

ANCIENT CHRISTIAN APOCRYPHA

SBL Press

THE BIBLE AND WOMEN

An Encyclopaedia of Exegesis and Cultural History

Edited by Mary Ann Beavis, Irmtraud Fischer,
Mercedes Navarro Puerto, and Adriana Valerio

Volume 3.2: Ancient Christian Apocrypha:
Marginalized Texts in Early Christianity

SBL Press



ANCIENT CHRISTIAN APOCRYPHA

Marginalized Texts in Early Christianity

Edited by

Outi Lehtipuu and Silke Petersen

SBL Press



SBL PRESS

Atlanta

Copyright © 2022 by SBL Press

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, SBL Press, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Control Number: 2022941820

SBL Press

Contents

Acknowledgments.....	ix
Abbreviations.....	xi
Introduction	
Outi Lehtipuu and Silke Petersen.....	1
No Longer Marginalized: From Orthodoxy and Heresy Discourse to Category Critique and Beyond	
Karen L. King.....	13
Part 1. Newly Discovered Texts: Nag Hammadi and Related Writings	
Female Disciples of Jesus in Early Christian Gospels: Gospel of Mary, Wisdom of Jesus Christ, and Other Gospels in Dialogue Form	
Judith Hartenstein.....	33
Rewritten Eve Traditions in the Nature of the Rulers (NHC II 4)	
Antti Marjanen.....	45
Sophia and Her Sisters: Norea, Protennoia, Brontē	
Uwe-Karsten Plisch.....	57
Becoming Male and the Annulment of Gender Difference: Return to Paradise?	
Silke Petersen.....	69

Part 2. Texts in Continuous Use:
 Infancy Gospels and Apocryphal Acts of Apostles

Birth and Virginity in the Protevangelium of James Silvia Pellegrini	91
Gender Roles in the Infancy Gospel of Thomas Ursula Ulrike Kaiser	111
Ways of Life in the Apocryphal Acts of Apostles: Chastity as Autonomy? Carmen Bernabé Ubieta.....	127
Apostolic Authority in the Acts of Thecla Outi Lehtipuu	147
Gender and Slavery in the Acts of Andrew Bernadette J. Brooten.....	165
Gender and Disability in the Acts of Peter: Apostolic Power to Paralyze Anna Rebecca Solevåg.....	187

Part 3. Female Voices in Ancient Texts?

Perpetua, Her Martyrdom, and Holy Scriptures Anna Carfora	207
Genesis according to Proba and Eudocia María José Cabezas Cabello.....	221
Pilgrim of the Word: The Bible and Women in Egeria's <i>Itinerarium</i> M. Dolores Martín Trutet.....	239
Mixed Doubles: The Epithalamium of Paulinus and Therasia Cristina Simonelli.....	263

Early Christian Female Theologians in Profile: Maximilla's and Quintilla's Visions for the Church Heidrun Mader	277
Early Christian Women in Leadership Positions: The Testimony of Grave Inscriptions Ute E. Eisen	295
Bibliography	317
Contributors	357
Ancient Sources Index	361

SBL Press

SBL Press

Acknowledgments

In preparation for this volume, an international colloquium, *Scritti di donne e scritti apocrifi tra primo cristianesimo e tardo antico*, was organized at the Monastero dei Bendettini Coro de note in Catania, Sicily, on September 11–13, 2014. Most contributors to this volume took part in this gathering. We would like to thank all participants for the active and progressive discussions and particularly the organizers of the colloquium, Arianna Rotondo and Adriana Valerio. We also express our thanks to the University of Catania (Dipartimento di Scienze Umanistiche), the center FRIB–Futuro in ricerca 2012 (*La percezione dello spazio e del tempo nella trasmissione di identità collettive. Polarizzazioni e/o coabitazioni religiose nel mondo antico [I–VI secolo d.C.]*), and the University of Graz for their financial support for the colloquium.

In addition, we would like to acknowledge the translators of the German, Italian, and Spanish chapters, Dennis Slabaugh (Uwe-Karsten Plisch, Silke Petersen, Ursula Ulrike Kaiser, Heidrun Mader, Ute Eva Eisen) and Liisa Laakso-Tammisto (Silvia Pellegrini, Anna Carfora, Christina Simonelli), and the translators of LBS Scandinavia (Carmen Bernabé Ubieta, María José Cabezas Cabello, M. Dolores Martín Trutet). Judith Hartenstein translated her contribution herself. In addition, Heli Ala-Maunu has helped with the translation of this introduction (originally written in German) and, together with Johanna Salovaara, with the compilation of the bibliography. Special thanks are due to Brian Duvick, who generously shared his yet-unpublished English translation of Eudocia's *Homerocento*.

Last, we want to thank Mary Ann Beavis, the English editor for the series *Bible and Women*, and Nicole Tilford, SBL Press Production Manager, for their support and help in the publication process.

SBL Press

Abbreviations

<i>1 Apol.</i>	Justin, <i>Apologia i</i>
1 Clem.	1 Clement
2 Clem.	2 Clement
<i>Ab. urb. cond.</i>	Livy, <i>Ab urbe condita</i>
AC	Antigüedad y Cristianismo: Monografías históricas sobre la Antigüedad tardía
AC	<i>Antiquité classique</i>
AcApAp	Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha
ACLS	American Council of Learned Societies
<i>AcT</i>	<i>Acta Theologica</i>
Act. Verc.	Actus Vercellenses
Acts Andr.	Acts of Andrew
Acts John	Acts of John
Acts Pet.	Acts of Peter
Acts. Phil.	Acts of Philip
Acts Thecla	Acts of Thecla
Acts Xanth.	Acts of Xanthippe and Polyxena
ACW	Ancient Christian Writers
<i>Aen.</i>	Virgil, <i>Aeneid</i>
<i>Aeth.</i>	Heliodorus, <i>Aethiopica</i>
<i>Aev</i>	<i>Aevum: Rassegna de scienze, storiche, linguistiche, e filologiche</i>
AFLF	<i>Annali della facoltà di lettere e filosofia dell'Università di Macerata</i>
AHR	<i>American Historical Review</i>
AIL	Ancient Israel and Its Literature
ALGHJ	Arbeiten zur Literatur und Geschichte des hellenistischen Judentums
<i>Am.</i>	Ovid, <i>Amores</i>
<i>An.</i>	Tertullian, <i>De anima</i>

<i>ANF</i>	<i>Ante-Nicene Fathers</i>
<i>Ann.</i>	Tacitus, <i>Annales</i>
Ap. John	Secret Book of John (NHC II 1, III 1, IV 1, BG 2) (Apocryphon of John)
Apoc. Pet.	(Greek) Apocalypse of Peter
<i>Ars</i>	Ovid, <i>Ars amatoria</i>
Ascen. Isa.	Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 6–11
<i>Aug</i>	<i>Augustinianum</i>
<i>Autol.</i>	Theophilus, <i>Ad Autolyicum</i>
b.	Babylonian Talmud
BAC	Biblioteca de autores cristianos
<i>Bapt.</i>	Tertullian, <i>De baptismo</i>
Barn.	Barnabas
BBA	Berliner byzantinistische Arbeiten
BCNH	Bibliothèque copte de Nag Hammadi
BETL	Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovanien- sium
BF	Die Bibel und die Frauen
BG	Berlin Gnostic Papyrus
<i>BHM</i>	<i>Bulletin of the History of Medicine</i>
<i>Bib</i>	<i>Biblica</i>
BibInt	Biblical Interpretation Series
<i>BibInt</i>	<i>Biblical Interpretation</i>
BibRef	Biblical Refigurations
BJS	Brown Judaic Studies
<i>BK</i>	<i>Bibel und Kirche</i>
Bk. Thom.	Book of Thomas (NHC II 7)
BLS	Bible and Literature Series
BP	Biblioteca patristica
BSGRT	Bibliotheca scriptorum Graecorum et Romanorum Teubneriana
BW	Bible and Women
BZNW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
<i>C. du. ep. Pelag.</i>	Augustine, <i>Contra duas epistulas Pelagianorum ad Bonifatium</i>
ca.	circa
<i>Cant. Pauli Cor.</i>	Origen, <i>Cantanae in sancti Pauli epistolas ad Corin- thios</i>

<i>Carm.</i>	Paulinus of Nola, <i>Carmina</i>
<i>Catech.</i>	Cyril, <i>Catechetical Lectures</i>
CCSA	Corpus Christianorum: Series Apocryphorum. Turnhout: Brepols, 1983–
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum: Series Latina. Turnhout: Brepols, 1953–
<i>Cent. verg.</i>	Proba, <i>Cento vergilianus de laudibus Christi</i>
<i>CH</i>	<i>Church History</i>
<i>Cher.</i>	Philo, <i>Cherubim</i>
<i>ClQ</i>	<i>Classical Quarterly</i>
Cod. justin.	Codex justinianus
Cod. theod.	Codex theodosianus
<i>Congr.</i>	Philo, <i>De congressu eruditionis gratia</i>
<i>CPE</i>	<i>Connaissance des Pères de l'Église</i>
<i>CRAI</i>	<i>Comptes rendus de l'Académie des inscriptions et Belles-Lettres</i>
CS	Cistercian Studies
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
CSHG	Cambridge Studies in Historical Geography
CSPFF	Convegno di Studio promosso dalla Fondazione Franceschini
CT	Codex Tchacos
<i>Cult. fem.</i>	Tertullian, <i>De cultu feminarum</i>
<i>Curios.</i>	Plutarch, <i>De curiositate</i>
d.	died
<i>Daphn.</i>	Longus, <i>Daphnis and Chloe</i>
DH	Denzinger, Heinrich, and Peter Hünermann. <i>Enchiridion symbolorum definitionum et declarationum de rebus fidei et morum</i> . 45th ed. Freiburg: Herder, 2017.
<i>Dial.</i>	Justin, <i>Dialogus cum Tryphone</i>
Did.	Didache
Did. Apost.	Didascalia apostolorum
Dig.	Digesta
EC	Esriptors Cristians
ECCA	Early Christianity in the Context of Antiquity
<i>Ecl.</i>	Virgil, <i>Eclogae</i>
<i>EDNT</i>	Balz, Horst, and Gerhard Schneider. <i>Exegetical Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . ET. 3 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990–1993.

EHO	Estudios históricos la Olmeda
EJL	Early Judaism and Its Literature
EKKNT	Evangelisch-katholischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistula(e)</i>
<i>Eph.</i>	Xenophon of Ephesus, <i>Ephesian Tale</i>
<i>Epigr.</i>	Martial, <i>Epigrams</i>
<i>Erat.</i>	Lysias, <i>On the Murder of Eratosthenes</i>
<i>EstBib</i>	<i>Estudios bíblicos</i>
<i>EstCl</i>	<i>Estudios clásicos</i>
ET	English translation
<i>Eth. nic.</i>	Aristotle, <i>Ethica nicomachea</i>
EUZ	Exegese in unserer Zeit
Exeg. Soul.	Exegesis on the Soul (NHC II 6)
<i>Exc.</i>	Clement of Alexandria, <i>Excerpta et Theodoto</i>
FC	Fathers of the Church
FCNTECW	Feminist Companion to the New Testament and Early Christian Writings
FKDG	Forschungen zur Kirchen und Dogmengeschichte
FKG	Frauen-Kultur-Geschichte
<i>Fr. Ps.</i>	Origen, <i>Fragmenta in Psalmos 1–150</i>
<i>Garr.</i>	Plutarch, <i>De garrulitate</i>
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten [drei] Jahrhunderte
GG	Geschichte und Geschlechter
GIBBENS	Guides et inventaires bibliographiques de la Bibliothèque de l'École normale supérieure
Git.	Gittin
Gos. Jud.	Gospel of Judas (CT 3)
Gos. Mary	Gospel of Mary
Gos. Pet.	Gospel of Peter
Gos. Phil.	Gospel of Philip (NHC II 3)
Gos. Thom.	Gospel of Thomas
<i>Hab. virg.</i>	Cyprian, <i>De habitu virginum</i>
<i>Haer.</i>	Irenaeus, <i>Adversus haereses</i>
<i>Helv.</i>	Jerome, <i>Adversus Helvidium de Mariae virginitate perpetua</i>
Herm. Mand.	Shepherd of Hermas, Mandate(s)
Herm. Vis.	Shepherd of Hermas, Vision(s)

HI	Historia Incógnita
<i>Hispsac</i>	<i>Hispania Sacra</i>
<i>Hist. eccl.</i>	Eusebius, <i>Historia ecclesiastica</i>
<i>Hist. pag.</i>	Paulus Orosius, <i>Historiarum adversus paganos</i>
HNT	Handbuch zum Neuen Testament
<i>Hom. Josh.</i>	Origen, <i>Homiliae in Josuam</i>
<i>Hom. Luc.</i>	Origen, <i>Homiliae in Lucam</i>
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
ICIS	Inscriptiones Christianae Italiae Subsidia
Ign. <i>Eph.</i>	Ignatius, <i>To the Ephesians</i>
Ign. <i>Phld.</i>	Ignatius, <i>To the Philadelphians</i>
Ign. <i>Smyrn.</i>	Ignatius, <i>To the Smyrnaeans</i>
Ign. <i>Trall.</i>	Ignatius, <i>To the Trallians</i>
IJerusalem	Thomsen, Peter, ed. <i>Die lateinischen und griechischen Inschriften der Stadt Jerusalem und ihrer Umgebung.</i> Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1922.
<i>Il.</i>	Homer, <i>Iliad</i>
<i>Inst.</i>	Gaius, <i>Institutiones</i>
<i>Iter. conj.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>De non iterando conjugio</i>
<i>Itin.</i>	Egeria, <i>Itinerarium</i>
JAAR	<i>Journal of the American Academy of Religion</i>
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JECS	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>
JFSR	<i>Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion</i>
JR	<i>Journal of Religion</i>
JRS	<i>Journal of Roman Studies</i>
JSNT	<i>Journal for the Study of the New Testament</i>
JSNTSup	Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series
JSPSSup	Peloponnesica: Journal of the Society of Peloponnesian Studies Supplement
Ketub.	Ketubbot
l(l).	line(s)
LCC	Library of Christian Classics
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
<i>Leuc. Clit.</i>	Achilles Tatius, <i>Leucippe and Clitophon</i>
LHBOTS	The Library of Hebrew Bible/Old Testament Studies

LXX	Septuagint
m.	Mishnah
<i>Marc.</i>	Tertullian, <i>Adversus Marcionem</i>
Mart. Pet.	Martyrdom of Peter
<i>MDATC</i>	<i>Materiali e discussioni per l'analisi dei testi classici</i>
Melch.	Melchizedek (NHC IX 1)
Metam.	Ovid, <i>Metamorphoses</i>
<i>MLC</i>	<i>Miscellània Liturgica Catalana</i>
<i>MScRel</i>	<i>Melanges de science religieuse</i>
MST	Mittellateinische Studien und Texte
MT	Masoretic Text
MTS	Marburger theologische Studien
<i>MTSR</i>	<i>Method and Theory in the Study of Religion</i>
Nat. Rulers	Nature of the Rulers (NHC II 4) (Hypostasis of the Archons)
NETS	Pietersma, Albert, and Benjamin G. Wright, eds. <i>A New English Translation of the Septuagint</i> . New York: Oxford University Press, 2007.
<i>NewDocs</i>	Horsley, Greg H. R., and Stephen Llewelyn, eds. <i>New Documents Illustrating Early Christianity</i> . North Ryde, NSW: The Ancient History Documentary Research Centre, Macquarie University, 1981–.
NHC	Nag Hammadi Codices
NHMS	Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies
NHS	Nag Hammadi Studies
NKJV	New King James Version
Norea	Thought of Norea (NHC IX 2)
<i>NovT</i>	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NovTSup	Supplements to Novum Testamentum
<i>NPNF2</i>	<i>Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers</i> , series 2
NS	new series
NT	New Testament
NTAbh	Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen
NTD	Das Neue Testament Deutsch
NTOA	Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus
NTP	Novum Testamentum Patristicum
<i>NTS</i>	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
<i>Od.</i>	Homer, <i>Odyssey</i>
Odes Sol.	Odes of Solomon

<i>Ol.</i>	Pindar, <i>Olympionikai</i>
Orig. World	On the Origin of the World (NHC II 5)
OT	Old Testament
OTP	Charlesworth, James H., ed. <i>Old Testament Pseudepigrapha</i> . 2 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1983, 1985.
<i>Paed.</i>	Clement of Alexandria, <i>Paedagogus</i>
<i>Pan.</i>	Epiphanius, <i>Panarion</i>
<i>Paraph.</i>	Nonnus of Panopolis, <i>Paraphrasis S. secundum Ioannem euangelii</i>
Paraph. Shem.	Paraphrase of Shem (NHC VII 1)
par(r).	parallel(s)
Pass. Andr.	Passion of Andrew
Pass. Perpet. Felicit.	Passio Perpetuae et Felicitatis
<i>Pelag.</i>	Jerome, <i>Adversus Pelagianos dialogi III</i>
<i>Per.</i>	Prudentius, <i>Peristephanon</i>
<i>Phil.</i>	Polycarp, <i>To the Philippians</i>
PG	Patrologia Graeca [= Patrologiae Cursus Completus: Series Graeca]. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. 162 vols. Paris, 1857–1886.
PL	Patrologia Latina [= Patrologiae Cursus Completus: Series Latina]. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. 217 vols. Paris, 1844–1864.
<i>Pol.</i>	Aristotle, <i>Politica</i>
prol.	prologue
Prot. Jas.	Protevangelium of James
PW	<i>Paulys Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft</i> . New edition by Georg Wissowa and Wilhelm Kroll. 50 vols. in 84 parts. Stuttgart: Metzler and Druckenmüller, 1894–1980.
QE	Philo, <i>Quaestiones et solutiones in Exodum</i>
RAC	Klauser, Theodor, et al., eds. <i>Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum</i> . Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1950–.
RBén	<i>Revue Benedictine</i>
RCT	<i>Revista Catalana de Teologia</i>
<i>Res. Gest.</i>	Ammianus Marcellinus, <i>Res Gestae</i>
RGG	Dieter Betz, Hans, ed. <i>Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart</i> . 4th ed. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1998–2007.
<i>Rhet.</i>	Aristotle, <i>Rhetorica</i>
RIDA	<i>Revue Internationale des droits de l'Antiquité</i>

RPP	Betz, Hans Dieter, et al., eds. <i>Religion Past and Present: Encyclopedia of Theology and Religion</i> . 14 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2007–2013.
SAC	Studies in Antiquity and Christianity
SC	Sources chrétiennes
SEAug	Studia ephemeridis Augustinianum
SECA	Studies in Early Christian Apocrypha
SEJ	Studier i exegetik och judaistik utgivna av Teologiska fakulteten vid Åbo Akademi
SemeiaSt	Semeia Studies
Sib. Or.	Sibylline Oracles
SIDS	Società Italiana Delle Storiche
Sir	Sirach or Ecclesiasticus
SJLA	Studies in Judaism in Late Antiquity
SJPJA	Studies in Jungian Psychology by Jungian Analysts
Sod.	Pseudo-Cyprian, <i>De Sodoma</i>
ST	<i>Studia Theologica</i>
Strom.	Clement of Alexandria, <i>Stromateis</i>
STT	Studi e testi tardoantichi
SubEp	Subsidia epigraphica
SUNT	Studien zur Umwelt des Neuen Testaments
SWR	Studies in Women and Religion
T. Ab.	Testament of Abraham
TA	Transformationen der Antike
Teach. Silv.	Teachings of Silvanus (NHC VII 4)
TENTS	Texts and Editions for New Testament Study
Testim. Truth	Testimony of Truth (NHC IX 3)
TFE	Theologische Frauenforschung in Europa
TRE	Krause, Gerhard, and Gerhard Müller, eds. <i>Theologische Realenzyklopädie</i> . Berlin: de Gruyter, 1977–.
Tri. Trac.	Tripartite Tractate (NHC I 5)
Trin.	(Pseudo-)Didymus, <i>De Trinitate</i>
True Doctr.	Celsus, <i>True Doctrine</i>
TS	Texts and Studies
TS	<i>Theological Studies</i>
TTCLBS	T&T Clark Library of Biblical Studies
TU	Texte und Untersuchungen
TV	<i>Teología y vida</i>

TWNT	Kittel, Gerhard, and Gerhard Friedrich, eds. <i>Theologische Wörterbuch zum Neuen Testament</i> . Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1932–1979.
US	<i>Una Sancta</i>
VC	<i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
VCSup	Supplements to <i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
Virg.	Ambrose, <i>De virginitate</i>
Virginit.	John Chrysostom, <i>De virginitate</i>
Virt. vit.	(Pseudo-)Aristotle, <i>De virtutibus et vitiis</i>
Vis. Paul	Vision of Paul
Vit. Sanct. Mel.	Gerontius, <i>Vita Sanctae Melaniae</i>
Wis. Jes. Chr.	Wisdom of Jesus Christ
WMANT	Wissenschaftliche Monographien zum Alten und Neuen Testament
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZNW	<i>Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche</i>
Zost.	Zostrianos (NHC VIII 1)
ZSS	<i>Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte</i>

SBL Press

SBL Press

Introduction

Outi Lehtipuu and Silke Petersen

The present volume in the international series *The Bible and Women: An Encyclopaedia of Exegesis and Cultural History* deals with early Christian apocryphal texts, in other words, texts that are not included in the New Testament canon of Scripture. Before we turn to the structure and contents of the volume, it is useful to take a closer look at the concept of apocrypha.

1. Ancient Christian Apocrypha

The expression *ancient Christian Apocrypha*, used in the title of this volume, is coined to replace the older term *New Testament Apocrypha* and is used, for example, in the leading text collection of the German-speaking world.¹ In English, an equivalent modification, *early Christian Apocrypha*,

1. Christoph Markschies and Jens Schröter, eds., *Evangelien und Verwandtes*, vol. 1 of *Antike Christliche Apokryphen in deutscher Übersetzung* (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2012). This is a thoroughly revised version of the older collection *Neutestamentliche Apokryphen in deutscher Übersetzung*, vol. 1, *Evangelien*, vol. 2, *Apostolisches, Apokalypsen und Verwandtes*, ed. Edgar Hennecke and Wilhelm Schneemelcher (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1997). Schneemelcher's edition was a reworked and enlarged version of the collection of Edgar Hennecke (originally published in 1904) and hence often referred to as Hennecke-Schneemelcher. The collection was translated into English by R. McLeod Wilson as *New Testament Apocrypha*, vol. 1, *Gospels and Related Writings*, vol. 2, *Writings Relating to the Apostles, Apocalypses and Related Subjects* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2003), also known as Hennecke-Schneemelcher-Wilson. In the English-speaking world, a major contribution has also been the collection of Montague R. James, *The Apocryphal New Testament Being the Apocryphal Gospels, Acts, Epistles, and Apocalypses, with Other Narratives and Fragments* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1975). This collection has been reworked by J. Keith Elliott, *The Apocryphal New Testament: A Collection of Apocryphal Christian Literature in an English Translation* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1993).

is also used.² The older term, with the New Testament defining the scope, is too limited and even anachronistic, as some of the apocryphal texts were written at a time when the New Testament canon did not yet exist.³ Thus, some recent publications prefer expressions such as “gospels that *became* apocryphal” to make it clear that the distinction between canonical and apocryphal was not unambiguous and fully fixed at the time these texts were written but was the result of a long process.⁴ At the end of the second century, Irenaeus of Lyon prioritized the Gospels of Matthew, Mark, Luke, and John, which later *became* canonical, and justified his claim why there need to be exactly four gospels (*Haer.* 3.11.8–9).⁵ Around the same time, Clement of Alexandria quoted from the Gospel of the Egyptians, commenting that the quote is not “in the four gospels that have been handed down to us” (*Strom.* 3.93.1). These examples show the openness of the situation; the intensity of Irenaeus’s justification of the fourfold gospel implies that this was not unquestioningly accepted. Clement, on the other hand, did not totally reject the Gospel of the Egyptians and was willing to use it, albeit interpreting it differently from other early Christians.

A further example of this kind appears in the church history of Eusebius of Caesarea (*Hist. eccl.* 6.12.3–6) and relates to Serapion, the patriarch of Antioch around 200 CE. A church nearby had asked Serapion for permission to use the Gospel of Peter, which he first approved, but then, after hearing that it contained heretical teachings, he wrote a letter to withdraw his approval. From this we may conclude that, around 200 CE, there was a church that had access to the Gospel of Peter and was willing to use it and that there was a patriarch who at first did not see any kind of problem in it. Moreover, patristic writers did not reject all apocryphal texts but referred to and quoted from them long after the time of Irenaeus. The

2. See especially Andrew Gregory and Christopher Tuckett, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Early Christian Apocrypha* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015).

3. See Christopher Tuckett, “Introduction: What Is Early Christian Apocrypha?” in Gregory and Tuckett, *Oxford Handbook of Early Christian Apocrypha*, 3–12; see also Christoph Marksches, “Hauptleitung,” in *Antike christliche Apokryphen*, 1:1–183; François Bovon, “Apocrypha/Pseudepigrapha III: New Testament,” *RPP* 1:308–9.

4. See Tuckett, “Introduction,” 7; see also Dieter Lührmann, *Die apokryph gewordenen Evangelien: Studien zu neuen Texten und zu neuen Fragen*, NovTSup 112 (Leiden: Brill, 2004); Lührmann, *Fragmente apokryph gewordener Evangelien in griechischer und lateinischer Sprache*, MTS 59 (Marburg: Elwert, 2000).

5. See Silke Petersen, “Die Evangelienüberschriften und die Entstehung des neutestamentlichen Kanons,” *ZNW* 97 (2006): 250–74.

evidence from ancient text collections that have been rediscovered in the modern era (see below) also shows that these texts were read and used during subsequent centuries. Epiphanius of Salamis (fourth century) and Athanasius of Alexandria in his Easter letter (367 CE) found it necessary to attack these texts, which indicates that a universally accepted canon was still debated among groups that defined themselves as Christians. Thus the patristic writers do not attest to the existence of a widely accepted and unquestionable fixed canon but rather to their will to form one.

2. Different Text Groups and Traditions

Collections of early Christian apocrypha, the present volume included, always involve many different kinds of texts, selected using various criteria, because apocryphal texts do not form a coherent group. In modern collections, it is common to group texts according to their genre and thus to use categories such as gospels, letters, apocalypses, and apostolic acts. This, however, is quite challenging because the titles of the texts, if they have survived at all, do not always match the modern categories. Moreover, some texts seem to belong to more than one genre, which makes their classification difficult. The texts are usually not named after their (alleged) authors; rather, the figures who lend their names to the writings, such as Thomas, Peter, Mary Magdalene, and Mary the Mother of Jesus, often appear as their main characters. Such texts include, among others, gospels associated with Thomas, Mary, and Philip and acts of apostles linked to Andrew, Paul, and Thecla. A number of texts are known only by title, while fragments of others have been preserved as quotations in patristic writings. Some are known through newly discovered fragments of ancient papyri that do not contain the slightest clue of a possible title. The heterogeneity of the material shows itself in the attempts of modern text collections to define the term *apocrypha*. Recent definitions are intentionally left quite open, such as the one by Christopher Tuckett in *The Oxford Handbook of Early Christian Apocrypha*: “‘Apocrypha’ are texts which either have the form of biblical texts which became canonical, or tell stories about characters in the biblical texts which became canonical, or convey words purportedly spoken by these characters.”⁶

6. Tuckett, “Introduction,” 8. See also the definition in Marksches, “Haupteinleitung,” 114.

One possible way to group these texts is according to their reception histories. On the one hand, some texts were lost for centuries and were found, often by accident, and became accessible only in modern times. These include the papyrus codices found near the Upper Egyptian city of Nag Hammadi in 1945, which contain Coptic texts, most of which are presumably translations (probably from Greek). One of these codices, which has received the modern identification Codex II, has the Gospel of Thomas as its second text; the abbreviation used for the Gospel of Thomas, NHC II 2, indicates that it is the second text of the second Nag Hammadi codex. Three additional papyrus fragments of the Gospel of Thomas have been found in Greek. They belong to the large group of papyri discovered in Oxyrhynchus in Egypt at the end of the nineteenth century and prove the date of the text before the end of the second century. In addition to these, two other papyrus codices discovered in modern times deserve to be mentioned: the Codex Berolinensis Gnosticus 8502 and the Codex Tchacos. Some of the texts they contain also belong to the Nag Hammadi codices, but they also include other lost and previously unknown texts, such as the Gospel of Mary in the Berlin Codex and the Gospel of Judas in Codex Tchacos.⁷

On the other hand, other texts survived through the centuries in numerous versions and translations, often with a rich, albeit fragmentary, tradition history closely related to art, religion, and theology. Among the texts of this group, those that relate to Mary the mother of Jesus and her prehistory or that tell stories about Jesus's childhood have been particularly influential. The transmission of many parts of apocryphal acts of the apostles is characterized by a similar textual diversity, including various additions and modifications. The numerous versions of Thecla's story and the traditions related to the apostle Thomas in India serve as illuminating examples. These traditions continue in hagiographic literature, particularly those that revolve around Mary the mother of Jesus and the apostle Thecla.⁸

7. English translations of the Nag Hammadi texts as well as of the Gospel of Mary can be found in James M. Robinson, ed., *The Nag Hammadi Library in English*, 4th rev. ed. (Leiden: Brill, 1996); Marvin Meyer, ed., *The Nag Hammadi Scriptures: The International Edition* (New York: HarperCollins, 2007). For the translation of the Gospel of Judas, see Rödolpho Kasser, Marvin Meyer, and Gregor Wurst, eds., *The Gospel of Judas: From the Codex Tchacos* (Washington, DC: National Geographic, 2006).

8. On the transition from apocrypha to hagiographic literature and problems with definitions, see Markschieß, "Hauptleitung," 109–11.

The different transmission histories of these two text groups correspond to their different reception histories. Therefore the essays in this volume, itself part of a reception-history project named *The Bible and Women*, are arranged into different sections. The first two sections are titled “Newly Discovered Texts” and “Texts in Continuous Use,” respectively. In addition, a third section deals with women’s texts and is titled “Female Voices in Ancient Texts?” While the texts of the third section are normally not counted among apocryphal works, they have more in common with them than is obvious at first glance. We will first present possible connections by means of an example and then discuss them more theoretically.

3. Texts Written by Women, about Women, and for Women?

In one manuscript of 1 Clement, a text that did not become canonical, an appeal to women is made as part of a longer paraenetical instruction: “Let them demonstrate by their silence the moderation of their tongue” (1 Clem. 21.7).⁹ This appeal, contained in the eleventh-century Codex Hierosolymitanus, is hardly surprising, given the command for women to be silent found in New Testament letters and other ancient (Christian and non-Christian) writings (see 1 Cor 14:34–35; 1 Tim 2:12; Sir 26:14; Clement of Alexandria, *Paed.* 2.7.58; Ambrose, *Virg.* 3.3.11). What is surprising, however, is a variant reading of the passage in the Codex Alexandrinus from the late fourth or early fifth century: “Let them demonstrate *by their voice* the moderation of their tongue.” A difference of only three letters in Greek (τῆς φωνῆς instead of τῆς σιγῆς) leads to opposite ideas and contrary images of an ideal woman: one is silent; the other speaks with a clear voice. Codex Alexandrinus is the older of the two manuscripts, but in this case it offers a singular reading, while all other known manuscripts, including Codex Hierosolymitanus and Syrian, Coptic, and Latin translations, as well as Clement of Alexandria (*Strom.* 14.17.108), prefer the reading with the silent woman.

Interestingly, according to different traditions, the scribe who produced Codex Alexandrinus was a woman named Thecla.¹⁰ This cannot be

9. τὸ ἐπιεικὲς τῆς γλώσσης αὐτῶν διὰ τῆς σιγῆς φανερόν ποιησάτωσαν. English translation by Michael W. Holmes, *The Apostolic Fathers: Greek Texts and English Translations*, 3rd ed. (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2007), 75, 77.

10. See Kim Haines-Eitzen, *The Gendered Palimpsest: Women, Writing, and Representation in Early Christianity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 3–8.

historically accurate, if this means ascribing the manuscript to the apostle Thecla, who is linked with the time of the apostle Paul. It is possible, however, that the reference is to another woman with the same name or that the codex was produced in a monastery dedicated to Thecla. Nevertheless, it is remarkable that the reading favorable to women coincides with a reference to a female scribe.

Codex Alexandrinus is one of the so-called great codices that began to be made in the fourth century. It contained the entire text of the Greek Bible, in other words, both the Old Testament (including the so-called deuterocanonical books) and the New Testament and, following the book of Revelation, two letters ascribed to Clement (1–2 Clement). This shows that the letters of Clement were handed down and identified as biblical texts. While Codex Alexandrinus is one of the most important early biblical manuscripts in textual criticism, it contains numerous orthographic irregularities. These result particularly from confusions in spelling of individual letters and letter combinations that were pronounced identically when the texts were copied.¹¹ In older research, the variant voice/silence was explained as just such a mistake.¹² Alternatively, the many mistakes in the codex have been interpreted as an indication of a female scribe, for an educated scribe would not have made such orthographical mistakes.¹³ Only recently have both phenomena, the women-friendly textual variant and the reference to a female scribe, been brought together.¹⁴

This small example shows the connection between different forms of marginalization with regard to apocryphal texts, passages that marginalize women, and texts written by women and female scribes. They all fall easily outside the mainstream tradition and history of reception, since there are few who read apocryphal writings, follow variant readings in different manuscripts, and trace marginal notes referring to the scribes of ancient codices. Nevertheless, they may allow us to hear a female voice, as

11. These include, for example, changes of vowels because of itacism (the identical pronunciation of *i, u, ei, oi*, etc.) or because of identical pronunciation of *o* and *ω*.

12. See Rudolf Knopf, *Der erste Clemensbrief untersucht und herausgegeben*, TU 20.1, NS 5.1 (Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1899), 24. “Probably a great deal of negligence explains 217 *φωνής* instead of *σιγής* (*γλώσσης* occurs almost immediately before).”

13. See Johann Jakob Wettstein, *Prolegomena ad Novi Testamenti editionem accuratissimam* (Amsterdam: Wetstenios & Smith, 1730), 9–11.

14. See Haines-Eitzen, *Gendered Palimpsest*, 6: “Was it an attempt of some kind of ‘proto-feminist’ at rewriting the silencing of women?”

suggested by Athalya Brenner and Fokkeli van Dijk-Hemmes in their discussion of female authors. Male authorship is self-evidently assumed for biblical texts, usually (though not as constantly) for apocryphal texts as well, while female authorship must be proved.¹⁵ We simply do not have enough information to prove female authorship, for ancient texts were often handed down without their authors being identified. For this reason, the concept of female voice can be helpful; it does not directly refer to a female author but to a female perspective or tone in the text through which the text is gendered.¹⁶

In the present volume, this means that the chapters in the third section, which assume female authorship (such as the texts by Perpetua, Proba, Eudocia, and Egeria), can also shed light on the texts of the other sections.¹⁷ The inclusion of such women's texts in a volume on apocrypha indicates that it is possible to detect a female perspective not only in texts whose female authorship is relatively uncontroversial but also in other texts.¹⁸ For example, some studies on the so-called apocryphal acts of the apostles have proposed that groups of women played an important role in transmitting oral stories on which the written texts are based.¹⁹ It is

15. See Athalya Brenner and Fokkeli van Dijk-Hemmes, *On Gendering Texts: Female and Male Voices in the Hebrew Bible* (Leiden: Brill, 1993), 2. In the foreword to the volume, Mieke Bal asks: "The possibility that women might have contributed to the production of the Bible has not been taken seriously and yet the idea that everything is male unless otherwise proven is hardly acceptable. What can one do?" (ix).

16. See Brenner and Van Dijk-Hemmes, *On Gendering Texts*, 2, who pose the question: "Is it possible to gender a text or its author, that is, to define one or the other, or both, as a product of women's culture or men's culture?"

17. Some of the women's texts are written later than the texts that are usually defined as apocrypha. However, this is not an argument against their treatment together, as the term *ancient* in the title "Ancient Christian Apocrypha" covers the time period to the eighth century; see Marksches, "Haupteinleitung," 8.

18. On female authors in antiquity, see Ross Shepard Kraemer, "Women's Authorship of Jewish and Christian Literature in the Greco-Roman Period," in *Women Like This: New Perspectives on Jewish Women in the Greco-Roman World*, ed. Amy-Jill Levine, EJM 1 (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1991), 221–42; Susan Ashbrook Harvey, "Women and Words: Texts by and about Women," in *The Cambridge History of Early Christian Literature*, ed. Frances Young, Lewis Ayres, and Andrew Louth (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 382–90.

19. This shows how complex the production and transmission of ancient texts was and how inadequate is the concept of one identifiable male author. This applies to both the possible oral transmission processes behind the texts and the modifications during

possible to suppose that, similarly to the texts in the third section, at least some of the apocryphal texts were written and copied by women—but we do not know this exactly. The subtitle of this volume, “Marginalized Texts in Early Christianity,” indicates that both sets of texts, which are usually studied in separate publications, have been similarly marginalized in their reception histories. They are found only at the margins of the normative Christian tradition; they are often regarded as less valuable, sometimes even heretical; consequently, they are read, discussed, and commented on much less frequently.

When texts usually treated separately and by different scholars are brought together, they can enrich one another. An example of this occurred during the conference that was organized in preparation of this volume, as a parallel from the texts of the Phrygian prophecy (also called Montanism) provided a solution to interpret a Nag Hammadi text.²⁰ From a hermeneutical perspective, it can be beneficial to shift one’s perspective on familiar texts by changing their contexts and to cross the boundaries of scholarly traditions, categories, and text collections.

4. On the Contents of the Present Volume

Following this introduction, Karen L. King offers a further introduction to our topic, as she analyzes the division of early Christian texts into orthodox and heretical groups, a classification still commonly in use. Such categorization is closely linked to authority, but its persuasive power is largely based on disguising this by claiming that these categories are given, not discursively generated. The orthodoxy-heresy division also (re)produces the marginalization of women. However, if texts that have been marginalized by labeling them heretical are included within Christianity, the classification of the previously well-known texts also changes, since they are read in the context of a wider spectrum of Christian opinions.

copying, and offers a historical counterpart of modern theories about the “death of the author.” See Roland Barthes, “The Death of the Author,” in *Image—Music—Text* (New York: Hill & Wang, 1977), 142–48; Michel Foucault, “What Is an Author?,” in *The Foucault Reader*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York: Pantheon Books, 1984), 101–20.

20. Meanwhile published as Uwe-Karsten Plisch, “‘Du zeigst das Übermaß des Erklärers’—Ein Verständnisproblem im Dialog des Erlösers (NHC III,5) und seine Lösung,” in *Ägypten und der christliche Orient*, ed. Heike Behlmer et al. (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2018), 233–35.

The four essays that follow deal with newly discovered texts, as explained above, mostly from Nag Hammadi. Judith Hartenstein writes about “Female Disciples of Jesus in Early Cristian Gospels: The Gospel of Mary, Wisdom of Jesus Christ, and Other Gospels in Dialogue Form.” Hartenstein gives an overview of women as recipients of revelation and as Jesus’s dialogue partners. She asks how the texts understand female discipleship and then turns to the most important female disciples, such as Mary Magdalene, and groups of female disciples and their functions in these texts. In addition, she sheds light on the theological requirements for female discipleship.

Antti Marjanen deals with rewritten Eve traditions in the *Nature of the Rulers* (NHC II 4), one of the numerous Nag Hammadi texts that contain Genesis interpretations. Marjanen analyzes the motifs of the creation, rape, and fall of Eve, who is virtually split into a heavenly and an earthly Eve. In addition, the *Nature of the Rulers* introduces Norea, the daughter of Eve, whose role in the stories of origins is particularly important. In this text, Norea is the one who receives and mediates the salvific knowledge and thus becomes the ancestor of the Sethians; this has also been read as an indication of female authorship.

In the next contribution, Uwe-Karsten Plisch presents several female revelator figures who appear in Nag Hammadi texts: Sophia, Norea, Protennoia, and Brontē. Typically, they present themselves in the first-person and/or mediate heavenly knowledge to humans. The Sophia figure in these texts is based on the Old Testament imagery of God’s Wisdom (Sophia; e.g., Prov 8). On the one hand, she is described as participating in the primeval fall, which triggers the creation of the world; on the other hand, the female figures associated with her, Norea, Protennoia, and Brontē, are central in the redemption and act as mediators of heavenly knowledge in poetic form.

Silke Petersen deals with the ideals of becoming male and eliminating gender distinctions in early Christian texts that have become apocryphal. Starting from the Gospel of Thomas, her analysis shows two ways of describing the transcendence of gender in the hierarchically structured ancient manner of speaking. Either becoming male is synonymous with becoming spiritual by overcoming corporeality, or the result of becoming spiritual is described as the overcoming or annulment of gender difference. Both modes of speech emphasize the superiority of male and spiritual over female and corporeal in the ancient conceptualizations.

In the next section, the focus is on texts that, unlike the newly discovered texts, have been in continuous use and widely transmitted through

the centuries. This applies particularly to the Protevangelium of James, with the Virgin Mary as its main figure. Silvia Pellegrini deals with Mary's birth and virginity in this text, which emphasizes Mary's extraordinary purity from a narrative point of view. The text first describes her own birth and then the birth of her son, Jesus. The emphasis on Mary's virginity even after the birth of Jesus guarantees his divine origin but also exposes the text's androcentric perspective of the figure of Mary.

Ursula Ulrike Kaiser explores gender roles in the Infancy Gospel of Thomas, an early Christian collection of short stories primarily on the miracles that Jesus performed as a child. The child Jesus is not only kind and helpful but can be quick-tempered and unpredictable, which causes problems for his parents, most of all for his father. Joseph fails many times in his male role as the caretaker, while Jesus's power and self-control, a key virtue according to the ancient ideal of masculine behavior, are highlighted. The figure of Mary remains in the background.

The following four essays are devoted to apocryphal acts of the apostles. First, Carmen Bernabé Ubieta deals with the ways of life described in these texts, which propagate an ascetic ideal throughout. After an overview of previous research, she focuses on the question of the relationship between the texts and the lives of historical women, particularly whether chastity in fact had a role in increasing women's autonomy.

Next, Outi Lehtipuu examines how apostolic authority is conveyed in the Acts of Thecla and its narrative world. She argues that Paul, presented as a Christlike figure and a teacher of truth, is an authority-bearing figure in the story. His preaching of abstinence (ἐγκράτεια) is fleshed out in a series of beatitudes, which Lehtipuu analyzes in their wider context, including their connections with the Gospel of Matthew and 1 Corinthians. She concludes by asking what attraction and what consequences the preaching of abstinence might have had particularly for women.

Bernadette J. Brooten provides an intersectional analysis of gender and slavery in the Acts of Andrew. In this work the slave owner Maximilla ensures her chastity by substituting her slave Euklia in the bed of her husband, which eventually leads to the murder of Euklia. The idealization of female virginity and chastity only works against the backdrop of slavery. One woman can lead a holy life only because the other woman cannot do so.

Anna Rebecca Solevåg also carries out an intersectional analysis by relating gender and disability in the Acts of Peter. After an overview of disability studies, Solevåg analyzes how physical disability is used as a narrative device in the Acts of Peter. The text demonstrates Peter's apostolic

power to paralyze—which he uses predominantly on women. Particularly instructive is the story of Peter’s daughter, whom the father first heals but then unheals so she does not become a temptation for men.

The last section of this volume deals with female voices in ancient texts. The first three chapters treat texts that were most likely written by women. Part of the story of the martyrdom of Perpetua is written in a form of a diary that, according to most scholars, she wrote herself. Anna Carfora examines this prison diary, paying particular attention to Perpetua’s dream visions. She analyzes how the visions adapt biblical references and set them in new combinations.

The subject of María José Cabezas Cabello is the reception of Genesis in the works of the poets Faltonia Betitia Proba and Athenais Eudokia (fourth and fifth centuries). After presenting their biography and introducing the genre of cento, she focuses on the renarrations of Genesis, which Proba undertakes in the form of a Virgilian cento and Eudocia in a Homeric cento. According to Cabello, both texts are examples of “a female discourse in a tradition dominated by men.”

M. Dolores Martin Trutet treats another text written by a woman, the travel diary of Egeria, which consists of the notes she made on her pilgrimage to the holy sites in the late fourth century. Egeria’s travel is inspired by the Holy Scriptures: “The biblical women find space and relevance within the textual pilgrimage, spirituality, and cartography of salvation created by Egeria.” Trutet also pays attention to the connections and references to the Acts of Thecla and Egeria’s encounters with historical and contemporary women.

Cristina Simonelli’s essay is about another potential female (co)author of a Christian text. The name of Therasia is mentioned alongside with her husband, Paulinus of Nola, at the end of a poem (epithalamium) for the wedding of Titia and Julian, the future bishop of Eclanum. However, she is rarely mentioned in secondary literature. Simonelli presents the historical and biographical framework of the wedding poem and the biblical themes and references contained in it.

Heidrun Mader examines women of the Phrygian prophecy, a movement that was later deemed heretical and called Montanism. The works of these female prophets were systematically destroyed, and only a few logia have been preserved in writings that are hostile toward them. Mader analyzes and contextualizes the logia of two prophets, Maximilla and Quintilla. While Maximilla speaks of herself using male attributes, Quintilla describes Christ as a female figure.

The volume closes with Ute E. Eisen's treatment of grave inscriptions of early Christian women, a source that has attracted little attention thus far. Eisen first introduces the genre and assesses its value for women's and gender history, then treats two inscriptions, written for and by female deacons, in more detail. In her intertextual analysis, she shows how the inscriptions and the New Testament texts can be reciprocally interpreted. The reception of these texts opens new horizons of meaning for the inscriptions as well as for the New Testament texts and the story of the women who tell them.

SBL Press