

THE BIRTH OF DOUBT

BJ'S

Program in Judaic Studies
Brown University
Box 1826
Providence, RI 02912

BROWN JUDAIC STUDIES

Edited by

Mary Gluck
David C. Jacobson
Saul M. Olyan
Rachel Rojanski
Michael L. Satlow
Adam Teller

Number 366
THE BIRTH OF DOUBT

by
Moshe Halbertal

THE BIRTH OF DOUBT

CONFRONTING UNCERTAINTY IN EARLY RABBINIC LITERATURE

Moshe Halbertal

Translated from the Hebrew by
Elli Fischer

Brown Judaic Studies
Providence, Rhode Island

© 2020 Brown University. All rights reserved.

No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to the Rights and Permissions Office, Program in Judaic Studies, Brown University, Box 1826, Providence, RI 02912, USA.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Halbertal, Moshe, author. | Fischer, Elli, Rabbi, translator.

Title: The birth of doubt : confronting uncertainty in early rabbinic literature / Moshe Halbertal ; translated from the Hebrew by Elli Fischer.

Description: Providence, RI : Brown Judaic Studies, [2020] | Series: Brown Judaic Studies; 366 | Includes bibliographical references and index. | Summary: "In the rabbinic laws in the Mishnah, the Sages constructed an entire field of instructions concerning how to behave in situations of uncertainty ranging from matters of ritual purity, to lineage and marriage, to monetary law, and to the laws of forbidden foods.

Reflecting on the weight assigned to different possible errors that could be made and examining the norms of uncertainty opens a window for understanding the early rabbinic that reflected rules aimed not at avoidance but rather at dwelling in the midst of uncertainty, thus rejecting sectarian isolationism meant to minimize a community's friction with uncertainty"-- Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020011985 (print) | LCCN 2020011986 (ebook) | ISBN 9781951498757 (paperback) | ISBN 9781951498764 (hardback) | ISBN 9781951498771 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Rabbinical literature--History and criticism. | Uncertainty. | Uncertainty--Religious aspects. | Jewish law--Interpretation and construction. | Judaism--History--Talmudic period, 10-425.

Classification: LCC BM496.6 .H35 2020 (print) | LCC BM496.6 (ebook) | DDC 296.1/8--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020011985>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020011986>

Printed on acid-free paper.

*In Memory of
Aharon Shemesh*

BJ'S

BJ'S

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Translator's Note	xi
Introduction	1
1 • Prohibitions, Uncertainty, and the Price of Error	9
2 • Uncertainty and the Marketplace: Majority, Sectarianism, and Guilt	31
3 • Purity and Doubt: Between Strictness and Separation	73
4 • Lineage, Uncertainty, and the Boundaries of the Community	101
5 • Monetary Law: Possession, Evidence, and Uncertainty	141
6 • Doubt and Vagueness	171
Conclusion	205
Bibliography	213
Index of Ancient Sources	221
General Index	227

BJ'S

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to colleagues and friends who offered me their wisdom and support. The comments and insights of Shraga Baron, Hillel Ben-Sasson, Yuval Blankovsky, Avital Davidovich, Tamar Eisenberg-Morsel, Dov Elbaum, Yair Furstenberg, Hillel Mali, Rafael Kroizer, David Kurzweil, Ishay Rozen-Zvi, Joseph Weiler, and the two anonymous readers of the manuscript for Brown Judaic Studies were most helpful. The chapter on “Lineage, Uncertainty and the Boundaries of the Community” received wonderful comments from Yedida Koren, who has worked extensively on this issue. My deepest gratitude to Toby Freilich for her encouragement and advice.

Special thanks I owe to Michael Satlow for inviting me to deliver the series of lectures at Brown University that formed the basis of the book; I have greatly benefited from my conversations with him and from his comments on the manuscript. Elli Fischer produced a remarkable translation of the book from Hebrew and I thank him for the exquisite care he invested in the project. Many thanks to Maurya Horgan, the copyeditor of the book, for her patient reading and valuable comments. I am grateful to the New York University Filomen D’Agostino Foundation for the grants that supported the writing of the book.

In the early stages of thinking about the question of uncertainty in early rabbinic law I was privileged to share my thoughts with my beloved friend Aharon Shemesh may his memory be blessed. I dedicate the book to Aharon in memory of many years of conversation and in longing to a dear scholar and friend.