

RESURRECTION IN PAUL

SBL Press

EARLY CHRISTIANITY AND ITS LITERATURE

David G. Horrell, General Editor

Editorial Board:

Warren Carter

Amy-Jill Levine

Judith M. Lieu

Margaret Y. MacDonald

Dale B. Martin

Number 19

SBL Press



RESURRECTION IN PAUL

Cognition, Metaphor, and Transformation

Frederick S. Tappenden

SBL Press



SBL PRESS

Atlanta

Copyright © 2016 by SBL Press

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, SBL Press, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Tappenden, Frederick S., author.

Title: Resurrection in Paul : cognition, metaphor, and transformation / by Frederick S. Tappenden.

Description: Atlanta : SBL Press, 2016. | Series: Early Christianity and its literature ; Number 19 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015049192 (print) | LCCN 2015050113 (ebook) | ISBN 9780884141440 (pbk. : alk. paper) | ISBN 9780884141464 (hardcover : alk. paper) | ISBN 9780884141457 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Bible. Epistles of Paul—Theology. | Resurrection—Biblical teaching.

Classification: LCC BS2655.R35 T37 2016 (print) | LCC BS2655.R35 (ebook) | DDC 236/.8092—dc23

LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015049192>

Printed on acid-free paper.



For my parents,

Alan and Connie Tappenden

SBL Press

SBL Press

Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments.....	ix
Tables and Figures	xiii
Abbreviations.....	xv
1. The Disembodiment of Resurrection: Literature Review, Problem Definition, and the Integration of Cognition and Culture.....	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. On Cognicentrism and Mind-Body Dualism	3
1.3. Literature Review and Problem Definition	7
1.4. Theory and Method: Integrating Cognition and Culture	33
1.5. Overview of the Study	40
2. Imaging Resurrection: Toward an Image-Schematic Understanding of Resurrection Belief in Paul and in Second Temple Judaism.....	43
2.1. Second Temple Judaism and the RESURRECTION Gestalt	46
2.2. Paul's Appropriation of the RESURRECTION Gestalt	72
2.3. Conclusions	85
3. "We Will All Be Changed": On Dualism/Monism, Plants, and the Peculiarity of Wearing a House.....	87
3.1. Concentric Circles of Cultural Embodiment	88
3.2. Transformation and Resurrection	102
3.3. Conclusions	132
4. Eschatological Somatology: Identifying the Already and the Not Yet in Paul.....	135
4.1. Baptismal Death in Romans 6:1–11	137
4.2. Anthropology and Ethics in Romans 7	146

4.3. Trajectories of Transformative Embodiment in Romans 8:9–11	155
4.4. Paul's Eschatological Somatology	164
4.5. Conclusions	171
5. Participating in Resurrection: UNION, Mutual Affectivity, and Ethnicity.....	175
5.1. Resurrection and UNION	177
5.2. Patterns of Embodiment 1: Life in Death	190
5.3. Patterns of Embodiment 2: Ecstasy, Ethnicity, and Resurrection	207
5.4. Conclusions	225
6. Embodying Resurrection: Conclusions and Prospects.....	229
6.1. Major Conclusions	230
6.2. Scholarly Contribution and Areas of Further Research	233
6.3. Final Observations	237
Bibliography.....	239
Ancient Sources Index.....	259
Modern Authors Index.....	273
Subject Index.....	276

SBL Press

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Through the course of researching and writing this project, several people have contributed in ways both intellectual and personal. It is my pleasure to acknowledge this diverse community.

First and foremost, I am indebted to my doctoral supervisor, Todd Klutz, who guided this study from its inception and challenged and encouraged me at every turn. Todd's mentorship proved invaluable during my years at the University of Manchester. He tirelessly made himself available during my intensive research trips to England, and our mutual love for theory spurred in me many creative and challenging ideas. I also benefited greatly from regular meetings with George Brooke, Peter Oakes, and Maj-Britt Mosegaard Hansen. These exchanges deepened this study's theoretical apparatus and enriched my reading of the primary literature. On a more personal level, I am exceedingly grateful for Mark Coffey and Bob and Lynn Peck, who warmly opened their homes to me during my many research trips from Canada to England.

A very special thanks is due to the late Ellen Aitken of McGill University, who warmly welcomed me as a visiting research student at McGill (2010–2012) and later created a wonderful context for postdoctoral research (2012–2014). Ellen selflessly made herself available to me during my years as a visiting student, reading several chapters of this study and offering acute and insightful feedback. During my postdoctoral fellowship, Ellen oversaw the preparation of this manuscript and also encouraged me to pursue publication with SBL Press. I am grateful for the generous support of the Fonds de recherche du Québec—société et culture, which facilitated this postdoctoral fellowship. I am also grateful to my colleagues at McGill—Ian Henderson, Gerbern Oegema, and Patricia Kirkpatrick—who continue to foster an exceptional context in which to teach and research in biblical and religious studies.

In addition to those formally implicated in my studies, several people have read portions of this study and offered critical feedback: Wayne

Coppins, Troels Engberg-Pedersen, Risto Uro, Colleen Shantz, István Czachesz, Rikard Roitto, Bonnie Howe, Thomas Hatina, Geert Van Oyen, Tom Shepherd, Jeffrey Keiser, Meredith Warren, Kenneth Shepard, Tamás Biró, Leszek Wysocki, and Alexey Somov. In various ways, these colleagues and friends have enriched this study, helping me refine my arguments, address shortcomings, and anticipate potential objections. Wayne Coppins deserves special note. In addition to reading and providing insightful feedback on an earlier version of chapter 4, Wayne also consulted with me regarding the translation of German scholarship into English. Beyond those who have provided written feedback, Ted Slingerland, Nathaniel Dykstra, Tom Troughton, Kipp Davis, Blair Major, Kenneth Sheppard, and Steve McAuley have all been wonderful conversation partners over the past several years. This study is richer for our exchanges.

Much thanks is due to Gail O'Day (former series editor of *Early Christianity and Its Literature*), who oversaw the peer-review process and accepted the manuscript for publication, and to David Horrell (current series editor), who carefully read my revisions and pressed several key points of clarity. Together, the editorial efforts of Gail and David were exemplary. I am also thankful to the anonymous reviewers who read this manuscript and offered astute and critical feedback. The team at SBL Press—especially Nicole Tilford and Heather McMurray—has been exceptional in guiding this manuscript through the publication process. I am grateful also to my brother Andrew Tappenden, who helped prepare the various figures in a format suitable for print, and to James Newman, who helped prepare the indices.

In 2011 an earlier iteration of chapter 2 was awarded the Founders Prize from the Canadian Society of Biblical Studies. I thank the anonymous review committee from that student essay competition, as well as Judith Newman for her insightful and encouraging words to me at that presentation. I am grateful for Carly Daniel-Hughes and André Gagné, who invited me to present portions of this research in their graduate seminars at Concordia University, thus allowing me to refine and (re)develop certain sections of this study. Additionally, several parts of this study benefited from presentation and scholarly critique at various conferences in the United Kingdom, Belgium, Canada, and the United States.

Certain portions of this monograph have already been published in print. Parts of chapters 1 and 3 appeared as “Embodiment, Folk Dualism, and the Convergence of Cosmology and Anthropology in Paul’s Resur-

rection Ideals,” *BibInt* 23 (2015): 428–55. These are reproduced here by permission of the journal editor, Tat-siong Benny Liew. Parts of chapters 1 and 5 appeared as “Luke and Paul in Dialogue: Ritual Meals and Risen Bodies as Instances of Conceptual Blending,” in *Resurrection of the Dead: Biblical Traditions in Dialogue*, ed. Geert Van Oyen and Tom Shepherd, BETL 249 (Leuven: Peeters, 2012), 203–28. These are reproduced here by permission of the book’s editors, Geert Van Oyen and Tom Shepherd, and Paul Peeters of Peeters Publishing.

Most important of all, I owe a great debt to my family for their unending love and support. I thank my loving wife Danielle, who has been a constant source of encouragement, and whose support and strength has seen this study through from beginning to end. Finally, I am forever grateful to my parents for their love, support, and encouragement in my scholarly pursuits. You are deeply appreciated, Mom and Dad, and it is my great pleasure to dedicate this book to you.

Frederick S. Tappenden
Montreal, QC
19 August 2015

SBL Press

SBL Press

TABLES AND FIGURES

Tables

1.1. Blending Map for the LIFE IS BEING AWAKE Metaphor	39
3.1. Blending Map for the EARTHLY BODY IS TENT Metaphor (<i>ἡ ἐπίγειος ἡμῶν οἰκία τοῦ σκῆνους</i> , 2 Cor 5:1–2a)	125
3.2. Blending Map for the HEAVENLY BODY IS HOUSE Metaphor (<i>οἰκοδομὴν ἐκ θεοῦ</i> , 2 Cor 5:1–2a)	125

Figures

1.1. LIFE IS BEING AWAKE Metaphor	38
2.1. The VERTICALITY (or UP-DOWN) Schema	47
2.2. The PATH Schema	55
2.3. Integrated PATH and VERTICALITY Schematic Structure	59
2.4. Reciprocal Protagonist (TR-P) and Antagonist (TR-A) PATHS	59
2.5. The CONTAINER (or IN-OUT) Schema	62
2.6. The Micro-PATH (CHANGE) Gestalt	63
2.7. Integrated Micro-PATH Structure	63
2.8. Integrated PROXIMITY (NEAR-FAR) Structure	67
2.9. The RESURRECTION Gestalt	69
3.1. The CHANGE Gestalt	104
3.2. Foregrounding and Backgrounding the CHANGE Gestalt	107
3.3. The Plant Metaphor (1 Cor 15:36–38)	109
3.4. The Plant Metaphor (I ₁ Restructured)	111
3.5. The Plant Metaphor (1 Cor 15:39–44)	113
3.6. The BODY IS HOUSE Metaphor (2 Cor 5:1–2a)	124
3.7. The BODY IS CLOTHING Metaphor (2 Cor 5:2b, 4)	127
3.8. Putting on a House (2 Cor 5:2b, 4)	128
4.1. Baptismal Death and Resurrection (Rom 6:4)	138
4.2. The Enspirited Earthly Body (Rom 8:9–11)	161

4.3. Scholarly Depictions of Paul's Modified Eschatological Schema	168
4.4. Paul's Appropriation of the RESURRECTION Gestalt	170
5.1. The UNION (CONTAINER-PROXIMITY) Gestalt	187
5.2. Paul's Appropriation of the RESURRECTION Gestalt	191
5.3. Resurrection and IN-OUT Affectivity (2 Cor 4:7–18)	202
5.4. Participation in/with Christ	219

SBL Press

ABBREVIATIONS

Primary Sources

1 En.	1 Enoch (Ethiopic Apocalypse)
1 Macc	1 Maccabees
2 Bar.	2 Baruch (Syriac Apocalypse)
2 En.	2 Enoch (Slavonic Apocalypse)
2 Macc	2 Maccabees
3 Bar.	3 Baruch (Greek Apocalypse)
A	MS BAN 45.13.4 of 2 Enoch. See <i>OTP</i> 1:92–94.
A.J.	Josephus, <i>Antiquitates judaicae</i>
Apoc. Ab.	Apocalypse of Abraham
Apoc. Zeph.	Apocalypse of Zephaniah
Barn.	Barnabas
B.J.	Josephus, <i>Bellum judaicum</i>
C. Ap.	Josephus, <i>Contra Apionem</i>
Deus.	Philo, <i>Quod Deus sit immutabilis</i>
Did.	Didache
Ezek. Trag.	Ezekiel the Tragedian
Her.	Philo, <i>Quis rerum divinarum heres sit</i>
Il.	Homer, <i>Iliad</i>
J	MS BAN 13.3.25 of 2 Enoch. See <i>OTP</i> 1:92–94.
Jos. Asen.	Joseph and Aseneth
Jub.	Jubilees
LAB	Liber antiquitatum biblicarum (Pseudo-Philo)
LAE	Life of Adam and Eve
(Gk.)	Greek Recension (= Apocalypse of Moses)
(Lat.)	Latin Recension
Leg.	Philo, <i>Legum allegoriae</i>
Legat.	Philo, <i>Legatio ad Gaium</i>

LXX	Septuagint
Mand.	Shepherd of Hermas, Mandate(s)
Mos.	Philo, <i>De vita Mosis</i>
MT	Masoretic Text
Nat.	Seneca, <i>Naturales quaestiones</i>
OG	Old Greek
Opif.	Philo, <i>De opificio mundi</i>
Pss. Sol.	Psalms of Solomon
QE	Philo, <i>Quaestiones et solutiones in Exodum</i>
QG	Philo, <i>Quaestiones et solutiones in Genesin</i>
Resp.	Plato, <i>Respublica</i>
Sacr.	Philo, <i>De sacrificiis Abelis et Caini</i>
Sim.	Shepherd of Hermas, Similitude(s)
Symp.	Xenophon, <i>Symposium</i>
T. Ab.	Testament of Abraham
T. Levi	Testament of Levi
T. Mos.	Testament of Moses
θ'	Theodotion
Trad. ap.	Hippolytus, <i>Traditio apostolica</i>
Virt.	Philo, <i>De virtutibus</i>
Virt. vit.	Plutarch, <i>De virtute et vitio</i>
Wis	Wisdom of Solomon

Secondary Sources

AB	Anchor Bible
ABD	<i>Anchor Bible Dictionary</i> . Edited by David Noel Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992
AGJU	Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums
ANRW	<i>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung</i> . Part 2, <i>Principat</i> . Edited by Hildegard Temporini and Wolfgang Haase. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1972–
AR	<i>Archiv für Religionswissenschaft</i>
ASLL	Anglo-Saxon Language and Literature
BDAG	Frederick W. Danker, Walter Bauer, William F. Arndt, and F. Wilbur Gingrich. <i>Greek-English Lexicon of the New</i>

- Testament and Other Early Christian Literature*. 3rd ed. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000
- BDB Francis Brown, S. R. Driver, and Charles A. Briggs. *A Hebrew and English Lexicon of the Old Testament*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1907
- BDF Friedrich Blass and Albert Debrunner. *A Greek Grammar of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature*. Translated by Robert W. Funk. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961
- BETL Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium
- BHS *Biblia Hebraica Stuttgartensia*. Edited by Karl Elliger and Wilhelm Rudolph. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1983
- BibInt* *Biblical Interpretation*
- BibInt Biblical Interpretation Series
- BTB *Biblical Theology Bulletin*
- BZAW Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
- BZNW Beiheft zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
- CEJL Commentaries on Early Jewish Literature
- CFJ Flavius Josephus: Translation and Commentary. Edited by Steve Mason. Leiden: Brill, 1999–
- CLR Cognitive Linguistics Research
- CogSci* *Cognitive Science*
- ConBNT Coniectanea Biblica: New Testament Series
- Contr Contraversions
- CRINT Compendia Rerum Judaicarum ad Novum Testamentum
- CTL Cambridge Textbooks in Linguistics
- CTSRR College Theology Society Resources in Religion
- CW *Classical World*
- DDD *Dictionary of Deities and Demons in the Bible*. Edited by Karel van der Toorn, Bob Becking, and Pieter W. van der Horst. 2nd rev. ed. Leiden: Brill, 1999
- DJD Discoveries in the Judaean Desert
- DSD *Dead Sea Discoveries*
- EBib Études bibliques
- ECL Early Christianity and Its Literature
- EDNT *Exegetical Dictionary of the New Testament*. Edited by

	Horst Balz and Gerhard Schneider. ET. 3 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990–1993
ESEC	Emory Studies in Early Christianity
ESV	English Standard Version
GSCC	Groningen Studies in Cultural Change
HALOT	Ludwig Koehler, Walter Baumgartner, and Johann J. Stamm. <i>The Hebrew and Aramaic Lexicon of the Old Testament</i> . Translated and edited under the supervision of Marvin E. J. Richardson. 5 vols. Leiden: Brill, 1994–2000
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
HTS	Harvard Theological Studies
HUT	Hermeneutische Untersuchungen zur Theologie
HvTSt	<i>Hervormde Theologiese Studies</i>
ICC	International Critical Commentary
JAAR	<i>Journal of the American Academy of Religion</i>
JASup	Journal of Ancient Judaism Supplements
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JCC	<i>Journal of Cognition and Culture</i>
JCTCRS	Jewish and Christian Texts in Contexts and Related Studies
JJS	<i>Journal of Jewish Studies</i>
JLCRS	Jordan Lectures in Comparative Religion Series
JSJSup	Journal for the Study of Judaism Supplements
JSNT	<i>Journal for the Study of the New Testament</i>
JSNTSup	Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series
JSP	<i>Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha</i>
JSPSup	Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Supplement Series
JTS	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
KJV	King James (Authorized) Version
L&N	Johannes P. Louw and Eugene A. Nida, eds. <i>Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament: Based on Semantic Domains</i> . 2nd ed. 2 vols. New York: United Bible Societies, 1989
LBS	Linguistic Biblical Studies
LCL	Loeb Classical Library

LEH	Johan Lust, Erik Eynikel, and Katrin Hauspie, eds. <i>Greek-English Lexicon of the Septuagint</i> . Rev. ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2003
<i>LeuB</i>	<i>Leuvense Bijdragen</i>
LHR	Lectures on the History of Religions
LNTS	Library of New Testament Studies
LS	Henry George Liddell and Robert Scott. <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> . 8th ed. Oxford: Clarendon, 1901
LSJ	Henry George Liddell, Robert Scott, and Henry Stuart Jones. <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> . 9th ed. with revised supplement. Oxford: Clarendon, 1996
LSTS	Library of Second Temple Studies
NA ²⁸	<i>Novum Testamentum Graece</i> . Edited by Eberhard Nestle and Kurt Aland. 28th ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2012
NASB	New American Standard Bible
NHMS	Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies
NIGTC	New International Greek Testament Commentary
NIV	New International Version
<i>NovT</i>	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NovTSup	Supplements to Novum Testamentum
NRSV	New Revised Standard Version
NTL	New Testament Library
NTS	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
OTP	<i>Old Testament Pseudepigrapha</i> . Edited by James H. Charlesworth. 2 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1983–1985
PGL	<i>Patristic Greek Lexicon</i> . Edited by Geoffrey W. H. Lampe. Oxford: Clarendon, 1961
PhoSup	Phoenix: Supplementary Volume
PVTG	<i>Pseudepigrapha Veteris Testamenti Graece</i>
RBL	<i>Review of Biblical Literature</i>
<i>RevQ</i>	<i>Revue de Qumran</i>
SBLDS	Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series
SBLTT	Society of Biblical Literature Texts and Translations
SBT	Studies in Biblical Theology
SCS	Septuagint and Cognate Studies
SHR	Studies in the History of Religions
SJSHRZ	Studien zu den Jüdischen Schriften aus hellenistisch-römischer Zeit

SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
SNTW	Studies of the New Testament and Its World
SPIB	Scripta Pontificii Instituti Biblici
SSU	Studia Semitica Upsaliensia
STDJ	Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah
<i>StLit</i>	<i>Studia Liturgica</i>
SVTG	Septuaginta: Vetus Testamentum Graecum. Auctoritate Academiae Scientiarum Gottingensis editum. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1931–
SVTP	Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha
SymS	Symposium Series
TDNT	<i>Theological Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . Edited by Gerhard Kittel and Gerhard Friedrich. Translated by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. 10 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964–1976
TENTS	Texts and Editions for New Testament Study
TS	<i>Theological Studies</i>
VT	<i>Vetus Testamentum</i>
VTSup	Supplements to Vetus Testamentum
WBC	Word Biblical Commentary
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testa- ment

SBL Press