romans 2:28–29,” demonstrates that traditional and poststructuralist readings of the famous passage from Romans on the “circumcision of the heart” over that of the flesh, which have been used for centuries in supersessionist polemics, rely too strongly on reading Paul’s Greek within only a Greek contextual background where language and conceptuality necessarily coincide. A transcultural reading, however, taking into account Paul’s actual context and polyglot learning, reorients the text and demonstrates that the traditional oppositions no longer hold up. If one were to read the passage instead in a Semitic linguistic context, in Syriac or Modern Hebrew, we find a decisive shift: these are indeed uncircumcised and the law would command to discriminate against them, but the new message from God opposes this command and argues that those very people who are uncircumcised are true believers and shall eventually be praised by God.

In “Jewish Torah for a Gentile World: A Comparison of Pseudo-Phocylides and Paul Editing Torah and Adapting Ethics in Romans 12:9–21; 13:8–10,” Jason Myers places Paul’s exhortations in Rom 12:9–21 and 13:10–13 within the context of contemporary rhetoric and the construction of the maxim (*γνώμη*) as found in the *progymnasmata*, Aristotle, *Rhetorica ad Herennium*, and Jewish Hellenistic gnomic wisdom literature. In particular, he compares Paul’s ethics in those sections of the letter to the contemporaneous Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides and the use of the Hebrew Scriptures in its moral outlook. Through the comparison, Myers finds that the gnomic quality of the sections in Paul leads to four conclusions that challenge many past scholarly assumptions. First, this ethical material is directly tied to the community in Rome. Second, this material was not simply pulled haphazardly from different traditions

but, instead, was material from ancient sources reworked and interwoven into his broader ethical program. Third, through his construction of ethical sayings, Paul is also revealing his own character to his audience, building up his social profile among the Roman community. And fourth, Paul's summation of the Decalogue under a broad heading in Rom 13:8–10 is mirrored in many other Second Temple texts, such as Pseudo-Phocylides.

The final essay in part 3 is Calum Carmichael's "Jewish Legal Interpretation and the New Testament," which explores how contemporary first-century Jewish legal debates can help to explain episodes in New Testament texts which appear to depict Jesus counteracting halakic legislation. In particular, he looks at the incident in John 8 and the woman taken in adultery. As opposed to appealing to conscience, which cannot carry the day in legal interpretation, Carmichael interprets Jesus's stance in light of early rabbinic developments of the bitter water test, showing that Jesus's saying in John 8:7—"He that is without [sexual] sin among you, let him first cast a stone at her"—reflects a similar position, that males forfeit their right to judge a woman guilty of a sexual offense because of their own sexual blameworthiness.

Part 4, finally, explores "Notions of Torah in Late Antiquity" and opens with Michael Satlow's "The Status of the Torah in Late Antiquity." Satlow departs from recent studies on the torah in Late Antique Jewish thought by looking at whether Jews outside of the rabbinic orbit—the vast majority of Jews in late antiquity—shared the rabbinic understanding of Torah and its significance and whether Jewish use and veneration of the Torah was visible to non-Jews. Satlow explores this question by examining the non-rabbinic evidence, both archaeological and textual. In the end, he shows that the Torah did play a role in the wider Jewish communities, though one that differed significantly from that of the rabbis. The communities seem to have looked to the Torah as a source of legends and lore, as a numinous object, and for apotropaic functions. There is very little evidence to suggest that they turned to the Torah as a source of norms. Scripture served as a source of stories rather than of law; more value was placed on the Torah as a material object, a viewed that seemed to have frustrated early Christian writers like Justinian and John Chrysostom.

Next, in "Paul, Augustine, and the 'I' of Romans 7," Paula Fredriksen takes on the traditional theological (and scholarly) reading of Paul's lament of the divided self in Rom 7, that it expressed Paul's personal report on his own frustrations with the Jewish law, which, according to

tradition, was taken up by Augustine in the *Confessions* to describe his own spiritual struggles against the flesh and, ultimately laid the seedbed for Luther's tormented Paul. Fredriksen argues, instead, that this personal reading of the lament derives neither from Paul himself nor from the *Confessions* but from Augustine's campaign decades later against Pelagius, where the "I" of Rom 7 no longer refers to everyone before grace but now specifically to the Christian Paul after grace. Fredriksen then goes on to try to understand Paul's text, reading Paul not as the first "Christian" or a "Jew" who became a "Christian," but standing fully within the realm of Second Temple Jewish eschatological speculation. Following the work of Matthew Thiessen, Stanley Stowers, Runar Thorsteinsson, and others, Fredriksen argues that Paul, an "ethnic essentialist," is both addressing a primarily gentile audience in the letter and, strategically using the rhetorical device *prosopopoeia* or "speech-in-character," speaking here as a gentile, specifically as a *Judaizing* gentile. Paul's problem, then, is not with the law itself or even with Judaizing, but specifically with proselyte circumcision, in particular in light of his view on the imminently approaching end times when the nations will all come to worship the one God, but as nations, remaining non-Jews. The "I" of Rom 7, then, is the Judaizing gentile incapable of living according to the law until infused by the redemptive *pneuma* of Christ.

The volume concludes with Anne Kreps's "Tôrâ? Torah? Flora! Law and Book in Ptolemaeus Gnosticus's *Letter to Flora*." Kreps takes on the common scholarly view that Christianity was, from its inception, a literary movement, owing to the genetic relationship between Judaism and Christianity and to the assumed literariness of Second Temple Judaism and the writtleness of the Mosaic Torah. However, just as there were diverse views of torah during the period, so, Kreps argues, there were diverse ideas about gospel. Kreps looks at Ptolemy's *Letter to Flora*, in particular examining Ptolemy's theory of divine law contained therein. Her study places Ptolemy in the context of a wider ancient debate about the bookishness of divine law and considers the *Letter to Flora* in light of contemporary Christian ideas about the relationship between torah and gospel. Ptolemy's model of an imperfect law contained in imperfect writing provided license for Valentinian scriptural practice—a practice that approved of the generation of new, imperfect gospels. In the end, Kreps demonstrates that the way in which a second-century Christian understood the term *nomos*—capitalized or not, textual or not, fully divine or not—governed their definition of the concept "gospel."

As is evident, this collection of papers is purposefully wide-ranging, with the authors exploring and rethinking some of the most basic scholarly assumptions and preconceptions about the nature of torah in the period in light of new critical approaches and methodologies. The diversity and scope of the volume in terms of source materials—including texts from the Hebrew Bible, the Septuagint translations, the Samaritan Pentateuch, the New Testament, the Dead Sea Scrolls, Jewish Hellenistic literature, and late antiquity—and approaches—including philological, historical-critical, cultural-historical, transcultural, postcolonial, biocultural evolutionary, material studies, and performance studies—is one of its great benefits. The viewpoints and conclusions are refreshingly varied and diverse. The aim of the conference and of this volume was not to solve the problem of torah by developing another static, normative view, but rather to see how different vantage points and different conclusions can better address the complexity of the topic and better reflect the ambiguity and fluidity inherent in the concept itself.

Bibliography

Zurawski, Jason M., and Gabriele Boccaccini, eds. *Second Temple Jewish Paideia in Context*. BZBW 228. Berlin: de Gruyter, 2017.

SBL Press