

PAUL AND SCRIPTURE

SBL

Society of Biblical Literature



Early Christianity and Its Literature

General Editor

Gail R. O'Day

Editorial Board

Warren Carter

Beverly Roberts Gaventa

Judith M. Lieu

Joseph Verheyden

Sze-kar Wan

Number 9

PAUL AND SCRIPTURE
Extending the Conversation

PAUL AND SCRIPTURE

EXTENDING THE CONVERSATION

Edited by

Christopher D. Stanley

Society of Biblical Literature
Atlanta

PAUL AND SCRIPTURE
Extending the Conversation

Copyright © 2012 by the Society of Biblical Literature

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, Society of Biblical Literature, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Paul and scripture : extending the conversation / edited by Christopher D. Stanley.

p. cm. — (Early Christianity and its literature ; number 9)

“This book marks the final chapter in the work of the Paul and Scripture Seminar, which operated for six years under the aegis of the Annual Meeting of the Society of Biblical Literature (2005–2010)”—Chapter 1.

ISBN 978-1-58983-694-5 (paper binding : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-1-58983-695-2 (electronic format)

1. Paul, the Apostle, Saint—Theology—Congresses. 2. Bible. N.T. Epistles of Paul—Criticism, interpretation, etc.—Congresses. I. Stanley, Christopher D. II. Series: Early Christianity and its literature ; no. 9.

BS2651.P295 2012b

270'.06—dc23

2012027355

Printed on acid-free, recycled paper conforming to
ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (R1997) and ISO 9706:1994
standards for paper permanence.



CONTENTS

Abbreviationsvii

Introduction

Christopher D. Stanley..... 1

PART 1: THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT

By the Letter? Word for Word? Scriptural Citation in Paul

Leonard Greenspoon.....9

Identity, Memory, and Scriptural Warrant: Arguing Paul's Case

Jeremy Punt25

Paul among the Storytellers: Reading Romans 11 in the Context of Rewritten Bible

Bruce N. Fisk55

PART 2: TEXT AND CONTEXT

Does Paul Respect the Context of His Quotations?

Steve Moyise97

Respect for Context and Authorial Intention: Setting the Epistemological Bar

Mitchell Kim115

Latency and Respect for Context: A Response to Mitchell Kim

Steve Moyise131

PART 3: BEYOND THE *HAUPTBRIEFE*

Paul's Reliance on Scripture in 1 Thessalonians
E. Elizabeth Johnson143

The Use of Scripture in Philippians
Stephen Fowl.....163

Writing “in the Image” of Scripture: The Form and Function of
References to Scripture in Colossians
Jerry L. Sumney185

PART 4: SCRIPTURE IN PAUL'S THEOLOGY

Scripture and Other Voices in Paul's Theology
Linda L. Belleville.....233

Beyond Hays's *Echoes of Scripture in the Letters of Paul*: A Proposed
Diachronic Intertextuality with Romans 10:16 as a Test Case
Matthew W. Bates263

Approaching Paul's Use of Scripture in Light of Translation Studies
Roy E. Ciampa.....293

PART 5: CONCLUSIONS

What We Learned—and What We Didn't
Christopher D. Stanley.....321

Contributors.....331

Index of Ancient Sources.....335

Index of Modern Authors.....353

ABBREVIATIONS

PRIMARY SOURCES

<i>Adv. Jud.</i>	Tertullian, <i>Adversus Judaeos</i>
<i>Ant.</i>	Josephus, <i>Jewish Antiquities</i>
Apoc. Ab.	Apocalypse of Abraham
<i>1 Apol.</i>	Justin Martyr, <i>Apologia i</i>
<i>C. Ap.</i>	Josephus, <i>Contra Apionem</i>
CD	Damascus Document
<i>Comm. Rom.</i>	Origen, <i>Commentarii in Romanos</i>
<i>Conf.</i>	Philo, <i>De confusione linguarum</i>
<i>Dial.</i>	Justin Martyr, <i>Dialogus cum Tryphone</i>
1 En.	1 Enoch (Ethiopic Apocalypse)
2 En.	2 Enoch (Slavonic Apocalypse)
3 En.	3 Enoch (Hebrew Apocalypse)
<i>Epid.</i>	Irenaeus, <i>Epideixis tou apostolikou kērgymatos</i>
<i>Fug.</i>	Philo, <i>De fuga et inventione</i>
<i>Haer.</i>	Irenaeus, <i>Adversus haereses</i>
Jub.	Jubilees
<i>J.W.</i>	Josephus, <i>Jewish War</i>
<i>L.A.B.</i>	Pseudo-Philo, <i>Liber antiquitatum biblicarum</i>
<i>Leg.</i>	Philo, <i>Legum allegoriae</i>
Let. Aris.	Letter of Aristeas
<i>Prax.</i>	Tertullian, <i>Adversus Praxeian</i>
Pss. Sol.	Psalms of Solomon
<i>Somn.</i>	Philo, <i>De somniis</i>
<i>Spec.</i>	Philo, <i>De specialibus legibus</i>
<i>Spec. Laws</i>	Philo, <i>On the Special Laws</i>
T. Dan	Testament of Dan
T. Levi	Testament of Levi
t. Sukkah	Tosefta Sukkah

<i>Test.</i>	Cyprian, <i>Ad Quirinum testimonia adversus Judaeos</i> ; Pseudo-Gregory of Nyssa, <i>Testimonies against the Jews</i>
Tg. Onq.	Targum Onqelos

SECONDARY SOURCES

AB	Anchor Bible
ANF	<i>The Ante-Nicene Fathers</i> . Edited by Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson. 10 vols. 1885–1887. Repr., Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1994.
ANTC	Abingdon New Testament Commentaries
BBR	<i>Bulletin for Biblical Research</i>
BDF	F. Blass, A. Debrunner, and R. W. Funk, <i>A Greek Grammar of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature</i> . Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961.
BFCT	Beiträge zur Förderung christlicher Theologie
BHT	Beiträge zur historischen Theologie
BIS	Biblical Interpretation Series
BNTC	Black's New Testament Commentaries
BTB	<i>Biblical Theology Bulletin</i>
BZAW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
BZNW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
CBQ	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
CRINT	Compendia rerum iudaicarum ad Novum Testamentum
CTJ	<i>Calvin Theological Journal</i>
EKKNT	Evangelisch-katholischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
FC	Fathers of the Church
FRLANT	Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments
HNT	Handbuch zum Neuen Testament
HUCA	<i>Hebrew Union College Annual</i>
IBS	<i>Irish Biblical Studies</i>
<i>Int</i>	<i>Interpretation</i>
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JQR	<i>Jewish Quarterly Review</i>

<i>JSJ</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Periods</i>
<i>JSNT</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the New Testament</i>
JSNTSup	Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
<i>JSOT</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the Old Testament</i>
<i>JSP</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha</i>
JSPSup	Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Supplement Series
<i>JTS</i>	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
KNT	Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
LEC	Library of Early Christianity
LSJ	Liddell, H. G., R. Scott, and H. S. Jones, <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> . 9th ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996.
NA ²⁷	<i>Novum Testamentum Graece</i> , Nestle-Aland, 27th ed.
<i>Neot</i>	<i>Neotestamentica</i>
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament
NIDNTT	<i>New International Dictionary of New Testament Theology</i>
NIGTC	New International Greek Testament Commentary
<i>NovT</i>	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NovTSup	Supplements to <i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NTM	New Testament Monographs
<i>NTS</i>	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
OTL	Old Testament Library
PG	Patrologia graeca [= <i>Patrologiae cursus completus: Series graeca</i>]. Edited by J.-P. Migne. 162 vols. Paris: Migne, 1857–1886.
<i>PRSt</i>	<i>Perspectives in Religious Studies</i>
<i>RB</i>	<i>Revue biblique</i>
SBLDS	Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series
SBLMS	Society of Biblical Literature Monograph Series
SBLSCS	Society of Biblical Literature Septuagint and Cognate Studies
SBLSymS	Society of Biblical Literature Symposium Series
SBLWGRW	Society of Biblical Literature Writings from the Greco-Roman World

SC	Sources chrétiennes
SemeiaSt	Semeia Studies
SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
SP	Sacra pagina
SUNT	Studien der Umwelt des Neuen Testaments
<i>TDNT</i>	<i>Theological Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . Edited by G. Kittel and G. Friedrich. Translated by G. W. Bromiley. 10 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964–1976.
THKNT	Theologischer Handkommentar zum Neuen Testament
ThSt	Theologische Studien
TLG	Thesaurus linguae graecae
<i>TLZ</i>	<i>Theologische Literaturzeitung</i>
TSAJ	Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism
UBS ⁴	<i>The Greek New Testament</i> , United Bible Societies, 4th ed.
WBC	World Biblical Commentary
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZBK	Zürcher Bibelkommentare

INTRODUCTION

Christopher D. Stanley

This book marks the final chapter in the work of the Paul and Scripture Seminar, which operated for six years under the aegis of the annual meeting of the Society of Biblical Literature (2005–2010). A collection of essays from the first three years of the seminar, together with a few other articles that were commissioned to round out the discussion, was published in 2008 under the title *As It Is Written: Studying Paul's Use of Scripture*.¹ The present volume continues the conversation with essays from the last three years of the seminar and some additional articles that were written specifically for this collection. Taken together, the two volumes provide a thorough and well-rounded analysis of the key issues that have dominated scholarly debate in this area for the last two centuries while also opening up a number of new avenues for future scholarly investigation.

The Paul and Scripture Seminar was created to provide a venue for a select group of scholars to discuss (and attempt to resolve) a range of methodological problems that had arisen in the last few decades to complicate research into the apostle Paul's many and varied references to the Jewish Scriptures.² In previous generations, scholars shared many common ideas about which questions mattered and how one might go about resolving them, even when they disagreed in their conclusions. In recent years, however, scholarship on Paul's use of Scripture has grown increasingly fragmented. Scholars not only use different methods but ground their studies on different presuppositions. Some are convinced that Paul's explicit

1. Stanley E. Porter and Christopher D. Stanley, eds., *As It Is Written: Studying Paul's Use of Scripture* (SBLSymS 50; Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2008).

2. For an overview of the kinds of methodological problems that have frequently stymied progress in this area, see Christopher D. Stanley, "Paul and Scripture: Charting the Course," in Porter and Stanley, *As It Is Written*, 3–12.

quotations provide the best insights into his engagement with the ideas and language of Scripture, while others find it more beneficial to study his allusions and echoes or his use of biblical narratives. Some assert that Paul expected his audiences to know and supply the context of his quotations, allusions, and echoes, while others reject this presumption as unhistorical. Some insist that Paul's frequent references to Scripture reveal how profoundly his ideas were shaped by the biblical tradition, while others argue that Paul cited Scripture primarily for rhetorical effect.

Because of these and other fundamental differences over questions of method, dialogue among scholars working in this area has become increasingly difficult. Instead of examining the relative strengths and weaknesses of various modes of analysis, scholars more often simply talk past one another. Papers are presented and books and articles written with little or no effort to justify the methods and presumptions that are used. Scholars who approach the subject using different methods are either dismissed or ignored. Most of the discussion takes place among people who share common methodologies and presuppositions, with little conversation across methodological lines. Progress is made in particular areas, but little is done to integrate the findings into a coherent whole or to examine places where the use of different methods or presuppositions might lead to different conclusions.

The Paul and Scripture Seminar devoted six years to a methodical examination of the principle methodological questions that have divided scholars working in this area. The seminar began with approximately twenty members, but the membership changed over the years as some participants moved on to pursue other interests and new voices joined the discussion. Not all of the members prepared papers for the seminar; some were content to participate in the oral phase of the program, which involved discussing papers that were circulated in advance of each year's sessions. The discussions were consistently lively and engaging, and by the end of six years the members had addressed virtually all of the important problems that have plagued scholarship in this area. Not all of the sessions produced agreement—far from it—but the nature and reasons for the disagreements were clarified during the course of the sessions, and many of the broader methodological gaps were bridged to a greater or lesser extent.

As with any seminar, the published papers represent only a fraction of the dialogue and debate that occurred during the seminar sessions. The papers do, however, serve to identify the major issues that were dis-

cussed and lay out the nature and terms of the debate in this vital area of Pauline studies. The present volume, together with the previous one, was designed to provide a glimpse into the cutting-edge research that typified the work of the seminar so that those who were not present could share in the benefits that the seminar members (and the scores of people who attended the seminar sessions as audience members) received from these annual programs.

A brief review of the contents of the first volume will help to place the present volume into proper context. The first volume addressed four broad methodological questions. The first section (after the introduction) examined the *status quaestionis* concerning the various ways in which Paul engaged with the Jewish Scriptures in his letters: explicit quotations, allusions and echoes, the use of biblical language and ideas, and references to biblical narratives. The second section explored the immediate historical and cultural environment of Paul's appropriations of Scripture, looking at what can be known (or reasonably presumed) about Paul's own educational background and his audiences' familiarity with the Scriptures of Judaism. The third section dealt with the thorny question of how to determine when Paul is interacting with the language or ideas of Scripture and when he is engaging with other materials, such as Roman imperial propaganda (and what difference it makes). The final section investigated what might be learned by viewing Paul's appropriations of Scripture through the lenses of methods other than traditional historical-critical or literary scholarship, including essays that drew on insights from deconstruction, postcolonial studies, and feminist studies.

The present volume continues this focus on methodology by looking at four sets of issues that were not explicitly addressed in the first volume. The first section consists of three papers that examine the broader social context of Paul's engagement with his ancestral Scriptures. Leonard Greenspoon examines the historical evidence behind the oft-debated question of the role that memory played in Paul's references to the Jewish Scriptures vis-à-vis his reliance on written texts. In the end, he finds good reason to believe that Paul had committed substantial portions of Scripture to memory, from which he drew the bulk of his quotations while dictating his letters. Jeremy Punt draws on cultural memory theory to argue that Paul referred to the Jewish Scriptures not only to add rhetorical force to his arguments but also to indoctrinate his mostly non-Jewish audiences into the cultural memory (and thus the identity) of the people of Israel, which was profoundly rooted in the stories and applications of Scripture. He

focuses especially on the way that Paul reinterpreted the story of Abraham as a resource for constructing the identity of non-Jewish Christ-followers in Galatia and Rome over against others who were using the same story to shape identity in a different direction. Finally, Bruce Fisk compares Paul's interpretations of biblical narratives with the techniques employed in the Jewish literary genre commonly known as "rewritten Bible" and finds enough similarities to suggest that this neglected body of texts should play a more prominent role in discussions of Paul's engagement with the Scriptures of Israel. Focusing on Rom 11:1–7, Fisk suggests that Paul may in fact have framed his interpretations of biblical narratives in a conscious dialogue with the kinds of Jewish interpretive traditions that we find in Pseudo-Philo and Josephus.

The second section comprises three papers that grapple with the methodological issues surrounding the long-running controversy over whether and how far Paul was influenced by (and sought to be loyal to) the original literary context of the biblical references that he includes in his letters. Steve Moyise begins the discussion by reviewing several possible meanings of the term "respect for context" and evaluating how Paul's handling of Scripture compares to each of these definitions. Whether Paul respects the context of his biblical references, Moyise concludes, depends on which of these meanings the interpreter has in mind. Mitchell Kim follows with an essay in which he insists that Moyise has set too high a standard for judging whether an author like Paul respects the context of his source text. Citing Michael Polanyi's concept of "latent knowledge," Kim argues that Paul often elicits a "latent sense" from the text that is consistent with the original context even when it diverges from the text's historical meaning. The final essay in this section contains Moyise's response to Kim's paper. Rejecting Kim's concept of latent sense, he argues that it makes better methodological sense to speak of Paul exploiting the "semantic potential" of the texts that he cites in his letters. According to Moyise, Kim's contention that texts can have a latent sense veils the role that the reader plays in creating meaning by linking texts with other intertexts, the interpreter's own situation, or both.

The third section seeks to extend the conversation regarding Paul's use of Scripture beyond the four *Hauptbriefe*, which have attracted the lion's share of scholarly attention due to their inclusion of explicit quotations, to other letters where Paul's engagement with Scripture is less obvious. Elizabeth Johnson examines the presence and function of biblical language in 1 Thessalonians, Stephen Fowl studies Philipians, and Jerry Sumney ana-

lyzes Colossians. These three letters were chosen for the diversity of situations that they represent: one was addressed to a congregation of newly converted “pagans” whose familiarity with the Jewish Bible would have been shallow at best, one to a well-established church that was close to Paul and could be expected to have a strong biblical foundation, and one to a community with which Paul (or someone writing in his name) has no personal experience and therefore cannot presuppose any prior biblical teaching. All three authors highlight Paul’s indebtedness to the Jewish Scriptures for his language and ideas, and all three grapple seriously with the problem of how to judge whether Paul is in fact echoing or alluding to a particular passage of Scripture and whether his audiences might have recognized and understood such unmarked references. Finally, all three papers discuss the role of biblical references in the letter as a whole. When viewed together, these essays provide important data for developing an understanding of Paul’s engagement with Scripture that does justice to all of his letters, not just the *Hauptbriefe*.

The fourth and final section looks at the place of Scripture in Paul’s theology. It has become common in recent years to assert that the Jewish Scriptures played a formative role in Paul’s thinking both before and after his becoming a Christ-follower, but less attention has been given to the question of how Scripture functioned alongside other influences in Paul’s theology. The three papers in this section address different aspects of this problem. First, Linda Belleville asks how we can know when Paul is engaging directly with the text of Scripture and when he is interacting with Jewish interpretive traditions. Belleville cites a number of instances where the latter appears to be the case and argues that the influence of such extrabiblical sources must be taken into account when scholars are discussing the importance of Scripture in Paul’s theology. Matthew Bates agrees that Jewish interpretive traditions prior to Paul are important for making sense of Paul’s handling of Scripture, but he also proposes that later interpretations of the same texts by Jewish and Christian authors can shed light on the way Paul viewed and used Scripture. Bates criticizes Richard Hays for introducing an overly narrow understanding of intertextuality to the field of biblical studies and argues for a broader definition based on the theories of Julia Kristeva. Finally, Roy Ciampa examines the benefits that might accrue from applying the methods and insights of translation theory to the study of Paul’s use of Scripture. Ciampa’s approach underlines the importance of Paul’s work as a “translator” of the biblically grounded early Christian message into linguistic and concep-

tual terms that his non-Jewish communities could understand. All three of these papers highlight methodological difficulties that must be taken into account in any effort to describe the role of Scripture in Paul's theological reflection.

The book concludes with an essay by Christopher Stanley that looks back over the six years of the seminar and evaluates how well the members succeeded in answering the questions that they set for themselves at their initial session and lays out a number of questions for further research. Stanley concludes that much was achieved by the seminar, but much also remains to be done. In the end, the value of the seminar will be judged by the degree to which it motivates other scholars to press forward toward the goal of understanding what Paul was doing when he read his ancestral Scriptures in the light of Christ and applied them to the lives of his churches.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Porter, Stanley E., and Christopher D. Stanley, eds. *As It Is Written: Studying Paul's Use of Scripture*. SBLSymS 50. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2008.
- Stanley, Christopher D. "Paul and Scripture: Charting the Course." Pages 3–12 in *As It Is Written: Studying Paul's Use of Scripture*. Edited by Stanley E. Porter and Christopher D. Stanley. SBLSymS 50 Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2008.