TWO SHIPWRECKED GOSPELS

THE LOGOI OF JESUS AND PAPIAS’S EXPOSITION OF LOGIA ABOUT THE LORD

Dennis R. MacDonald

Society of Biblical Literature
Atlanta
Contents

Preface ...................................................................................................................... ix
Acknowledgments .................................................................................................. xi
Abbreviations ....................................................................................................... xiii
The Q+/Papias Hypothesis................................................................................... xv

Part 1: Papias’s Exposition of Logia about the Lord

Introduction to Part 1: Salvaging a Textual Shipwreck ...................................... 3

1. Textual Reconstruction ...................................................................................... 9
   Book 1. Preface and John’s Preaching 9
   Book 2. Jesus in Galilee and Judea (?) 18
   Book 3. Jesus in Jerusalem (?) 24
   Book 4. Jesus’ Death and Resurrection 25
   Book 5. Events after Jesus’ Resurrection (?) 38


3. Luke’s Knowledge of Papias’s Exposition and the Synoptic Problem ........... 69
   Luke’s Knowledge of the Gospel of Mark 71
   Luke’s Knowledge of the Gospel of Matthew 73
   Did Luke Know Papias’s Second “Translation” of Matthew? 87

Part 2: The Logoi of Jesus

Introduction to Part 2: Salvaging another Textual Shipwreck ......................... 93

4. Matthew’s Non-Markan Source (Q without Luke) ......................................... 95
   The Quest for Minimal Matthew’s Q (MQ-) 97
   The Quest for Expanded Matthew’s Q (MQ+) 115
5. The Logoi of Jesus (Q+) and Its Antetexts ................................................................. 171
   The Lost Gospel and Its Antetexts 174
   Title 177
   Logoi 1: John the Prophet 178
   Logoi 2: Jesus’ Empowerment and Testings 186
   Logoi 3: Jesus Acquires Disciples and Alienates Pharisees 192
   Logoi 4: The Inaugural Sermon and the Centurion’s Faith 212
   Logoi 5: Jesus’ Praise of John and the Mysteries of the Kingdom 244
      Excursus 1: The Location of the Mission Speech 261
   Logoi 6: More Controversies 263
   Logoi 7: Woes against the Religious Leaders 287
   Logoi 8: Discipleship and the Kingdom of God 308
   Logoi 9: The Eschatological Sermon 351
   Logoi 10: The Mission Speech 359
      Excursus 2: The Ending of Matthew as a Witness to the Ending of Logoi 405
      Excursus 3: How the Logoi of Jesus Ended 407
   Greek Synopsis of the Logoi of Jesus and the Synoptic Gospels 411

6. The Logoi of Jesus as Literature .............................................................................. 505

7. The Logoi of Jesus as Papias’s Second “Translation” of Matthew ....................... 521

8. The Logoi of Jesus as a Source for the Gospel of Mark ......................................... 537

9. The Logoi of Jesus as a Witness to the Historical Jesus ......................................... 543

10. Why the Logoi of Jesus and Papias’s Exposition Shipwrecked ......................... 555

Appendix 1: Text and Translation of the Logoi of Jesus ............................................ 561
Appendix 2: Concordance to the Logoi of Jesus ...................................................... 621
Appendix 3: Overview of the Logoi of Jesus and the Synoptic Gospels .................. 655
Appendix 4: Comparison of The Critical Edition of Q and the Logoi of Jesus .......... 665
Appendix 5: Exposition of Logia about the Lord: Text and Translation ................. 675

Bibliography .................................................................................................................. 687
Index 1: Jewish Antetexts in the Logoi of Jesus ...................................................... 699
Index 2: Modern Authors ......................................................................................... 703
Index 3: Subjects ........................................................................................................ 707
Preface

Early Christians produced several books about Jesus in addition to the four Gospels in the New Testament. Some of these documents now survive in whole or in part, some in citations embedded in later writings, and some only as titles. Others are hypothetical reconstructions of lost documents that once may have been sources for later Gospels. This book attempts to reconstruct two lost Gospels, one of which probably was the earliest of all, what scholars conventionally call Q, probably from the German word Quelle, “source.” Tragically, no manuscript of this document exists, and there is no uncontested external witness to it, but, as we shall see, it is highly likely that the Synoptic Evangelists (unknown authors we have come to call Matthew, Mark, and Luke) all relied on a document that no longer exists. Although scholars have published several speculative reconstructions of Q on the basis of Matthew-Luke agreements against Mark, this volume proposes an alternative methodology for recovering the lost Gospel and produces a text nearly twice as long. To distinguish my reconstruction from others, I refer to it as Q+ or as the Logoi of Jesus, its most likely original title.

The second Gospel reconstructed in this volume survives exclusively in citations by later authors. The Exposition of Logia about the Lord, a five-volume work by Papias, bishop of Hierapolis (in Asia Minor), apparently was a running commentary on three earlier Gospels: those that we know as Mark and Matthew and a third with affinities with Matthew. I will propose that this third Gospel was none other than the lost Gospel, the Logoi of Jesus. Papias did not restrict himself to information derived from these books; he supplemented them with lore provided by people who had spoken with Jesus’ followers. Although publications of the Papian fragments are readily available elsewhere, to my knowledge no one has rearranged them into their most likely sequence and speculated systematically concerning content that is missing in the gaps between them. Papias’s first four books apparently followed the narrative sequence of the Gospel of Matthew; the fifth regaled activities of Jesus’ followers up to his own day, circa 110 C.E. One therefore may consider his oeuvre as an extended Gospel with running commentary.
One can scarcely exaggerate the tragic consequences of these two textual shipwrecks. The *Logoi of Jesus* apparently was the earliest of all Gospels, and the *Exposition* was a trove of oral traditions about Jesus and the earliest known commentary on Mark and Matthew. These alternative reconstructions of the *Logoi of Jesus* and the *Exposition of Logia about the Lord* permit a new solution to the Synoptic Problem, the vexing interconnections among Matthew, Mark, and Luke. I will refer to this solution as the Q+/Papias Hypothesis. The first part of this book discusses the later of these two lost Gospels, because Papias provides precious external evidence that *Logoi* once existed and is not merely a clever scholarly contrivance.