

PAUL THE MARTYR

SBL

Society of Biblical Literature



Writings from the Greco-Roman World Supplement Series

John T. Fitzgerald, Editor

Number 4

PAUL THE MARTYR

The Cult of the Apostle in the Latin West

PAUL THE MARTYR

THE CULT OF THE APOSTLE IN THE LATIN WEST

By

David L. Eastman

Society of Biblical Literature
Atlanta

PAUL THE MARTYR
The Cult of the Apostle in the Latin West

Copyright © 2011 by the Society of Biblical Literature

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, Society of Biblical Literature, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Eastman, David L.

Paul the martyr : the cult of the apostle in the latin west / by David L. Eastman.

p. cm. — (Society of Biblical Literature. Writings from the Greco-Roman World. Supplements ; 4)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-58983-515-3 (paper binding : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-1-58983-516-0 (electronic format)

1. Paul, the Apostle, Saint—Cult—Rome. I. Title.

BS2506.3.E27 2011

225.9' 2—dc22

2011000223

19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12 11 5 4 3 2 1

Printed on acid-free, recycled paper conforming to
ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (R1997) and ISO 9706:1994
standards for paper permanence.



CONTENTS

Acknowledgments.....	vii
Abbreviations.....	ix
Figures.....	xix
Introduction.....	1

PART 1: THE CULT OF PAUL IN ROME

1. The Cult of Paul on the Ostian Road.....	15
2. The Cult of Paul on the Appian Road.....	71

PART 2: THE EXPANSION OF THE CULT OUTSIDE ROME

3. The Spread of the Pauline Cult in Latin Europe.....	117
4. The Pauline Cult in North Africa.....	155
Conclusion.....	187
Bibliography.....	189
Scriptural Citations.....	225
Primary Source Citations.....	226
Subject Index.....	227

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Writing this book has been possible only because of the generous support of my family and many other people in my life. First and foremost, I wish to thank my wife, Natalie, who has been a constant source of encouragement throughout this process and a wonderful companion on the many adventures that research travel can bring.

My research has been greatly aided by the feedback of a number of colleagues. Bentley Layton, Stephen Davis, Robert S. Nelson, Harold Attridge, and John Matthews read this manuscript in dissertation form and offered insightful critiques that sparked my thinking in fruitful directions as I began revisions. John T. Fitzgerald has done exemplary work as the editor of this volume, always prompting greater clarity in the development of my arguments. A number of other colleagues have read portions of this manuscript or have brought to my attention important comparative materials, including Candida Moss, Nicola Camerlenghi, Ryan Stokes, Brent Nongbri, Timothy Luckritz Marquis, Paul Dilley, Tudor Sala, Michael Peppard, Joshua Garroway, Jeremy Hultin, Joshua Burns, Adela Yarbro Collins, Dale Martin, Robert Gregg, Raymond Van Dam, Danny Praet, Robin Jensen, Marcia Colish, Kevin Wilkinson, and Wolfgang Wischmeyer. I am also indebted to the many great teacher-scholars who have invested in me and fueled my enthusiasm for historical exploration, especially Timothy Gregory, Paul Magdalino, Ruth Macrides, Jean-Pierre Arrignon, and Helmut Koester.

Special assistance during my research in Rome was provided by Giorgio Filippi, Director of Excavations at the Basilica of St. Paul Outside the Walls, who has graciously allowed me access to photographs and other materials related to his ongoing research at the basilica. Umberto Utrio, Curator of the Museo Pio Cristiano of the Vatican Museums, spent an afternoon discussing with me the museum's rich collection of sarcophagi and has since provided me with other research support. Financial support for research travel came from Yale University, the Stavros S. Niarchos Research Fellowship, and the Berkeley, Biddle, and Woolsey Travel Fellowship of the Yale Department of Classics.

Finally, I wish to extend sincere thanks to my parents, John and Beulah Eastman. Over the years they have made numerous sacrifices—too many to count, in fact—to enable me to pursue my academic dreams. This book is dedicated to them.

ABBREVIATIONS

PRIMARY SOURCES

<i>1 Apol.</i>	Justin Martyr, <i>Apologia I</i>
<i>1 Clem.</i>	<i>1 Clement</i> (Πρὸς Κορινθίους)
<i>Act. apost.</i>	Arator, <i>De actibus apostolorum</i>
<i>Acta Cypr.</i>	<i>Acta Cypriani</i>
<i>Acta mart. Scillit.</i>	<i>Acta martyrum Scillitanorum</i>
<i>Acta Pet.</i>	<i>Acta Petri</i>
<i>Acta Pet. Paul.</i>	<i>Acta Petri et Pauli</i>
<i>Acta Phil.</i>	<i>Acta Phileae</i>
<i>Acta Thom.</i>	<i>Acta Thomae</i>
<i>Acta Xanth. Pol. Reb.</i>	<i>Acta Xanthippae et Polyxenae et Rebeccae</i>
<i>Adv. Donat.</i>	Optatus of Milev, <i>Adversus Donatistas</i>
<i>Adv. Jud.</i>	Tertullian, <i>Adversus Iudaeos</i>
<i>Aen.</i>	Virgil, <i>Aeneid</i>
<i>Ann.</i>	Tacitus, <i>Annales</i>
<i>Apol.</i>	Tertullian, <i>Apologeticus</i>
<i>Apos. Con.</i>	<i>Constitutiones apostolicae</i>
<i>Bibl. hist.</i>	Diodorus of Sicily, <i>Bibliotheca historica</i>
<i>Brev. vit.</i>	Seneca, <i>De brevitate vitae</i> (<i>Epistulae morales</i>)
<i>C. Const.</i>	Hilary of Poitiers, <i>Liber contra Constantium</i>
<i>C. Galil.</i>	Julian, <i>Contra Galileos</i>
<i>C. litt. Petil.</i>	Augustine of Hippo, <i>Contra litteras Petilianii</i>
<i>Carm.</i>	<i>Carmina</i> (various authors)
<i>Catech.</i>	Cyril of Jerusalem, <i>Catecheses</i>
<i>Chron.</i>	Jerome, <i>Chronicon</i>
<i>Cod. Theod.</i>	<i>Codex Theodosianus</i>
<i>Comm. Ezech.</i>	Jerome, <i>Commentariorum in Ezechielem libri XVI</i>
<i>Comm. Gal.</i>	Jerome, <i>Commentariorum in Epistulam ad Gatatas libri III</i>
<i>Conf.</i>	Augustine of Hippo, <i>Confessionum libri XIII</i>
<i>Cur.</i>	Augustine of Hippo, <i>De cura pro mortuis gerenda</i>

<i>Dep. mart.</i>	<i>Depositio martyrum</i>
<i>Dial.</i>	Sulpicius Severus, <i>Dialogi</i>
<i>Dies nat. Pet. Paul.</i>	Augustine of Hippo, <i>Sermo in die natalico apostolorum sanctorum Petri et Pauli</i>
<i>Div.</i>	Cicero, <i>De divinatione</i>
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistulae</i> (various authors)
<i>Ep. Tars.</i>	Pseudo-Ignatius, <i>Epistula ad Tarsenses</i>
<i>Ep. Tra.</i>	Pliny the Younger, <i>Epistulae ad Trajanum</i>
<i>Epigr.</i>	<i>Epigrammata</i> (various authors)
<i>Epit. chron.</i>	Prosper of Aquitaine, <i>Epitoma chronicon</i>
<i>Exc.</i>	Ambrose of Milan, <i>De excessu fratris sui Satyri</i>
<i>Fast.</i>	Ovid, <i>Fasti</i>
<i>Flod. hist. rem. eccl.</i>	Flodard of Reims, <i>Flodoardi historia remensis ecclesiae</i>
<i>Fr. hist.</i>	Hilary of Poitiers, <i>Fragments historica</i>
FSI	Fonti per la storia d'Italia
<i>Geogr.</i>	Strabo, <i>Geographica</i>
<i>Glor. mart.</i>	Gregory of Tours, <i>De gloria martyrum</i>
<i>Glor. martyr.</i>	Pseudo-Cyprian, <i>De gloria martyrii</i>
<i>Goth.</i>	Procopius of Caesarea, <i>Bellum gothicum</i>
<i>Haer.</i>	Irenaeus of Lyon, <i>Adversus haereses</i>
<i>Herm. Vis.</i>	Shepherd of Hermas, <i>Vision(s)</i>
<i>Hist. eccl.</i>	<i>Historia ecclesiastica</i> (various authors)
<i>Hist. franc.</i>	Gregory of Tours, <i>Historia francorum</i>
<i>Hist. persec.</i>	Victor of Vita, <i>Historia persecutionis Africanae provinciae</i>
<i>Hist. Rom.</i>	Velleius Paterculus, <i>Historiae Romanae</i>
<i>Hom.</i>	<i>Homiliae</i> (various authors)
<i>Hom. Act.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>Homiliae in Acta apostolorum</i>
<i>Hom. Eph.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>Homiliae in epistulam ad Ephesios</i>
<i>Hom. Gen.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>Homiliae in Genesim</i>
<i>Hom. Rom.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>Homiliae in epistulam ad Romanos</i>
<i>Hymn.</i>	Ambrose of Milan, <i>Hymni</i>
<i>Ign. Rom.</i>	Ignatius of Antioch, <i>To the Romans</i>
<i>Itiner.</i>	Egeria, <i>Itinerarium</i>
<i>Jud. gent.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>Contra Judaeos et gentiles quod Christus sit deus</i>
<i>Laud. Paul.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>De laudibus sancti Pauli apostoli</i>
<i>Laud. sanct.</i>	Victricius of Rouen, <i>De laude sanctorum</i>
<i>Leg.</i>	Cicero, <i>De legibus</i>
<i>Lib. pontif.</i>	<i>Liber pontificalis</i>
<i>Loc. sanct.</i>	<i>De locis sanctis martyrum quae sunt foris civitatis Romae</i>
<i>Luct.</i>	Lucian of Samosata, <i>De luctu</i>

<i>Mart.</i>	John Chrysostom, <i>Homilia in martyres</i>
<i>Mart. Ascen. Isa.</i>	<i>Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah</i>
<i>Mart. Hier.</i>	<i>Martyrologium Hieronymianum</i>
<i>Mart. Ign.</i>	<i>Martyrium Ignatii</i>
<i>Mart. Paul.</i>	<i>Martyrium sancti Pauli apostoli (Acta Pauli)</i>
<i>Mart. Perp. Felic.</i>	<i>Martyrium Perpetuae et Felicitatis</i>
<i>Mart. Pol.</i>	<i>Martyrium Polycarpi</i>
<i>Mirabil.</i>	<i>Mirabiliana</i>
<i>Mirac. Anast.</i>	<i>Miraculum sancti Anastasii martyris</i>
<i>Mirac. Theclae</i>	Basil of Seleucia, <i>Miracula Theclae</i>
<i>Mort.</i>	Lactantius, <i>De mortibus persecutorum</i>
<i>Nero</i>	Suetonius, <i>Vita neronis (De vita caesarum)</i>
<i>Oboed.</i>	Augustine of Hippo, <i>De oboedientia</i>
<i>Or. 4 (C. Jul.)</i>	Gregory of Nazianzus, <i>Oratio 4 (Contra Julianum)</i>
<i>Pass. Dat. Saturn.</i>	<i>Passio ss. Dativi, Saturnini presb. et aliorum (Acts of the Abitinian Martyrs)</i>
<i>Pass. Paul.</i>	<i>Passio sancti Pauli apostoli</i>
<i>Pass. Pet. Paul.</i>	<i>Passio sanctorum apostolorum Petri et Pauli</i>
<i>Pass. Sebast.</i>	<i>Passio Sebastiani</i>
<i>Paul. ep. comm.</i>	Theodoret of Cyrus, <i>In quatuordecim sancti Pauli epistolas commentarius</i>
<i>Perist.</i>	Prudentius, <i>Peristephanon (De coronis martyrum)</i>
<i>Praescr.</i>	Tertullian, <i>De praescriptione haereticorum</i>
<i>Profut.</i>	Vigilius of Rome, <i>Epistula Vigilii papae ad Profuturum episcopum</i>
<i>Relat.</i>	Symmachus, <i>Relationes</i>
<i>Rom.</i>	Plutarch, <i>Vita Romuli (Vitae parallelae)</i>
<i>Sacrum. Leon.</i>	<i>Sacramentarium Leonianum (Sacramentarium Veronense)</i>
<i>Sanct. Eph. Alex.</i>	Eusebius "Gallicanus," <i>Hom. 55: De sanctis martyribus Ephypodio et Alexandro</i>
<i>Sanct. Maxim.</i>	Faustus of Riez, <i>De sancte Maxime</i>
<i>Scorp.</i>	Tertullian, <i>Scorpiace</i>
<i>Serm.</i>	<i>Sermones</i> (various authors)
<i>Temp. rat.</i>	Bede, <i>De temporum ratione (Chronica maiora)</i>
<i>Theoph.</i>	Eusebius of Caesarea, <i>Theophania</i>
<i>Tract. Ps.</i>	Jerome, <i>Tractatus sive homiliae in psalmos</i>
<i>Urb. cond.</i>	Livy, <i>Ab urbe condita</i>
<i>Vero Aug.</i>	Marcus Cornelius Fronto, <i>Vero Augusto Domino meo</i>
<i>Vigil.</i>	Jerome, <i>Adversus Vigilantium</i>
<i>Vir. ill.</i>	Jerome, <i>De viris illustribus</i>
<i>Virginit.</i>	Ambrose of Milan, <i>De virginitate</i>

<i>Vit. Ambr.</i>	Paulinus of Milan, <i>Vita Ambrosii</i>
<i>Vit. Apoll.</i>	Philostratus, <i>Vita Apollonii</i>
<i>Vit. Const.</i>	Eusebius of Caesarea, <i>Vita Constantini</i>
<i>Vit. Cypr.</i>	Pontius of Carthage, <i>Vita Cypriani</i>
<i>Vit. Epiph.</i>	<i>Vita sancti Epiphanii</i>
<i>Vit. Fulg.</i>	Ferrandus of Carthage, <i>Vita sancti Fulgentii</i>
<i>Vit. Leon.</i>	<i>Vita sancti Leonis papae</i>
<i>Vit. Mart.</i>	<i>Vita Martini</i> (various authors)
<i>Vit. Maxim.</i>	Dinamius Patricius, <i>Vita Maximi</i>
<i>Vit. patrum</i>	Gregory of Tours, <i>Vita patrum</i>
<i>Vit. patrum Iur. Eug.</i>	<i>Vita patrum Iurensium (Eugendii)</i>
<i>Vit. sanct. Mart.</i>	Sulpicius Severus, <i>Vita sancti Martini</i>

SECONDARY SOURCES

AASS	<i>Acta sanctorum quotquot toto orbe coluntur</i> . 68 vols. Antwerp and Brussels: Societé des Bollandistes, 1643–1940.
AcAr	<i>Acta archaeologica</i> (Copenhagen)
AcBern	<i>Acta Bernensia</i>
ACW	Ancient Christian Writers
AEAA	<i>Archivo Español de Arte y Arqueología</i>
AEAr	<i>Archivo Español de Arqueología</i>
<i>AevumAnt</i>	<i>Aevum Antiquum</i>
<i>AfRG</i>	<i>Archiv für Religionsgeschichte</i>
AJA	<i>American Journal of Archaeology</i>
AJP	<i>American Journal of Philology</i>
AJT	<i>American Journal of Theology</i>
AKG	Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte
AlOm.A	Alpha-Omega. Lexika, Indizes, Konkordanzen zur klassischen Philologie. Reihe A
<i>Ambr</i>	<i>Ambrosius</i>
<i>AMidi</i>	<i>Annales du Midi</i>
AnBib	Analecta Biblica
<i>AnBoll</i>	<i>Analecta Bollandiana</i>
ANRW	<i>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung</i> . Part 2, <i>Principat</i> . Edited by Hildegard Temporini and Wolfgang Haase. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1972–.
<i>AnTard</i>	<i>Antiquité tardive</i>
APARA.D	<i>Atti della Pontificia Accademia Romana di Archeologia, Dissertazioni</i>

APARA.R	<i>Atti della Pontificia Accademia Romana di Archeologia, Rendiconti</i>
ARID	<i>Analecta Romana Instituti Danici</i>
ArtB	<i>The Art Bulletin</i>
ASEs	<i>Annali di storia dell'esegesi</i>
Aug	<i>Augustinianum</i>
AUU.HR	Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis. Historia Religionum
BA	<i>Biblical Archaeologist</i>
BAA	<i>Bulletin d'Archéologie algérienne</i>
BAC	Biblioteca de autores cristianos
BAH	Bibliothèque archéologique et historique. Institut français d'archéologie de Beyrouth
BAnT	Bibliothèque de l'Antiquité tardive
BArC	<i>Bullettino di Archeologia Cristiana</i>
BARIS	British Archaeological Reports International Series
BBR	<i>Bulletin for Biblical Research</i>
BEFAR	Bibliothèque des Écoles françaises d'Athènes et de Rome
BEHEc	Bibliothèque de l'enseignement de l'histoire ecclésiastique
BEL.H	Bibliotheca "Ephemerides liturgicae." Sectio historica
BETL	Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologiarum Lovanien-sium
BHBB	Biblioteca histórica de la Biblioteca Balmes
BibS(F)	Biblische Studien (Freiburg)
BMusPont	<i>Bollettino dei Monumenti, Musei e Gallerie Pontificie</i>
BRAH	<i>Boletín de la Real Academia de la Historia</i>
BTGran	Biblioteca teológica Granadina
BWeid	Bibliotheca Weidmanniana
BZNW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
CACat	Collezione "Amici delle catacombe"
CAr	<i>Cahiers archéologiques</i>
CArch	Christliche Archäologie
CatRI	Catacombe di Roma e d'Italia
CCSA	Corpus Christianorum. Series Apocryphorum
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum. Series latina
CCommChr	Cahiers de Communauté chrétienne
CEFR	Collection de l'École française de Rome
CIL	<i>Corpus inscriptionum Latinarum</i> . Berlin: Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1863–.

CMSBAV	Catalogo del Museo sacro della Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana
CP	<i>Classical Philology</i>
CRAI	Comptes rendus de l'Académie des inscriptions et belles-lettres
CrArte	<i>Critica d'Arte</i>
CRoI	Le chiese di Roma illustrate
CSEL	Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum
CUFr	Collection des universités de France
CUFr.L	Collection des universités de France. Série latine
DACL	<i>Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie</i> . Edited by Fernand Cabrol and Henri Leclercq. 15 vols. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1913–1953.
EBib	Études bibliques
<i>Eccl. occ. mon. iur.</i>	<i>Ecclesiae occidentalis monumenta iuris antiquissima</i> . Edited by Cuthbert H. Turner. 2 vols. Oxford: Clarendon: 1899–1939.
EC	<i>Early Christianity</i>
ECF	The Early Church Fathers
EHS.A	Europäische Hochschulschriften. Reihe 38, Archäologie
EHS.K	Europäische Hochschulschriften. Reihe 28, Kunstgeschichte
EMEur	<i>Early Medieval Europe</i>
Epig	<i>Epigraphica</i>
EPros	Études prosopographiques
EUJaca	Edizioni Universitarie Jaca
FC	Fathers of the Church
FKDG	Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Dogmengeschichte
<i>FoiVie</i>	<i>Foi et Vie</i>
FontC	Fontes christiani
HAnt	<i>Hispania Antiqua</i>
HNT	Handbuch zum Neuen Testament
HRF	Histoire religieuse de la France
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
HTS	Harvard Theological Studies
ICC	International Critical Commentary
ICUR	<i>Inscriptiones christianae urbis Romae septimo saeculo antiquiores</i> . Edited by Giovanni Battista de Rossi. 2 vols. Rome: Roma Officina Libraria Pontificia, 1861–1888. New series edited by Angelo Silvagni, Rome: Befani, 1922–.

ILCV	<i>Inscriptiones Latinae Christianae Veteres</i> . Edited by E. Diehl. 2 vols. Berlin: Weidmann, 1925–1927.
<i>Int</i>	<i>Interpretation</i>
IP	<i>Instrumenta Patristica</i>
ISLL	Illinois Studies in Language and Literature
ISS	Inscriptiones Sanctae Sedis
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JECs	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>
JEH	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i>
JJS	<i>Journal of Jewish Studies</i>
JMEMS	<i>Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies</i>
JOUHS	<i>Journal of the Oxford University History Society</i>
JRS	<i>Journal of Roman Studies</i>
JSAH	<i>Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians</i>
JSNTSup	Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
JTS	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
KAV	Kommentar zu den apostolischen Vätern
KLIO.BAG	<i>KLIO: Beiträge zur alten Geschichte</i>
LNSAS	Leicester-Nottingham Studies in Ancient Society
MAC	Monumenti dell'antichità cristiana
MD	<i>La Maison-Dieu</i>
MDAI(R)	<i>Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Römische Abteilung</i>
MEFR	<i>Mélanges d'archéologie et d'histoire de l'école française de Rome</i>
MEFRA	<i>Mélanges de l'École française de Rome, Antiquité</i>
MGH.AA	Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Auctores antiquissimi
MGH.Ep	Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Epistolae
MIÖG	<i>Mitteilungen des Instituts für österreichische Geschichtsforschung</i>
MNHIR	<i>Mededelingen van het Nederlands Instituut te Rome</i>
MPAIBL	<i>Mémoires présentés par divers savants à l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres de l'Institut de France</i>
MST	Mediaeval Sources in Translation
NAWG.PHK	<i>Nachrichten der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen. Philologisch-Historische Klasse</i>
NBArC	<i>Nuovo Bullettino di Archeologia Cristiana</i>
NC	La Nouvelle Clío
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament

<i>NovT</i>	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NovTSup	Supplements to <i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NS	new series
NSS	Nuovi Studi Storici
OCT	Oxford Classical Texts/ <i>Scriptorum classicorum bibliotheca oxoniensis</i>
OECS	Oxford Early Christian Studies
OHM	Oxford Historical Monographs
OS	old series
<i>PaP</i>	<i>Past and Present</i>
Par.	Paradosis. Études de littérature et de théologie ancienne.
PG	Patrologia graeca. Edited by J.-P. Migne. 161 vols. Paris: Migne, 1857–1866.
PIAUP	Publications de l'Institut d'Art et d'Archéologie de l'Université de Paris
PL	Patrologia latina. Edited by J.-P. Migne. 217 vols. Paris: Migne, 1844–1864.
<i>RAfr</i>	<i>Revue africaine</i>
<i>RAr</i>	<i>Revue archéologique</i>
<i>RBén</i>	<i>Revue bénédictine</i>
<i>REAug</i>	<i>Revue des études augustinienes</i>
<i>RechAug</i>	<i>Recherches augustinienes</i>
RED.F	Rerum ecclesiasticarum documenta. Series maior, Fontes
<i>RevScRel</i>	<i>Revue des sciences religieuses</i>
<i>RHEF</i>	<i>Revue d'histoire de l'Église de France</i>
<i>RHPR</i>	<i>Revue d'Histoire et de Philosophie religieuses</i>
RhWAW.G	Rheinisch-Westfälische Akademie der Wissenschaften: Vorträge G
<i>RivAC</i>	<i>Rivista di Archeologia Cristiana</i>
RL LTC	Recentiores: Later Latin Texts and Contexts
<i>RQ</i>	<i>Römische Quartalschrift für christliche Altertumskunde und Kirchengeschichte</i>
RQ.S	<i>Römische Quartalschrift für christliche Altertumskunde und Kirchengeschichte. Supplement</i>
RSCr	Roma sotterranea cristiana
<i>RSR</i>	<i>Recherches de science religieuse</i>
SAC	Studi di antichità cristiana
SAC(B)	Studi di antichità cristiane (Bologna)
<i>SacEr</i>	<i>Sacris Erudiri</i>
SAEB	Studia archaeologica ("Erma" di Bretschneider)

SBLMS	Society of Biblical Literature Monograph Series
SBLRBS	Society of Biblical Literature Resources for Biblical Study
SBLWGRW	Society of Biblical Literature Writings from the Greco-Roman World
SBLWGRWSup	Society of Biblical Literature Writings from the Greco-Roman World Supplement Series
SC	Sources chrétiennes
SEAug	Studia ephemeridis Augustinianum
SGL	Scriptores Graeci et Latini
SHG	Subsidia Hagiographica
SSAC	Sussidi allo studio delle antichità Cristiana
<i>StPatr</i>	<i>Studia Patristica</i>
StRicNS	Studi e ricerche (Bologna). New Series
StSKG	Studien zur spätantiken Kunstgeschichte
TCH	The Transformation of the Classical Heritage
TCU	Testi e commenti. Università di Urbino. Istituto di filologia classica
TEsp	Temas Españoles
ThH	Théologie historique
TS	Texts and Studies
TTH	Translated Texts for Historians
TTHLS	Translated Texts for Historians. Latin Series
TUGAL	Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur
VC	<i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
VCSup	Supplements to <i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
<i>VetChr</i>	<i>Vetera Christianorum</i>
WBC	Word Biblical Commentary
WKRGMK	Wissenschaftliche Kataloge des Römisch-Germanischen Museums Köln
<i>WTJ</i>	<i>Westminster Theological Journal</i>
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
<i>ZKG</i>	<i>Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte</i>
<i>ZNW</i>	<i>Zeitschrift für die Neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche</i>

FIGURES

- 1.1. Apostolic cult sites in Rome
- 1.2. Remains of Constantinian apse with “tomb of Paul” in the background
- 1.3. Location of the Constantinian basilica
- 1.4. Plan of the Theodosian basilica
- 1.5. Altar of Mars showing the Lupercalia
- 1.6. Close-up of the “sarcophagus of Paul”
- 1.7. Tomb location within the Constantinian and Theodosian basilicas
- 1.8. *Paulo apostolomart* slabs
- 1.9. Reconstruction of the original placement of *Paulo* slabs
- 1.10. Sarcophagus image of the martyrdom of Paul
- 1.11. Leonine renovations of the tomb area
- 1.12. Gregorian renovations of the tomb area
- 1.13. The Gregorian crypt
- 1.14. The Gregorian restoration of the ancient sacred way
- 1.15. Central altar in the Basilica of St. Paul at the Three Fountains
- 1.16. Traditional “prison of Paul” in the Church of Santa Maria in Scala Coeli
- 2.1. Reconstruction of the *trichlia*
- 2.2. *Trichlia* graffiti to Paul and Peter
- 2.3. Banquet scene in the cemetery of Callistus
- 2.4. Gold glass image of Peter and Paul
- 2.5. The martyrs Peter and Paul being crowned by Christ
- 2.6. Plan of the Constantinian Basilica of the Apostles
- 2.7. Privileged burials in the floor of the Basilica of the Apostles
- 2.8. Gold glass fragment showing Damasus with Pastor, Peter, and Paul
- 3.1. The apostles on the silver reliquary of San Nazaro
- 3.2. Milan in the time of Ambrose
- 3.3. Sailing routes from Rome to Spain
- 3.4. Pauline cult sites in Gaul
- 3.5. Scene of Paul’s martyrdom on a sarcophagus from Gaul
- 3.6. Pauline cult sites in Spain
- 3.7. Berja sarcophagus showing Paul and Peter before Nero

- 4.1. Pauline cult sites in North Africa
- 4.2. Lintel from Henchir Deheb marking a “[Memorial] of the saints Peter and Paul”
- 4.3. Stone coffer from Aïn Abid referring to Peter and Paul
- 4.4. Limestone tablet from Tixter referring to “some relics of the apostle Peter and of Paul”
- 4.5. Limestone tablet from Carthage with mention of apostolic relics
- 4.6. Pilgrim’s flask with image of Paul
- 4.7. Privileged burials in and around the basilica at Tipasa
- 4.8. Mosaic from Uppenna with a list of martyrs that includes Peter and Paul

INTRODUCTION

On June 28, 2007, Pope Benedict XVI proclaimed June 2008 to June 2009 the Year of Paul. This special celebration honored the two thousandth anniversary of the apostle's traditional date of birth. The pontiff announced that the year would include "a series of liturgical, cultural and ecumenical events, as well as various pastoral and social initiatives, all inspired by Pauline spirituality." In addition to these programmatic aspects of the year, the pope placed a strong emphasis on pilgrimage to the Basilica of St. Paul Outside the Walls in Rome: "This 'Pauline Year' will take place in a special way in Rome, where for 2000 years under the papal altar of this basilica, lies the tomb that according to experts and undisputed tradition has conserved the remains of the apostle Paul." To encourage participation, the pontiff offered a special indulgence to those who made a pilgrimage to Rome to pray at the tomb. While Rome was the center of activity for the Year of Paul, the festivities were not confined to that city. The pope also encouraged Christians everywhere to follow the example of Rome: "In all parts of the world, similar initiatives can be organized in dioceses, shrines and places of worship by religious institutions, by social or educational institutes bearing the name of St Paul or inspired by his character and teaching."¹ The indulgence was equally available to those who made a pilgrimage or participated in sacred exercises anywhere else in the world "in holy places dedicated to St Paul."²

Liturgy, pilgrimage, prayer at holy sites, the proliferation of sacred shrines to Paul, the promise of spiritual benefits—these were prominent aspects of the year-long festival in his honor. These were also important components of an ancient Pauline cult that began in the first century and grew dramatically

1. Pope Benedict XVI, "Pauline Year Proclamation," *Basilica Papale San Paolo Fuori le Mura Press Office*, 28 June 2007, online: <http://www.annopaolino.org/interno.asp?id=2&lang=eng>.

2. Cardinal James Francis Stafford, "Decree of Special Indulgences," *Basilica Papale San Paolo Fuori le Mura Press Office*, 10 May 2008, online: <http://www.annopaolino.org/Indulgenza%20ING.pdf>.

in the fourth century. This book tells the story of this ancient cult of Paul as martyr in the Latin West.

THE CULTS OF MARTYRS AND SAINTS

The cult of the martyrs was one of the focal points of Christian piety in late antiquity. The basis of the cult was the belief that the martyrs (those who chose to die rather than recant their Christian faith) occupy a particularly elevated position in the spiritual hierarchy. Having voluntarily followed the example of Christ to the point of death, they reside in the presence of God and enjoy God's special favor.³ Although they are physically dead, they remain alive and accessible to Christians who seek their intercession and assistance.

Many of Christianity's most famous martyrs died during the movement's first three centuries, when Christians were victims of various persecutions. In some cases they were attacked by mobs, but in other instances they were put to death by order of the imperial government.⁴ Within the Roman Empire, the earliest imperial persecution took place under the emperor Nero (ca. 64 C.E.), and the last and worst persecution occurred between 303 and 311 under the emperor Diocletian. The century that followed Diocletian's death brought a dramatic change in the status of Christianity. The emperors Licinius and Constantine issued the Edict of Milan in 313, which granted religious freedom to Christians (Lactantius, *Mort.* 48; Eusebius, *Hist. eccl.* 10.5), and by the end of Constantine's reign in 337, Christianity had become the favored religion of the Roman Empire. Finally, in 380, the emperors Theodosius I, Gratian, and Valentinian II issued the Edict of Thessaloniki, making Christianity the official religion of the empire (*Cod. Theod.* 16.1.2).

Legal freedom and a growing number of wealthy, influential converts allowed Christians to expand the scope of practices through which they honored the martyrs. This process was both creative and circular, for as veneration practices increased and expanded, so did the perceived extent of a martyr's influence. All these practices, when taken together, constituted a martyr's *cult*. As cults grew in popularity and exposure in this period of relative safety, Christians began also to venerate confessors (those who had professed their faith but had not died as martyrs) and others who had been considered particularly holy while alive. The distinction between these different types of holy

3. On the elevated status of martyrs—to a level that some even found problematic—see Candida R. Moss, *The Other Christs: Imitating Jesus in Ancient Christian Ideologies of Martyrdom* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 149–72.

4. G. E. M. de Ste. Croix, *Christian Persecution, Martyrdom, and Orthodoxy* (ed. Michael Whitby and Joseph Streeter; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), 105–52.

people became blurred, and Christians commonly referred to all of them as *saints*. We therefore often speak about the “cult of the saints” rather than specifically the cult of the martyrs.⁵

THE NATURE OF THE EVIDENCE

The Pauline cult was composed of a number of practices through which Christians created and re-created an image of Paul as a martyr worthy of veneration.⁶ These practices can be grouped under four broad headings to which I will make reference throughout the book: places, stories, objects and rituals, and patronage relationships. By way of setting the context for my overall study, I will introduce these categories here accompanied by examples from other prominent saints’ cults. However, this presentation in distinct categories should not obscure the fact that many practices overlapped and interacted with each other, as we will see in the case of the Pauline cult.

5. The study of these cults has led to a substantial bibliography. I will not rehearse the entire history of scholarship here, because this has been ably done by Stephen Wilson, “Annotated Bibliography,” in *Saints and Their Cults: Studies in Religious Sociology, Folklore and History* (ed. Stephen Wilson; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 309–417; and Lucy Grig, *Making Martyrs in Late Antiquity* (London: Duckworth, 2004), 146–51. To these summaries I must add several important studies on the cults of particular saints. Raymond Van Dam, *Saints and Their Miracles in Late Antique Gaul* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993) is a work primarily (although not exclusively) on the cult of Martin of Tours, particularly through the lens of the writings of the sixth-century bishop Gregory of Tours. In *Saint Demetrios of Thessaloniki: Civic Patron and Divine Protector, 4th–7th Centuries CE* (HTS 47; Harrisburg, Pa.: Trinity Press International, 1999), James C. Skedros illustrates how text and architecture were woven together to produce a saint whose cult exerted considerable social and political influence in this Macedonian city. Finally, Stephen J. Davis’s *The Cult of Saint Thecla: A Tradition of Women’s Piety in Late Antiquity* (OECs; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001) provides an analysis of the cult of the martyred virgin in Asia Minor and Egypt. Davis integrates text, art, and archaeology into his study of women’s piety and the social practices that emerged around the Thecla cult. My own study of the Pauline cult is in part inspired by the work of Van Dam, Skedros, and Davis.

6. On the development of martyr cults within the broader social context of late antiquity, see three essays in Ellen Bradshaw Aitken and Jennifer K. Berenson Maclean, eds., *Philostratus’s Heroikos: Religion and Cultural Identity in the Third Century C.E.* (SBLWGRW 6; Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2004): Hans Dieter Betz, “Hero Worship and Christian Beliefs: Observations from the History of Religion on Philostratus’s *Heroikos*,” 25–47; Jackson P. Hershbell, “Philostratus’s *Heroikos* and Early Christianity: Heroes, Saints, and Martyrs,” 169–79; James C. Skedros, “The *Heroikos* and Popular Christianity in the Third Century C.E.,” 181–93.

PLACES

The first of these practices was the *designation of particular locations as holy places*. Certain locations were ascribed special importance for the commemoration of the martyrs. Christians tended to favor birth places, sites of preaching or miracles, martyrdom locations, and tombs. One of the earliest recorded examples of this comes from the *Martyrdom of Polycarp*. Probably written in the latter half of the second century, it recounts the trial and violent death of the bishop of Smyrna in Asia Minor (modern Izmir, Turkey⁷) between 155 and 170 C.E.⁸ After Polycarp's execution and cremation by a Roman soldier, the Christians of Smyrna collected his bones and laid them in "a suitable place" (*Mart. Pol.* 18.2–3). This place became the center of commemoration and veneration of the martyred bishop in the years following his death.⁹

7. I will identify places in this book by their most recognizable names, whether those be the ancient or modern names. In each case the corresponding names will also be given in parentheses.

8. Both the date of Polycarp's death and the date of composition of the *Martyrdom* continue to be disputed. The most likely date of death is 155 or 167. For a summary of the arguments, see Jan Den Boeft and Jan Bremmer, "Notiunculae Martyrologicae IV" (review of A. A. R. Bastiaensen, ed., *Atti e Passioni dei Martiri*), *VC* 45.2 (1991): 107–8. On the composition date, the majority of scholars still favor the late second century, e.g., Boudewijn Dehandschutter, "The Martyrium Polycarpi: A Century of Research," *ANRW* 27.1:497–502; idem, "Research on the Martyrdom of Polycarp: 1990–2005," in *Polycarpiana: Studies on Martyrdom and Persecution in Early Christianity: Collected Essays* (ed. J. Leemans; BETL 205; Leuven: Peeters, 2007), 85–92; Gerd Buschmann, *Das Martyrium des Polykarp* (KAV 6; Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1998), 39–40; Paul A. Hartog, *Polycarp and the New Testament* (WUNT 2/134; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2002), 17–32. Proponents of a third-century date for part or all of the text have included Hans von Campenhausen, "Bearbeitungen und Interpolationen des Polykarpmartyriums," in *Aus der Frühzeit des Christentums: Studien zur Kirchengeschichte des ersten und zweiten Jahrhunderts* (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1963), 253–301; Candida R. Moss, "On the Dating of Polycarp: Rethinking the Place of the Martyrdom of Polycarp in the History of Christianity," *EC* 1 (2010): 539–74.

9. Cf. R. A. Markus, "How on Earth Could Places Become Holy? Origins of the Christian Idea of Holy Places," *J ECS* 2 (1994): 257–71. Markus argues that, prior to the fourth century, Christians were opposed to the notions of sacred space and sacred time. His argument does not account for texts such as the *Martyrdom of Polycarp*, Eusebius's reference to the tombs of Peter and Paul around the turn of the third century, third-century liturgical calendars from both Rome and North Africa, and other evidence of popular practices that will be discussed in this book. Markus's argument does hold true for the earliest period, however. An important example is the tomb of Jesus, which was not a place of veneration prior to the time of Constantine, as shown by Helmut Koester, "On Heroes, Tombs, and Early Christianity: An Epilogue," in *Flavius Philostratus: Heroikos* (trans. Jennifer K.

In many cases, Christians *marked these holy places with some kind of shrine or monument*.¹⁰ These could be simple or elaborate, depending on the context and resources of those constructing it. In the year 384, the female pilgrim Egeria visited a shrine of the martyr Thecla on a hill just south of Seleucia (modern Silifke, Turkey). This is the traditional location of the martyr's death, and the shrine itself was attached to a church and surrounded by a wall (*Itiner.* 23.2–4). In the middle of the fifth century, the center of the local cult moved to a small church built over a cave at the foot of the hill. Soon after, the emperor Zeno constructed an enormous basilica that engulfed both the cave and the smaller church, thereby employing architecture to mark this entire area as holy space.¹¹

STORIES

The *production of literary accounts of a martyr's great deeds and death* was a prominent aspect of many martyr cults. Cyprian was a third-century bishop in Carthage (near modern Tunis, Tunisia). He was arrested in 258 and executed by order of the Roman consul. A deacon of Carthage named Pontius wrote the *Life of Cyprian* in the years immediately following the martyr's death. In the introduction to his work, Pontius comments, "Since ... it is right that [Cyprian's] example should be recorded in writing, I have thought it appropriate to prepare this brief and concise narrative ... that this incomparable and lofty pattern may be prolonged for posterity into immortal remembrance" (*Vit. Cypr.* 1). What follows is a flattering account of Cyprian's life in which every decision, even in the midst of controversy, was made with infallible wisdom. His model death was preceded by a model life. Pontius was not attempting to produce an objective, historical account of Cyprian's life and martyrdom. Rather, he was sculpting an image of the bishop that would be perpetuated by the reading and circulation of his narrative.¹²

Berenson Maclean and Ellen Bradshaw Aitken; SBLWGRW 1; Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2001), 257–64.

10. This practice was, of course, not unique to Christians. On the Jewish practice of constructing and honoring tombs of the prophets, see, e.g., Matt 23:29; Luke 11:47–48.

11. Davis, *Cult of Saint Thecla*, 36–39. Theodore of Mopsuestia is said to have made regular pilgrimages to Thecla's shrine at Seleucia. According to a legend in the Chronicle of Seert, on one occasion he had a dream in which he saw Thecla alongside an old man (Paul?) who gave him fourteen keys to unlock the fourteen Pauline epistles. See John T. Fitzgerald, "Theodore of Mopsuestia on Paul's Letter to Philemon," in *Philemon in Perspective: Interpreting a Pauline Letter* (ed. D. Francois Tolmie; BZNBW 169; Berlin: de Gruyter, 2010), 342–43.

12. "One might even go so far as to argue that [early Christian historians] did not simply preserve the story of persecution and martyrdom but, in fact, created it" (Elizabeth

The *publishing of the alleged trial transcripts* was another means of circulating stories. Texts of this type, in fact, represent a significant percentage of the surviving stories about martyrs.¹³ They often consist primarily of back-and-forth debates between determined Christians and exasperated government officials. The *Acts of Phileas* is a fourth-century text recounting the trial and execution of the bishop of Thmuis (Egypt). The text focuses on the futile attempts by the proconsul Culcianus to convince Phileas to offer sacrifice in honor of the emperor:

Culcianus said to him, "Now sacrifice." [Phileas] replied, "I will not sacrifice; I never learned how." Culcianus said to him, "Paul sacrificed, did he not?" He replied, "No." Culcianus said, "Surely Moses sacrificed." He replied, "Solely for the Jews it was prescribed to sacrifice in Jerusalem to God alone..." Culcianus said to him, "Now sacrifice." Phileas replied, "I will not sacrifice." (*Acta Phil.* 2–3)¹⁴

The climax of these texts is often the martyr's bold pronouncement of unwavering faith ("I am a Christian"), even when faced with death. In some cases, these trial transcripts were later incorporated into larger narratives of the martyrs' lives (e.g., *Mart. Perp. Felic.* 6).

Sermons were also a way of telling stories about a martyr. These were often given on a martyr's "birthday," a term Christians used for the anniversary of his or her death. Augustine is a rich source of such sermons, including several in honor of Cyprian. He opens the first of these with the following declaration:

Such a happy and religious occasion as this, on which we are celebrating the blessed martyr's passion, requires me to pay the debt of the sermon I owe to your ears and hearts.... And now at this time we recall all that happened then by reading about it and appreciating it, not only without any sadness at all, but even with immense gladness. (*Serm.* 309.1, Hill)

This day had been set aside to commemorate Cyprian's death, and Augustine proceeded to tell his own version of the events leading up to the former bishop's martyrdom. He creatively interpreted and applied the story as moral exhortation for the audience in his basilica.

A. Castelli, *Martyrdom and Memory: Early Christian Culture Making* [New York: Columbia University Press, 2004], 25).

13. The importance of trial manuscripts is clearly seen in the extensive list of martyrdom accounts summarized by Moss, *Other Christs*, 177–201 (appendix).

14. There are some differences between the Latin and Greek versions of this text, but this passage appears in both surviving versions.

Stories about martyrs circulated as well through *oral tradition*. The particular holy places associated with martyrs provided fertile settings for visitors to hear and exchange stories. Egeria recounts that monks and other people told her stories about the places she was visiting and the holy people associated with those places (*Itiner.* 20.12). As with all storytelling, these interactions represented a creative process through which new elements and perspectives entered into the tradition. The images of martyrs, therefore, were constantly in flux, being shaped and reshaped by those telling stories about their lives and deaths.

OBJECTS AND RITUALS

The *collection and veneration of relics* were central to many cults. Relics were the most important physical objects for a cult, and we may distinguish them into two categories. Primary relics were the martyr's actual physical remains. As early as the second century, Christians were treating relics with special care. Polycarp's cremation did not deter the local Christians from gathering the bones for special veneration: "Thus we later took up his bones, which are more valuable than precious stones and more refined than gold" (*Mart. Pol.* 18.2). Even pieces of bone were desirable, for "wherever a drop of dew has fallen on men in the shape of a particle of bone, the tiny gift from a consecrated body, holy grace has brought forth fountains in that place, and the drops of ashes have begotten rivers of life" (Paulinus of Nola, *Carm.* 19.359–362). Blood or other bodily fluids were also considered equal to the bones themselves. As Vincent of Saragossa lay on his death bed after being tortured, the faithful were drawn to the martyr's open wounds: "One covers with kisses the double cuts made by the claws, another eagerly licks the red gore on the body. Many wet a linen garment with drops of blood, to lay it up at home as a holy safeguard for their descendants" (Prudentius, *Perist.* 5.337–344, Thomson).

Secondary relics (*brandea* or *sanctuaría*) were objects that had come into contact with primary relics and then carried spiritual power that had been transferred to them. At the traditional tomb of Peter in Rome,

If someone wishes to take away a blessed relic, he weighs a little piece of cloth on a pair of scales and lowers it into [the tomb]; then he keeps vigils, fasts and earnestly prays that the power of the apostle will assist his piety. [What happens next] is extraordinary to report! If the man's faith is strong, when the piece of cloth is raised from the tomb it will be so soaked with divine power that it will weigh much more than it weighed previously. (Gregory of Tours, *Glor. mart.* 27, Van Dam)

Both primary and secondary relics, even if only in fragmentary form, were seen as conduits and access points of the spiritual power that a martyr could wield. As Bishop Paulinus of Nola once wrote, “Wherever there is part of a saint’s body, there, too, his power emerges” (Paulinus of Nola, *Carm.* 27.445, Walsh).

Producing and procuring items bearing the name and/or image of the martyr were two related practices. Portable objects of this type were often produced and distributed as mementos of a visit to a holy place. Visitors to a shrine of the martyr Menas in Egypt could take home ceramic flasks featuring the image of Menas on one side and Thecla on the other.¹⁵ Some of these flasks probably contained holy oil taken from the site. Sarcophagi represent another class of object that could bear images of a martyr, particularly iconographical representations of his or her death. They were far more expensive and less mobile than ceramic flasks, but in some cases they were transported a considerable distance, as we will see in the case of Paul.

The practice of *pilgrimage* was adapted from Greco-Roman religions. Christians traveled to designated holy places in order to honor the saints, venerate their relics, and secure secondary relics or other mementos. Some early Christian pilgrims traveled great distances. Egeria’s journey took her from western Europe (probably Spain) as far east as Egypt and Syria. Constantine’s mother, Helena, went from Rome to Palestine in the early fourth century, where she established Christian churches at holy sites (Eusebius of Caesarea, *Vit. Const.* 3.42–46). Other Christians visited shrines in their own regions. According to the *Miracles of St. Thecla*, the residents of Seleucia and Tarsus regularly engaged in mutual pilgrimage along the Cilician coast between their sites for Thecla and Paul, respectively (Basil of Seleucia, *Mirac. Theclae* 4, 29).

The installation of *privileged burial sites near a martyr’s tomb* was linked closely to relics. Ancient Christians displayed a clear desire to be interred “near the saints” (*ad sanctos*). Relics were believed to carry the saint’s full power, so it was desirable to be buried as close as possible. Those lying “near the saints” would benefit at the final judgment and resurrection on account of their proximity to these special tombs.¹⁶ Bishop Ambrose of Milan had

15. Davis, *Cult of Saint Thecla*, 114–26. For other examples of such mementos, see Cynthia Hahn, “Loca Sancta Souvenirs: Sealing the Pilgrim’s Experience,” in *The Blessings of Pilgrimage* (ed. Robert Ousterhout; Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1990), 85–96; Maggie Duncan-Flowers, “A Pilgrim’s Ampulla from the Shrine of St. John the Evangelist at Ephesus,” in Ousterhout, *The Blessings of Pilgrimage*, 125–39; Charalambos Bakirtzis, “Byzantine Ampullae from Thessaloniki,” in Ousterhout, *The Blessings of Pilgrimage*, 140–50; Blake Leyerle, “Pilgrim Eulogiae and Domestic Rituals,” *AfRG* 10 (2008): 223–37.

16. André Grabar, *Martyrium: Recherches sur le culte des reliques et l’art chrétien antique* (2 vols.; Paris: Collège de France, 1946), esp. 1:487–532; Yvette Duval, *Auprès des*

greater confidence in his eternal fate because he was to be buried over the bodies of the martyrs Gervasius and Protasius in a basilica that he had built: “I believe that I will be more commendable to God, because I will rest over the bones of the body of a saint” (*Exc.* 1.18).¹⁷ His (supposed) body is visible even today in the Basilica di Sant’Ambrogio in Milan, where Ambrose is still flanked by the bodies of the two martyrs.

The *celebration of annual feast days* was a well-attested part of a martyr’s cult. The *Martyrdom of Polycarp* provides the earliest recorded example of this practice. After burying the bones of Polycarp, the Christians of Smyrna continued to commemorate the day of his death: “As we are able, we gather together there with joy and gladness, and the Lord will permit us to celebrate the birthday of his martyrdom in memory of those who have gone before and for the training and preparation of those who will do so in the future” (*Mart. Pol.* 18.3). They held an annual gathering on Polycarp’s “birthday” to remember his death and example, mindful that their own day of testing could be coming soon. The growth in the number of such feast days contributed to the eventual development of liturgical calendars.¹⁸

A practice closely associated with feast days was the *celebration of meals in honor of a martyr*. These special banquets, inspired by Roman meals in honor of departed ancestors, took place at the tombs or shrines of the saints. Augustine says that his mother regularly partook in these meals in North Africa: “It had been my mother’s custom in Africa to take meal-cakes and bread and wine to the shrines of the saints on their memorial days” (*Conf.* 6.2, Pine-Coffin). Ambrose of Milan forbade this practice in his city. Augustine followed him in condemning it in Africa, because these unsupervised gatherings had been the occasion for immoral activity. The bishops were in a distinct minority, however, for most Christians eagerly participated in these special meals honoring the martyrs.¹⁹

saints corps et âme: L'inhumation "ad sanctos" dans la chrétienté d'Orient et d'Occident du IIIe au VIIe siècle (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1988).

17. Ambrose was credited with having found the relics of these previously unknown martyrs (Ambrose, *Ep.* 22; Paulinus of Nola, *Vit. Ambr.* 14).

18. The other primary contributing factor to the development of liturgical calendars was the Roman civil calendar, which listed public holidays and festivals for particular deities. Nataschia Donati and Patrizia Stefanetti, *Dies natalis: I calendari romani e gli anniversari dei culti* (Rome: Quasar, 2006); Denis Feeney, *Caesar's Calendar: Ancient Times and the Beginnings of History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), 138–211.

19. Ramsay MacMullen, *The Second Church: Popular Christianity A.D. 200–400* (SBLWGRWSup 1; Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature; Leiden: Brill, 2009), 57–62; Ann Marie Yasin, “Funerary Monuments and Collective Identity: From Roman Family to Christian Community,” *ArtB* 87.3 (2005): 433–57.

PATRONAGE RELATIONSHIPS

Another practice in many cults was *claiming a personal relationship with a martyr using the model and language of patronage*. Patronage was a foundational concept in the social structure of the Roman world and involved an agreement between two parties of unequal standing. The more powerful patron provided favors to the less powerful client, who would render service in return.²⁰ The parties involved were sometimes described as friends, suggesting more comparable standing, but in reality these relationships still frequently involved social unequals.²¹ As far as Christianity is concerned, patronage appears to have played a key role in its various social networks from the first century onward, sometimes invoking the language of both kinship and friendship.²² This role was maintained and even expanded within the cults of martyrs, where patronage may be seen in the association between martyrs and local bishops, particular cities, or even entire regions. Prudentius speaks of Cyprian as a patron not only for his native North Africa but also for the regions of Britain, Gaul (France), Italy, and Spain: “He has attained to the realms of heaven, yet nonetheless he moves over the earth and does not leave this world. He still discourses, still holds forth, expounding, teaching, instructing, prophesying.... Indeed he is both teacher on earth and martyr too in heaven; here he instructs men, from there as their patron gives them gifts in love” (*Perist.* 13.99–101, 105–106, Thomson). Cyprian had become a figure who could intercede in the heavenly realms on behalf of the faithful on earth, and in return his clients “raised up a tomb and consecrated his ashes” (13.98, Thomson).

20. Richard P. Saller, *Personal Patronage under the Early Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982); Andrew Wallace-Hadrill, *Patronage in Ancient Society* (LNSAS 1; London: Routledge, 1989); Elizabeth Deniaux, *Clientèles et pouvoir à l'époque de Cicéron* (CEFR 182; Rome: École française de Rome, 1993).

21. David Konstan, *Friendship in the Classical World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997); John T. Fitzgerald, ed., *Graeco-Roman Perspectives on Friendship* (SBLRBS 34; Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1997). On inequality among friends, see Saller, *Personal Patronage*, 11–13; Konstan, *Friendship*, 93–98, 105–6, 135–37; idem, “Patrons and Friends,” *CP* 90 (1995): 328–42.

22. E.g., John T. Fitzgerald, “Christian Friendship: John, Paul, and the Philippians,” *Int* 61.3 (2007): 284–96; L. Michael White, “Paul and *Pater Familias*,” in *Paul in the Graeco-Roman World: A Handbook* (ed. J. Paul Sampley; Harrisburg, Pa.: Trinity Press International, 2003), 457–87; Peter Lampe, “Paul, Patrons, and Clients,” in Sampley, *Paul in the Graeco-Roman World*, 488–523.

Taken together, these practices contributed to the cult of a martyr,²³ and this study integrates these various forms of evidence to create a thick description of the cult of the apostle Paul in late antiquity. I have limited the scope of my inquiry to Rome and the Latin West, from the earliest vestiges of the cult to the death of bishop Gregory I of Rome (604 C.E.).

The first part of the book focuses on the two primary locations in Rome where Paul was venerated as a martyr: the site of the current Basilica of St. Paul Outside the Walls on the Ostian Road, and the Catacombs of St. Sebastian on the Appian Road. The Ostian Road site had ties to Paul's martyrdom and burial, while the Appian Road location preserves the earliest archaeological evidence of the Pauline cult. The designation of these places as holy places—or sacred spaces—led to substantial architectural and cultic development at both locations. Equally interesting are the sites outside Rome where the Pauline cult was established. The second part of the book focuses on these locations in the rest of Latin Europe and North Africa. A major theme in these chapters is the way in which the Pauline cult served to connect these other regions to Rome. Christians appropriated Roman models of sacred space and created cultic centers as a means of asserting association with—or intentional separation from—the spiritual capital of the West. In this book I will seek to demonstrate that the identification and architectural development of sacred places provided the primary framework for the Pauline cult. The complex interplay of practices that occurred in these spaces both reflected and generated popular conceptions of Paul the martyr.

23. Another expression of some cults was the practice of naming children after a particular saint. I do not discuss it at length here because I am unaware of evidence for this in the Pauline cult in the West. In Egypt, however, Christians did name their children for the apostle. See Willy Clarysse, "The Coptic Martyr Cult," in *Martyrium in Multidisciplinary Perspective* (ed. M. Lamberigts and P. Van Deun; BETL 117; Leuven: Peeters, 1995), 386–87.