

REDESCRIBING THE GOSPEL OF MARK

SBL Press

# EARLY CHRISTIANITY AND ITS LITERATURE

David G. Horrell, General Editor

*Editorial Board:*

Amy-Jill Levine

Margaret Y. MacDonald

Dale B. Martin

Laura S. Nasrallah

Number 22

SBL Press



# REDESCRIBING THE GOSPEL OF MARK

*Edited by*

Barry S. Crawford and Merrill P. Miller

SBL Press



**SBL PRESS**

**Atlanta**

Copyright © 2017 by SBL Press

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, SBL Press, 825 Houston Mill Road, Atlanta, GA 30329 USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Crawford, Barry S., editor. | Miller, Merrill P., editor.

Title: Redescribing the Gospel of Mark / edited by Barry S. Crawford and Merrill P. Miller.

Description: Atlanta : SBL Press, 2017. | Series: Early Christianity and its literature ; Number 22 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016056524 (print) | LCCN 2016057451 (ebook) | ISBN 9781628371635 (paperback) | ISBN 9780884142041 (hardcover) | ISBN 9780884142034 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Bible. Mark—Criticism, interpretation, etc.

Classification: LCC BS2585.53 .R434 2017 (print) | LCC BS2585.53 (ebook) | DDC 226.3/06—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2016056524>

Printed on acid-free paper.



## CONTENTS

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Acknowledgments.....  | vii |
| Abbreviations.....  | ix  |
| Introduction  |     |
| Barry S. Crawford.....  | 1   |
| Conjectures on Conjunctures and Other Matters: Three Essays   |     |
| Jonathan Z. Smith.....  | 17  |
| The Markan Site   |     |
| Jonathan Z. Smith.....  | 99  |
| Cartwheels: Or on Not Staying Upside Down Too Long  |     |
| Burton L. Mack.....   | 127 |
| On Smith, On Myth, On Mark  |     |
| William E. Arnal.....   | 145 |
| Markan Grappings  |     |
| Christopher R. Matthews.....  | 169 |
| The Spyglass and Kaleidoscope: From a Levantine Coign of<br>Vantage                                 |     |
| Burton L. Mack.....   | 181 |
| The Social Logic of the Gospel of Mark: Cultural Persistence<br>and Social Escape in a Postwar Time |     |
| Merrill P. Miller.....  | 207 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Mark, War, and Creative Imagination<br>William E. Arnal.....  | 401 |
| Q and the “Big Bang” Theory of Christian Origins<br>Robyn Faith Walsh.....  | 483 |
| Ancient Myths and Modern Theories of Christian Origins: The<br>Consultation (1995–1997) and Seminar (1998–2003) in<br>Retrospect with Attention to Successor Groups and a<br>Recommendation<br>Barry S. Crawford and Merrill P. Miller..... | 535 |
| Bibliography.....   | 575 |
| Contributors.....   | 647 |
| Index of Ancient Texts.....   | 649 |
| Index of Modern Authors.....  | 664 |
| Index of Subjects.....  | 672 |

SBL Press

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Our thanks to David Horrell, series editor, and the anonymous readers for accepting this volume for publication, and to Nicole Tilford, Bob Buller, and the entire staff of SBL Press for their assistance throughout the publication process.

A special word of thanks to Sharon Urban and Sue Taylor-Owens at Washburn University, whose kindness, patience, and, above all, word processing expertise rescued the present volume on numerous occasions. We also wish to express our gratitude to Yoram and Gabriel Miller. Your timely interventions and your heavy lifting continually kept the project on course. And Abby Aron, this book may have little to do with your own third-grade book project, “Jonathan’s Spooky Adventures,” but thank you for persistently inquiring about the progress of our book, even though it could not be imagined as a graphic novel.

We recognize the contributions of our indexers to the benefit of readers of the volume: for the index of ancient texts, Ian Brown, University of Toronto, and for the index of subjects, Katherine Koopman of Koopman Information Services.

To Bill Arnal, Erin Roberts, and all the current and future participants in the SBL Redescribing project, it is you we had especially in mind while writing the concluding chapter of the volume. The book is dedicated to Sherwood D. Miller, in loving memory.

SBL Press



## ABBREVIATIONS

### Primary Sources

|                   |  |
|-------------------|--|
| X                 | Monacensis, tenth century CE                   |
| Ψ                 | Athous Lavrensis, eighth–ninth century CE      |
| Ⲛ                 | Sinaiticus, fourth century CE                  |
| 1 En.             | 1 Enoch (Ethiopic Apocalypse)                  |
| 2 Bar.            | 2 Baruch (Syriac Apocalypse)                   |
| 3 Bar.            | 3 Baruch (Greek Apocalypse)                    |
| 4 Bar.            | 4 Baruch (Paraleipomena Jeremiou)              |
| A                 | Alexandrinus, fifth century CE                 |
| Avot R. Nat.      | Avot of Rabbi Nathan                           |
| Avod. Zar.        | Avodah Zarah                                   |
| <i>Abr.</i>       | Philo, <i>De Abrahamo</i>                      |
| <i>Abst.</i>      | Porphyry, <i>De abstinentia</i>                |
| Acts Pet.         | Acts of Peter                                  |
| <i>Ag. Ap.</i>    | Josephus, <i>Against Apion</i>                 |
| <i>Alex.</i>      | Plutarch, <i>Alexander</i>                     |
| <i>Ann.</i>       | Tacitus, <i>Annales</i>                        |
| <i>Ant.</i>       | Josephus, <i>Jewish Antiquities</i>            |
| As. Mos.          | Assumption of Moses                            |
| <i>Apol.</i>      | Tertullian, <i>Apologeticus</i>                |
| <i>Bib. hist.</i> | Diodorus Siculus, <i>Bibliotheca historica</i> |
| B                 | Vaticanus, fourth century CE                   |
| b.                | Babylonian Talmud                              |
| C                 | Ephraemi Rescriptus, fifth century CE          |
| <i>Conf.</i>      | Philo, <i>De confusione linguarum</i>          |
| <i>Contempl.</i>  | Philo, <i>De vita contempliva</i>              |
| D                 | Beza, fifth century CE                         |
| <i>Deipn.</i>     | Athenaeus, <i>Deipnosophistae</i>              |
| <i>Descr.</i>     | Pausanias, <i>Graeciae descriptio</i>          |

|                             |   |
|-----------------------------|---|
| <i>Dial.</i>                | Tacitus, <i>Dialogus de oratoribus</i>  |
| <i>Diatr.</i>               | Epictetus, <i>Diatribai (Dissertationes)</i>  |
| <i>Dion.</i>                | Nonnus, <i>Dionysiaca</i>   |
| <i>Dom.</i>                 | Suetonius, <i>Domitianus</i>  |
| <i>Edict.</i>               | Justinian, <i>Edicta / The Digest</i>   |
| <i>Ep.</i>                  | Pliny the Younger, <i>Epistulae</i>   |
| <i>Ep.</i>                  | Seneca, <i>Epistulae morales</i>  |
| <i>Ex. quaest. Rom.</i>     | Augustine, <i>Expositio quarumdam quaestionum in epistula ad Romanos</i>            |
| <i>Fab.</i>                 | Phaedrus, <i>Fabulae</i>  |
| <i>Flacc.</i>               | Philo, <i>In Flaccum</i>  |
| <i>Fug.</i>                 | Philo, <i>De fuga et inventione</i>   |
| <i>Geogr.</i>               | Strabo, <i>Geographica</i>  |
| <i>Git.</i>                 | Gitṭin  |
| <i>Gos. Thom.</i>           | Gospel of Thomas  |
| <i>Hal.</i>                 | Hallah  |
| <i>Hist.</i>                | Herodian, <i>Historia</i> ; Herodotus, <i>Historiae</i> ; Tacitus, <i>Historiae</i> |
| <i>Hist. Rom.</i>           | Dio Cassius, <i>Historia Romana</i>   |
| <i>Ign. Eph.</i>            | Ignatius, <i>To the Ephesians</i>   |
| <i>J.W.</i>                 | Josephus, <i>Jewish War/Judean War</i>  |
| <i>Jub.</i>                 | Jubilees  |
| <i>Ketub.</i>               | Ketubbot  |
| <i>Lam. Rab.</i>            | Lamentations Rabbah   |
| <i>Legat.</i>               | Philo, <i>Legatio ad Gaium</i>  |
| <i>Life</i>                 | Josephus, <i>The Life</i>   |
| <i>LXX</i>                  | Septuagint  |
| <i>m.</i>                   | Mishnah   |
| <i>Mos.</i>                 | Philo, <i>De vita Mosis</i>   |
| <i>MT</i>                   | Masoretic Text  |
| <i>Mut.</i>                 | Philo, <i>De mutatione nominum</i>  |
| <i>Nav.</i>                 | Lucian, <i>Navigium</i>   |
| <i>Nero</i>                 | Suetonius, <i>Nero</i>  |
| <i>Noct. Att.</i>           | Aulus Gellius, <i>Attic Nights</i>  |
| <i>Od.</i>                  | Homer, <i>Odyssey</i>   |
| <i>Opif.</i>                | Philo, <i>De opificio mundi</i>   |
| <i>Philops.</i>             | Lucian, <i>Philopseudes</i>   |
| <i>Praep. ev.</i>           | Eusebius, <i>Preparatio evangelica</i>  |
| <i>Prec. ger. rei publ.</i> | Plutarch, <i>Praecepta gerendae rei publicae</i>                                    |

|                   |   |
|-------------------|---|
| <i>Prov.</i>      | Philo, <i>De providentia</i>                      |
| <i>Pun.</i>       | Silius Italicus, <i>Punica</i>                    |
| QG                | Philo, <i>Questiones et solutiones in Genesin</i> |
| <i>Rerum nat.</i> | Lucretius, <i>De rerum natura</i>                 |
| <i>Resp.</i>      | Plato, <i>Respublica</i>                          |
| Shabb.            | Shabbat   |
| <i>Satry.</i>     | Petronius, <i>Satyricon</i>                       |
| Sib. Or.          | Sibylline Oracles                                 |
| <i>Somn.</i>      | Philo, <i>De somniis</i>                          |
| <i>Spec.</i>      | Philo, <i>De specialibus legibus</i>              |
| <i>Syr.</i>       | Appian, <i>Syriaca</i>                            |
| <i>Syr. d.</i>    | Lucian, <i>De Syria dea</i>                       |
| t.                | Tosefta   |
| T. Levi           | Testament of Levi                                 |
| <i>Tranq.</i>     | Seneca, <i>De tranquillitate animi</i>            |
| <i>V. Procli</i>  | Marinus, <i>Vita Procli</i>                       |
| <i>Vita</i>       | Josephus, <i>The Life</i>                         |

## Secondary Sources

|       |  |
|-------|--|
| AB    | Anchor Bible   |
| ABD   | <i>Anchor Bible Dictionary</i> . Edited by David Noel Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.   |
| AcBib | Academia Biblica   |
| AGJU  | Arbeiten zur Geschichte des Antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums   |
| AJP   | <i>American Journal of Philology</i>   |
| AJSR  | <i>Association for Jewish Studies Review</i>   |
| ANRW  | <i>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung</i> . Part 2, <i>Principat</i> . Edited by Hildegard Temporini and Wolfgang Haase. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1972–. |
| AOS   | American Oriental Series   |
| AR    | <i>Archiv für Religionswissenschaft</i>  |
| ATLA  | American Theological Library Association   |
| BAGD  | Bauer, Walter, William F. Arndt, F. Wilbur Gingrich, and Frederick W. Danker, <i>and Other Early Christian Literature</i> . 3rd ed. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000.  |

|                   |  |
|-------------------|--|
| BBB               | Bonner Biblische Beiträge  |
| BCSSR             | <i>Bulletin of the Council of Societies for the Study of Religion</i>  |
| BETL              | Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovanien-<br>sium  |
| BFCT              | Beiträge zur Förderung christlicher Theologie  |
| <i>Bib</i>        | <i>Biblica</i>   |
| <i>Bib. hist.</i> | Diodorus Siculus, <i>Bibliotheca historica</i>   |
| BibInt            | Bible Interpretation Series  |
| BibSem            | The Biblical Seminar   |
| BJS               | Brown Judaic Studies   |
| BSGRT             | Bibliotheca scriptorum Graecorum et Romanorum<br>Teubneriana   |
| <i>BTB</i>        | <i>Biblical Theology Bulletin</i>  |
| BTS               | Biblical Tools and Studies   |
| BZNW              | Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wis-<br>senschaft   |
| CB                | Cultura Bibica   |
| CBQ               | <i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>   |
| CIG               | <i>Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum</i> . Edited by August<br>Böckh. 4 vols. Berlin: Reimer, 1828–1877.  |
| CIJ               | <i>Corpus Inscriptionum Judaicarum</i> . Edited by Jean-Bap-<br>tiste Frey. 2 vols. Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute,<br>1936–1952.   |
| CIL               | <i>Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum</i> . Berlin, 1862–  |
| CIS               | <i>Corpus Inscriptionum Semiticarum</i> . Paris, 1881  |
| ConBNT            | Coniectanea Neotestamentica or Coniectanea Biblica:<br>New Testament Series  |
| CP                | <i>Classical Philology</i>   |
| CPJ               | <i>Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum</i> . Edited by Victor A.<br>Tcherikover. 3 vols. Cambridge: Harvard University<br>Press, 1957–1964.  |
| CRINT             | Compendia Rerum Judaicarum ad Novum Testamen-<br>tum   |
| CSHJ              | Chicago Studies in the History of Judaism  |
| DDD               | <i>Dictionary of Deities and Demons in the Bible</i> . Edited<br>by Karel van der Toorn, Bob Becking, and Pieter W.<br>van der Horst. Leiden: Brill, 1995. 2nd rev. ed. Grand<br>Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999. |

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| DSD      | <i>Dead Sea Discoveries</i>  |
| ECL      | Early Christianity and Its Literature  |
| EPRO     | Etudes préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l'empire romain   |
| FGH      | <i>Die Fragmente der griechischen Historiker</i> . By Felix Jacoby. Leiden: Brill, 1954–1964.  |
| FHG      | <i>Fragmenta Historicorum Graecorum</i> . Edited by C. Müller and T. Müller. 5 vols. Paris: Didot, 1841–1870.  |
| Historia | <i>Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte</i>   |
| HR       | <i>History of Religions</i>  |
| HRCS     | Hatch, Edwin, and Henry A Redpath. <i>Concordance to the Septuagint and Other Greek Versions of the Old Testament</i> . 2 vols. Oxford: Clarendon, 1897. 2nd ed. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1988.  |
| HSCP     | <i>Harvard Studies in Classical Philology</i>  |
| HTR      | <i>Harvard Theological Review</i>  |
| HTS      | Harvard Theological Studies  |
| HUCA     | <i>Hebrew Union College Annual</i>   |
| ID       | <i>Inscriptions de Délos</i> . Edited by Félix Dürbach, Pierre Roussel, Marcel Launey, André Plasart, and Jacques Couprey. Paris: Académie des inscriptions & belles-lettres, 1926–.   |
| IG       | <i>Inscriptiones Graecae. Editio Minor</i> . Berlin: de Gruyter, 1924–   |
| IGRR     | <i>Inscriptiones graecae ad res romanas pertinentes auctoritate et impensis academiae inscriptionum et litterarum humaniorum collectae et editae</i> . Edited by René Cagnat. Reprints from the collection of the University of Toronto Libraries. Toronto: University of Toronto Libraries, 1901. |
| ILS      | <i>Inscriptiones Latinae Selectae</i> . 3 vols. Edited by Hermann Dessau. Berlin: Berolini Apud Weidmannos, 1892–1916.   |
| JAAR     | <i>Journal of the American Academy of Religion</i>   |
| JAJ      | <i>Journal of Ancient Judaism</i>  |
| JBL      | <i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>  |
| JECS     | <i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>  |
| JGRChJ   | <i>Journal of Greco-Roman Christianity and Judaism</i>   |
| JJS      | <i>Journal of Jewish Studies</i>   |

|                  |   |
|------------------|---|
| JQR              | <i>Jewish Quarterly Review</i>  |
| JR               | <i>Journal of Religion</i>  |
| JRS              | <i>Journal of Roman Studies</i>   |
| JSJ              | <i>Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Periods</i>  |
| JSJSup           | Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Periods  |
| JSNT             | <i>Journal for the Study of the New Testament</i>   |
| JSNTSup          | Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series  |
| JSOT             | <i>Journal for the Study of the Old Testament</i>   |
| JSOTSup          | Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series  |
| JSPSup           | Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Supplement Series   |
| Jud              | <i>Judaica</i>  |
| KAI              | <i>Kanaanäische und aramäische Inschriften</i> . Herbert Donner and Wolfgang Röllig. 2nd ed. Weisbaden: Harrassowitz, 1966–1969.                        |
| KlPauly          | <i>Der kleine Pauly: Lexikon der Antike</i> . Edited by Konrat Ziegler and Walther Sontheimer. 5 vols. Munich: Deutscher Taschenbuch Verlag, 1964–1975. |
| LASBF            | <i>Liber Annuus Studii Biblici Franciscani</i>  |
| LCL              | Loeb Classical Library  |
| LHBOTS           | Library of Hebrew Bible/Old Testament Studies   |
| LNTS             | Library of New Testament Studies  |
| LSJ              | Liddell, Henry George, Robert Scott, Henry Stuart Jones. <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> . 9th ed. with revised supplement. Oxford: Clarendon, 1996.     |
| LSTS             | Library of Second Temple Studies  |
| MTSR             | <i>Method and Theory in the Study of Religion</i>   |
| MTSRSup          | Supplements to Method and Theory in the Study of Religion   |
| NA <sup>27</sup> | <i>Novum Testamentum Graece</i> . Edited by Eberhard Nestle, Erwin Nestle, and Kurt Aland. 27th ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelstiftung, 1993.            |
| Neot             | <i>Neotestamentica</i>  |
| NovTSup          | Supplements to Novum Testamentum  |
| NRSV             | New Revised Standard Version  |

|         |   |
|---------|---|
| NTL     | New Testament Library   |
| NTS     | <i>New Testament Studies</i>  |
| Numen   | <i>Numen: International Review for the History of Religions</i>   |
| OED     | <i>Oxford English Dictionary: Being a Corrected Re-issue with an Introduction, Supplement, and Bibliography of A New English Dictionary on Historical Principles.</i> Edited by James A. H. and Murray R. W. Burchfield. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1933. |
| OGIS    | <i>Orientalis Graeci Inscriptiones Selectae.</i> Edited by Wilhelm Dittenberger. 2 vols. Leipzig: Hirzel, 1903–1905.  |
| PGL     | <i>Patristic Greek Lexicon.</i> Edited by Geoffrey W. H. Lampe. Oxford: Clarendon, 1961.  |
| PL      | Patrologia Latina [= <i>Patrologiae Cursus Completus: Series Latina</i> ]. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. 217 vols. Paris: Migne, 1844–1855.   |
| Proof   | <i>Prooftexts: A Journal of Jewish Literary History</i>   |
| PW      | <i>Paulys Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft.</i> New ed. by Georg Wissowa and Wilhelm Kroll. 50 vols. in 84 parts. Stuttgart: Metzler & Druckermüller, 1894–1980.   |
| RBL     | <i>Review of Biblical Literature</i>  |
| RBS     | Resources for Biblical Study  |
| RE      | <i>Realencyklopädie für protestantische Theologie und Kirche</i>  |
| RevPhil | <i>Revue de philology</i>   |
| RHR     | <i>Revue dell'histoire des religions</i>  |
| RIA     | <i>Reallexicon der Assyriologie.</i> Edited by Erich Ebeling et al. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1928–.  |
| RSV     | Revised Standard Version  |
| RVV     | Religionsgeschichtliche Versuche und Vorarbeiten  |
| SBL     | Society of Biblical Literature  |
| SBLSP   | Society of Biblical Literature Seminar Papers   |
| SBLStBL | Society of Biblical Literature Studies in Biblical Literature   |
| SBLTT   | Society of Biblical Literature Texts and Translations   |
| SBT     | Studies in Biblical Theology  |
| SCJ     | Studies in Christianity and Judaism / Études sur le christianisme et le judaïsme  |
| Semeia  | <i>Semeia</i>   |

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| SemeiaSt | Semeia Studies   |
| SFSHJ    | South Florida Studies in the History of Judaism  |
| SHR      | Studies in the History of Religions  |
| SJLA     | Studies in Judaism in Late Antiquity   |
| SR       | <i>Studies in Religion</i>   |
| SSEJC    | Studies in Scripture in Early Judaism and Christianity   |
| ST       | <i>Studia Theologica</i>   |
| StBibLit | Studies in Biblical Literature   |
| STDJ     | Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah  |
| SVTP     | Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigraphica  |
| SymS     | Symposium Series   |
| TANZ     | Texte und Arbeiten zum neutestamentliche Zeitalter   |
| TAPA     | <i>Transactions of the American Philological Association</i>   |
| TDNT     | <i>Theological Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . Edited by Gerhard Kittel and Gerhard Friedrich. Translated by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. 10 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964–1976. |
| TJT      | <i>Toronto Journal of Theology</i>   |
| TSAJ     | Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum   |
| TUGAL    | Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur  |
| UBS3     | <i>The Greek New Testament</i> . Edited by Kurt Aland et al. in cooperation with the Institute for New Testament Textual Research. 3rd ed. New York: United Bible Societies, 1975.   |
| WGRWSup  | Writings from the Greco-Roman World Supplement Series  |
| WUNT     | Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament   |
| ZNW      | <i>Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche</i>   |