

Society of Biblical Literature



Writings from the Greco-Roman World Supplement Series

Ronald F. Hock Series Editor

Number 5

ROME AND RELIGION: A CROSS-DISCIPLINARY DIALOGUE ON THE IMPERIAL CULT

A Cross-Disciplinary Dialogue on the Imperial Cult

Edited by

Jeffrey Brodd and Jonathan L. Reed

Society of Biblical Literature Atlanta

Copyright © 2011 by the Society of Biblical Literature

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, Society of Biblical Literature, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Rome and religion : a cross-disciplinary dialogue on the imperial cult / edited by Jeffrey Brodd and Jonathan L. Reed.

p. cm. — (Society of Biblical Literature writings from the greco-roman world supplement series ; v. 5)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-58983-612-9 (paper binding : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-1-58983-613-6 (electronic format)

1. Rome—Religion. 2. Emperor worship—Rome. 3. Church history—Primitive and early church, ca. 30-600. I. Brodd, Jeffrey. II. Reed, Jonathan L.

BL805.R66 2011

292.1'721—dc23

2011034302

Printed on acid-free, recycled paper conforming to ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (R1997) and ISO 9706:1994 standards for paper permanence.



Contents

List	of Figures	vii
For	eword	ix
Abł	previations	xi
	Part 1: Methodological and Theoretical Issues	
1.	The Cult of the Roman Emperor: Uniter or Divider?, Karl Galinsky	1
2.	Normal Religion, or, Words Fail Us: A Response to Karl Galinsky's "The Cult of the Roman Emperor: Uniter or Divider?," <i>Steven J. Friesen</i>	23
3.	To Complicate Encounters: A Response to Karl Galinsky's "The Cult of the Roman Emperor: Uniter or Divider?," <i>James Constantine Hanges</i>	27
4.	Religion, Roman Religion, Emperor Worship, Jeffrey Brodd	35
5.	Augustan Religion: From Locative to Utopian, Eric M. Orlin	49
	Part 2: The Imperial Cult at Specific Sites	
6.	Imperial Cult in Roman Corinth: A Response to Karl Galinsky's "The Cult of the Roman Emperor: Uniter or Divider?," <i>Barbette Stanley</i> <i>Spaeth</i>	61
7.	Embedding Rome in Athens, Nancy Evans	83
8.	Honoring Trajan in Pergamum: Imperial Temples in the "Second City," <i>Daniel N. Schowalter</i>	99
9.	Searching for Rome and the Imperial Cult in Galilee: Reassessing Galilee-Rome relations (63 B.C.E. to 70 C.E.), <i>James S. McLaren</i>	111
	Part 3: Christian and Jewish Engagement	
10.	Roman Imperial Power: A Perspective from the New Testament, <i>Warren Carter</i>	137

11.	The Emperor as Christ and Christian Iconography, Robin M. Jensen	153
12.	Capitalizing on the Imperial Cult: Some Jewish Perspectives, L. Michael White	173
	Part 4 : Prospects and Responses	
13.	In the Shadow (or not) of the Imperial Cult: A Cooperative Agenda, <i>Karl Galinsky</i>	215
14.	Response to Karl Galinsky, "In the Shadow (or Not) of the Imperial Cult: A Cooperative Agenda," <i>H. Gregory Snyder</i>	227
15.	Response to Galinsky, White, and Carter, Nancy Evans	235
List	of Contributors	241
Subject Index		243
Ind	ex of Ancient Sources	255

vi

LIST OF FIGURES

Chapter Six

- 6.1. Plan of Forum of Roman Corinth. *Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, C. K. Williams II.*
- 6.2. Plan of Roman Corinth. *Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, C. K. Williams II.*
- 6.3. Statue of Augustus from Julian Basilica: S-1116. *Courtesy of the American* School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, I. Ioannidou-L. Bartzioti.
- 6.4. Statue of Gaius Caesar from Julian Basilica: S-1065. Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, I. Ioannidou-L. Bartzioti.
- 6.5. Fragmentary Statue of Lucius Caesar from Julian Basilica: S-1080. Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, I. Ioannidou-L. Bartzioti.
- 6.6. Base of the Monument of the Augustales in Forum. *Courtesy of Margaret Laird*.
- 6.7. Reconstruction of Monument of the Augustales in Forum. *Courtesy of Margaret Laird.*
- 6.8. Corinthian Coin with the Nero (obv.) and Genius Coloniae (rev). Corinth6, nr. 57. Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, P. Dellatolas.
- 6.9. Corinthian Coin with Fortuna Coloniae crowning Nero. *Corinth* 6, no. 54. *Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, P. Dellatolas.*
- 6.10. Perspective Reconstruction of Scaenae Frons of Theater with Sculptural Assemblage. *Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, J. A. Herbst.*
- 6.11. Head of Trajan from Theatre. S-364/3660/3700/unnumbered fragment. *Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, I. Ioannidou-L. Bartzioti.*
- 6.12. Portrait Head of Faustina the Younger from Southwest Area of the Forum. S-2702. Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, I. Ioannidou-L. Bartzioti.

- 6.13. Corinthian Coin with Livia as Ceres. *RPC* 1.2, nr. 1150. *Photo Credit: bpk, Berlin / Muenzkabinett, Staatliche Kunstsammlungen, Dresden, Germany / Art Resource, NY.*
- 6.14. Detail of Mosaic from Floor of Central Temple in Sanctuary of Demeter and Kore. *Courtesy of the American School of Classical Studies, Corinth Excavations, I. Ioannidou-L. Bartzioti..*

Chapter Eight

- 8.1. Acropolis of Pergamum from the southwest. *All photos courtesy of Daniel N. Schowalter (author).*
- 8.2. Vaulted chambers supporting the Trajaneum platform.
- 8.3. *Anastylosis* of the Trajaneum by the German Archaeological Institute.
- 8.4. Reconstructed entablature of the Trajaneum.

Chapter Eleven

- 11.1. The Good Shepherd, from the Catacomb of Callixtus, Crypt of Lucina, mid-third century C.E., Rome. *Photo credit: Estelle Brettman, copyright International Catacomb Society.*
- 11.2. Apse mosaic from the Mausoleum of Sta. Contanza, mid-fourth century C.E., Rome. *Photo credit: Robin M. Jensen (author).*
- 11.3. Passion sarcophagus, ca. 340 C.E., Rome. Now in the Museo Pio Cristiano, Vatican Museums. *Photo credit: Vanni/Art Resource, New York.*
- 11.4. Sarcophagus with central christogram mounted on a cross, ca. 340–350 c.e., Rome. Now in the Museo Pio Cristiano, Vatican Museums. *Photo credit: Alinari/Art Resource, New York.*
- 11.5. Coin (*nummus*) of Constantine I, 319–320 C.E. *Photo courtesy of the American Numismatic Society.*
- 11.6. Christian funerary epitaph, mid-fourth century C.E., Rome (Basilica of San Lorenzo fuori le mura). *Photo credit: Robin M. Jensen (author)*.
- 11.7. Coin (*nummus*) of Constantine I, 327–328 c.e. *Photo courtesy of the American Numismatic Society.*
- 11.8. Prizes of the Pancratium, detail from a Roman mosaic of the spectacles from Batten Zamour, mid-fourth century c.e. Now in the Musée Archeologique, Gafsa, Tunisia. *Photo credit: Gilles Mermet/Art Resource, New York.*
- 11.9. Dome mosaic, Neonian (Orthodox) Baptistery, Ravenna, ca. mid-fifth century C.E. *Photo credit: Robin M. Jensen (author)*.
- 11.10. Dome mosaic, baptistery of Sta. Restituta, Naples, early-fifth century C.E. *Photo credit: Robin M. Jensen (author).*
- 11.11. Sarcophagus with magi and Daniel, mid-fourth century c.E., Rome. Now in the Museo Pio Cristiano, Vatican Museums. *Photo credit: Vanni/Art Resource, New York.*

viii

Foreword

Formally speaking, this *Cross-Disciplinary Dialogue on the Imperial Cult* is the print version of an actual dialogue that took place over the course of one year, during sessions at three meetings of the Society of Biblical Literature—the 2008 Annual Meeting in Boston, the 2009 International Meeting in Rome, and the 2009 Annual Meeting in New Orleans. These sessions were jointly sponsored by the Society for Ancient Mediterranean Religions and three SBL program units: Archaeology of Religion in the Roman World, Art and Religions of Antiquity, and Greco-Roman Religions. Beyond these formal settings, in a very real sense and in keeping with the vision of the various presenters, the dialogue continues and the number of participants increases.

The catalyst for the dialogue was Karl Galinsky, Floyd Cailloux Centennial Professor of Classics at the University of Texas and recipient of the Max Planck Research Award for studies of history and memory. He initiated the cross-disciplinary conversation in Boston with a paper titled *The Roman Cult of the Emperor: Uniter or Divider?* Respondents at that session and subsequently in Rome focused on theory, method, archaeology, epigraphy, and art as they relate to the study of the imperial cult. Finally, at New Orleans, most of the papers focused specifically on the relationship of early Christianity and Judaism to the imperial cult. Professor Galinsky's second paper, *In the Shadow (or not) of the Imperial Cult: A Cooperative Agenda*, together with responses, served to conclude the series.

Along with being both catalyst and closer, Karl Galinsky brought to the dialogue an extraordinary depth and breadth of learning with regard to the imperial cult. A leading authority on imperial Rome, he is author of Princeton University Press's *Augustan Culture*, a landmark synthesis and interpretation of Augustus's rule based on literary, artistic, and archaeological evidence; he edited *The Cambridge Companion to the Age of Augustus* (2005); and his biography of Augustus is about to be published by Cambridge University Press. A University Distinguished Teaching Professor, Professor Galinsky has directed several National Endowment for the Humanities Summer Seminars at the American Academy in Rome on the topic of Roman religion and culture, which have also included and profoundly influenced several SBL members over the years.

The goal of this project was to bring together classicists, biblical and religious scholars, historians, and archaeologists to discuss the study of religions in

a Roman context, using as a focal point the imperial cult. This topic has been especially prominent of late in New Testament studies, fueled in large measure by the prolific writings of Richard Horsley and under the influence of John Dominic Crossan. Behind this intense interest in the Roman imperial cult are trends in both academia and realities in geopolitics. Among them are the impact of postcolonial studies, debates over the "new Paul," the recognition of the interconnectedness of religion and politics, and the serious treatment of archaeological and art historical evidence. Yet even as interest in the imperial cult is resurrected after Adolf Deissmann's *Licht vom Osten* from over a century ago, we wonder about excesses or mischaracterizations of the phenomenon among New Testament scholars, and more specifically about what happens when the imperial cult is examined not exclusively and over against the Pauline Christ cult, but within the broader context of Roman religion, the study of ancient Mediterranean culture and society generally, and the rise of Christianity in its Roman context over the long haul.

One of the main themes emerging from this dialogue involves the diversity of the imperial cult (prompting some participants to prefer the plural "imperial cults"). As Karl Galinsky points out in his opening paper, this diversity is easily—and too oftentimes—missed: "It is inevitable that in this nascent atmosphere of contextualizing the New Testament with the Roman Empire the latter in particular often comes across as more monolithic and undifferentiated than it was in actuality. This in part due to one impetus behind the new interpretive direction, that is to mark out the Gospels and Paul's letters as anti-imperial, if not anticolonial, because today 'empire' has the predominant connotations of oppression, injustice, and colonialism. Empire, *ipso facto*, is evil empire..." (p. 2).

This theme of diversity sets the stage for the volume's wide-ranging treatment of issues and interrelated themes. Attending to a variety of spatial locales (e.g. Corinth, Athens, Pergamum, Galilee), to a rich array of Jewish and Christian phenomena, and to pertinent theoretical and methodological concerns, the authors explore a spectrum of aspects radiating outward from the central connecting phenomenon of imperial cult, while looking across disciplines. Most of the papers in this volume interact with one another, and retain aspects of their presentation in oral form. In other words, this print rendition remains essentially a dialogue, a dialogue that the reader is invited to join.

Abbreviations

Ancient Authors and Texts

Appian, Mith.	Mithridates
Apuleius, Metam.	Metamorphoses
Arrian, Anab.	Anabasis
Athenaeus, Deipn.	Deipnosophistae
Athenagoras, Leg.	Legatio pro Christianis
Cod. theod.	Codex Theodosianus
Cyprian, Laps.	De lapsis
Dig.	Digesta
Eusebius, Vit. Const.	Vita Constantini
Herodotus, Hist.	Historiae
Horace, Carm.	Carmena
Jerome, Epist.	Epistulae
Josephus, A.J.	Antiquitates judaicae
Josephus, B.J.	Bellum judaicum
Josephus, Vita	Vita
Justin, 1 Apol.	Apologia 1
Lactantius, Mort.	De morte persecutorum
Pausanias, Descr.	Graeciae description
Philo, <i>Legat</i> .	Legatio ad Gaium
Philo, Mos. 1, 2	De vita Mosis I, II
Plato, Resp.	Respublica
Pliny the Elder, Nat.	Naturalis historia
Pliny the Younger, Ep.	Epistulae
Plutarch, Ant.	Antonius
Plutarch, Demetr.	Demetrius
Plutarch, Sull.	Sulla
Prudentius, Cath.	Cathemerinon
Res gest. divi Aug.	(Augustus) Res Gestae divi Augusti
Strabo, <i>Geog</i> .	Geographica
Suetonius, Aug.	Divus Augustus
Tacitus, Ann.	Annales

Tertullian, Apol.	Apologeticus
Tertullian, Cor.	De corona militis

Periodicals, Series, and Collections

AB	Anchor Bible
ABull	The Art Bulletin
ACW	Ancient Christian Writers
AE	<i>L'année</i> épigraphique
Aeg	Aegyptus
AGJU	Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des
	Urchristentums
AHR	American Historical Review
AJA	American Journal of Archaeology
AJP	American Journal of Philology
ANRW	Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt
ANSMN	American Numismatic Society Museum Notes
ARIDSup	Analecta Romana Instituti Danici Supplementum
BCHSup	Bulletin de correspondance hellénique. Supplement
BibInt	Biblical Interpretation
BJS	Brown Judaic Studies
BMC	British Museum Catalogue of Greek Coins
BR	Biblical Research
CAH	Cambridge Ancient History
CBQ	Catholic Biblical Quarterly
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum: Series latina
CSEL	Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum
CH	Church History
CIG	Corpus inscriptionum graecarum
CIJ	Corpus inscriptionum judaicarum
CIL	Corpus inscriptionum latinarum
CJ	Classical Journal
CSEL	Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum
CSJH	Chicago Studies in the History of Judaism
GNS	Good News Studies
HDR	Harvard Dissertations in Religion
Hermeneia	Hermeneia: a critical and historical commentary on the Bible
HTR	Harvard Theological Review
HTS	Harvard Theological Studies
IBerenike	Joyce Reynolds, "Inscriptions," in Excavations at Sidi
	Khrebish Benghazi (Berenice). Vol. 1: Buildings, Coins,
	Inscriptions, Architectural Decoration (ed. J. A. Lloyd)

xii

ABBREVIATIONS

IEJ	Israel Exploration Journal
IG	Inscriptiones graecae
IGR	Inscriptiones graecae ad res romanas pertinentes
INJ	Israel Numismatic Journal
Int	Interpretation
ΙνΕ	Die Inscriften von Ephesos
IvP	Die Inschriften von Pergamon
JAAR	Journal of the American Academy of Religion
JAF	Journal of American Folklore
JBL	Journal of Biblical Literature
JEH	Journal of Ecclesiastical History
JMS	Journal of Mithraic Studies
JQR	Jewish Quarterly Review
JR	Journal of Religion
JRASup	Journal of Roman Archaeology Supplementary Series
JRS	Journal of Roman Studies
JRSM	Journal of Roman Studies Monographs
JSJ	Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian,
	Hellenistic, and Roman Period
JSNT	Journal for the Study of the New Testament
JSNTSup	Journal for the Study of the New Testament: Supplement
_	Series
JTS	Journal of Theological Studies
LHBOTS	Library of Hebrew Bible/Old Testament Studies
LSTS	Library of Second Temple Studies
MAMA	Monumenta Asiae Minoris Antiqua
MH	Museum helveticum
NovT	Novum Testamentum
NovTSup	Supplements to Novum Testamentum
NTS	New Testament Studies
OGIS	Orientis graeci inscriptiones selectae
PCPhS	Proceedings of the Cambridge Philological Society
REL	Revue des études latines
SBLRBS	Society of Biblical Literature Resources for Biblical Study
SBLSymS	Society of Biblical Literature Symposium Series
ScAnt	Scienze dell'Antichità
SEG	Supplementum epigraphicum graecum
SemeiaSt	Semeia Studies
SIG	W. Dittenberger, ed., Sylloge inscriptionum graecarum. 4
	vols. Chicago: Ares, 1999.
SJLA	Studies in Judaism in Late Antiquity
SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
Spec	Speculum

xiv	ROME AND RELIGION
TAPA	Transactions of the American Philological Association
TSAJ	Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum
USQR	Union Seminary Quarterly Review
VCSup	Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae
WGRWSup	Writings from the Greco-Roman World Supplement Series
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZAC	Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum
ZPE	Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik